Page 1

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT SOUTHERN DISTRICT OF OHIO

EASTERN DIVISION

* * *

DR. RICHARD CARRIER,

Plaintiff,

vs.

Case No. 22:16-CV-00906

FREETHOUGHTBLOGS NETWORK,
PAUL Z. MYERS, PH.D., THE ORBIT,
STEPHANIE ZVAN, SKEPTICON, INC.,
LAUREN LANE, AND AMY FRANK SKIBA,

Defendants.

* * *

Deposition of DR. RICHARD CARRIER,

Plaintiff herein, called by the Defendants for

direct examination pursuant to the Rules of Civil

Procedure, taken before me, Wqueana N. George, a

Notary Public in and for the State of Ohio, at the

offices of Campbell, Perry, LLC, 7240 Muirfield

Drive, Suite 120, Dublin, Ohio, on Tuesday, January

23, 2018, at 10:50 o'clock a.m.

* * *

Case: 2:16-cv-00906-MHW-EPD Doc #: 41 Filed: 05/30/18 Page: 2 of 141 PAGEID #: 574

Carrier, Dr. Richard v. FreeThoughtBlogs Network, et al.

			Page 2
1		EXAMINATIONS CONDUCTED E	age
2	BY MR.	RANDAZZA:	. 4
3	BY MR.	PERRY:	98
4	BY MR.	RANDAZZA:1	.15
5	BY MR.	PERRY:1	.24
6	BY MR.	RANDAZZA:1	.25
7			
8			
9			
10			
11			
12			
13			
14			
15			
16			
17			
18			
19			
20			
21			
22			
23			
24			
25			

		Page 3
1 A	APPEARANCES:	
2 .	On behalf of the Plaintiff:	
3	Campbell, Perry, LLC	
4	By: Jeffrey T. Perry Attorney at Law	
5	7240 Muirfield Drive Suite 120	
6	Dublin, Ohio 43017	
7	On behalf of the Defendants:	
8	Randazza Law Group	
9	By: Marc J. Randazza and	
10	Lateigra C. Cahill Attorneys at Law	
11	4035 S. El Capitan Way Las Vegas, Nevada 89147	
12	tas vegas, Nevada 69147	
13	* * *	
14		
15		
16		
17		
18		
19		
20		
21		
22		
23		
24		
25		

	Page 4
1	DR. RICHARD CARRIER
2	of lawful age, Plaintiff herein, having been first
3	duly cautioned and sworn, as hereinafter certified,
4	was examined and said as follows:
5	DIRECT EXAMINATION
6	BY MR. RANDAZZA:
7	Q All right. Dr. Carrier, I'm going to ask
8	you a few preliminary questions that might seem a
9	little weird, but there is a reason for it.
10	A Okay.
11	Q He can hand signal to you if I'm full of
12	bologna.
13	A All right.
14	Q Have you ever had your deposition taken
15	before?
16	A No.
17	Q Have you ever seen it done on TV?
18	A Done on TV, no. The only thing close to
19	that is I saw a training video on it.
20	Q So, it's an interrogation, but there won't
21	be any extreme conditions or any torture or
22	anything. You just have to answer under penalty of
23	perjury. Do you know what that means?
24	A Yes.
25	Q What does it mean to you?

Page 5 1 Α That it's a crime to say a falsehood in 2 this proceeding. 3 0 Okay. So we don't expect that's going to happen? 4 5 Α Correct. 6 There is a line though that you can wind O 7 up at and I want to make sure that we stay away from 8 it and we all understand what it is. If you don't know, tell me that you don't know. There may be 9 10 some situations here where I ask you to give me an estimate, you know, so if I asked you to guess how 11 12 big this table is, you probably wouldn't be able to do that, but you can estimate it. If we come into a 13 situation like that, let's make sure it's clear what 14 15 you're doing. 16 All right. Α 17 O Is there any reason you can't give a good deposition today? For example, did you take LSD 18 19 last night? 20 Α No. 21 Under the influence of any drugs or 0 2.2 medication? 23 Α No. 24 The reason I'm asking you that is Q 25 obviously if we have a perjury situation later and

	Page 6
1	you say I had taken ten Vicodin that morning, you
2	know, I didn't know what I was saying. So is there
3	any reason you got a good sleep last night?
4	A Yes.
5	Q Had a healthy breakfast?
6	A Yes.
7	Q So you are doing better than me then. All
8	right. Why don't we get into it? So tell me about
9	your education. Let's start with that.
10	A I got my bachelor of arts at UC Berkeley
11	in history with a minor in classical civilizations.
12	I went on to get several graduate degrees at
13	Columbia University, a master of arts, a master of
14	philosophy and a Ph.D. in ancient history
15	specializing in ancient intellectual history.
16	Q What does that mean?
17	A It means a history of Greco-Roman
18	particularly Roman philosophy, religion, science and
19	related fields like technology. I have also
20	received training that gave me college credits in
21	the military.
22	Q What branch of the military were you in?
23	A United States Coast Guard.
24	Q How long?
25	A Two years.

	Page 7
1	Q What was your discharge status?
2	A Honorable.
3	Q Did they call it an MOS?
4	A They are called rates, but yeah, the
5	equivalent of a MOS. I was a sonar technician. I
6	left service as an E-4, officer third class.
7	Q That was before or after college?
8	A That was before college.
9	Q Where were you stationed?
10	A Well, various places. Boot camp in Cape
11	May, New Jersey. I stayed at Cape May for awhile
12	working in intelligence doing security clearances
13	and then I went to San Diego for my training.
14	That's where I received twelve college units of
15	electronics engineering amongst other military
16	training and sonar and torpedoes and related
17	technologies and then I served a year at sea on the
18	Sherman, which is a cutter that is ported out of
19	Coast Guard Island in the Bay area of California,
20	but our tours took us all around the Pacific.
21	Q Tell me about your Ph.D. program.
22	A Can you be more specific?
23	Q Sure. What was your thesis?
24	A It was Attitudes Towards the Phyikos, P H
25	Y I K O S, which means natural philosopher in the

Page 8 1 early Roman Empire 100 BC to 315 AD. That was the 2 title of my dissertation. 3 Did it get published? Yeah, I published it in the form of two 4 5 books, both in academic and general market. How well did it do? 6 0 7 It's too early to tell. For an obscure 8 academic monograph with footnotes and whatnot, my books do surprisingly well for those kind of things. 9 10 But not quite as lonely as the law review Q publications? 11 12 I wouldn't know actually. Quite lonely writing. When people say 13 they've read your law review article, I think they 14 are usually lying. So after you finished your Ph.D. 15 program, what did you do after that? 16 17 So that was 2008. The economy collapsed, so there was a freeze on hires in humanities 18 19 departments and I couldn't get a position. I had also soured on the whole idea of becoming a 20 21 professor, so I went to my fans at the time, my readers and fans and asked them to get together a 2.2 23 post-op research grant and they decided basically to fund research. I said any subject they wanted and 24 25 they said the historicity of Jesus.

	Page 9
1	Q Historicity?
2	A Yes, whether he existed or not. So I did
3	a six-year project on that resulting in multiple
4	books and journal articles.
5	Q What's your conclusion?
6	A A one in three chance.
7	Q That he existed at all?
8	A Right.
9	Q Let's talk about your relationship with
10	some of the plaintiffs (sic) here. Actually, let's
11	talk about Skepticon first. You spoke at Skepticon
12	1?
13	A Yes.
14	Q And who are the other speakers?
15	A Skepticon 1 I believe was only PZ Myers
16	and myself.
17	Q Do you remember what your talk was on?
18	A My first talk I have done so many talks
19	for Skepticon now. I don't remember the order of
20	them. Wikipedia has an article so does YouTube.
21	Q You said you soured on academia. Can you
22	tell me what that means?
23	A I didn't like the entry departmental
24	politics and I didn't like all the work they give
25	you apart from just research and teaching. If it
1	

	Page 10
1	was just research and teaching and you didn't have
2	all the back stabbing and other whatnot that goes on
3	behind the scenes, it would be the pleasant romantic
4	occupation that I thought going in, but by the time
5	I finished my Ph.D. I saw what the job was really
б	like and I would rather be a self-employed writer as
7	I am.
8	Q At Skepticon 1, is that where you met
9	Lauren Lane?
10	A I think so, but I'm not sure. Certainly
11	by then.
12	Q Okay. If not then do you recall meeting
13	her before that?
14	A No, I don't. It was so many years ago.
15	Q What is your relationship with her like?
16	A Very friendly and flirtatious. We got
17	along well.
18	Q Anything beyond flirtation?
19	A Over the years, yes.
20	Q Can you be more specific?
21	A Let's see. Can you ask more specific
22	questions?
23	Q Did you ever have sex with her?
24	A Eventually, yes. That would have been
25	2012, the Skepticon of that year.

Page 11 1 You met her in 2008 and closed the deal as 0 2 it were in 2012? 3 It was more the other way around. In 2011 she is the one who asked to close the deal. I held 4 5 off. Eventually she essentially just stripped and 6 jumped into my bed in 2012 unasked. 7 What did you do? 8 Α I participated enthusiastically at the 9 time. It wasn't me pursuing her. 10 Do you believe that's her perception as Q 11 well? 12 Α I have no idea at this point. Aside from Skepticon 1, had you met Myers 13 Q before that? 14 15 I think so, but again we are talking 16 seven -- well, almost ten years ago. Gosh. Yeah. 17 I don't remember when I first met Myers. What about Stephanie Zvan, how do you know 18 Q 19 her? 20 I knew her originally as a fellow blogger Α 21 at Freethought Blogs before she moved to the Orbit. I met her I think at a Skepticon. I'm not sure what 22 23 year. I knew her as a blogger and I may have 24 communicated with her on occasion as well. I don't 25 recall exactly. For many years in any case.

	Page 12
1	Q Do you remember where the venue was at
2	Skepticon 1?
3	A No, I don't remember the name of the
4	place.
5	Q Do you remember if it was at a university
6	or Knights of Columbus Hall?
7	A That I don't recall. It was in
8	Springfield, Missouri.
9	Q How many Skepticons have you spoken at?
10	A I think six. I'm not sure. At least six.
11	Q Do you remember the locations of any of
12	them?
13	A I don't remember the exact venues. They
14	change from year to year. Some are private venues.
15	Some are hotel venues. I don't remember off the top
16	of my head. I write them down so I can check my
17	notes.
18	Q Do you have notes on that?
19	A Not here.
20	Q But you do have notes on that?
21	A Yeah, somewhere.
22	Q What else do you put in those notes?
23	A I'm just referring to regular
24	documentation that I have of where I have stayed and
25	things like that. I don't have a specific list of
I	

		Page 13
1	where all	the Skepticons have been. I have
2	documents	throughout my career of various things.
3	If I go t	hrough them I can probably find out the
4	venues.	
5	Q	It's not like a journal that you keep?
6	А	No. And frankly I'd probably Google it.
7	Q	To find out where they were?
8	А	Yes.
9	Q	Who sponsors them?
10	А	You mean who pays for them?
11	Q	Um-hmm.
12	А	That I don't know. A variety of donors.
13	They run	fundraisers.
14	Q	They are not academically sponsored?
15	А	No, not to my knowledge.
16	Q	Do you know where each of the defendants
17	reside?	
18	А	I think I do now. Yeah.
19	Q	Do you call him PZ or Paul Myers?
20	А	PZ.
21	Q	Do you know where he lives?
22	А	Minnesota.
23	Q	You didn't know that before this?
24	А	I think I did, yes.
25	Q	Stephanie Zvan, did you know where she was

		Page 14
1	before th	is case?
2	A	No, but it turns out to be Minnesota.
3	Q	How about Lauren Lane?
4	А	I was never sure. I just assumed
5	Missouri,	various places.
6	Q	What about Amy Frank-Skiba?
7	A	That I assumed was Arizona somewhere.
8	Q	What made you assume it was Arizona?
9	A	Because that's where I met her and she was
10	going to	school there at the time.
11	Q	And the same with Lauren Lane in Missouri?
12	А	Yes. For example, there was one year, I
13	can't rem	ember which year, where I visited her and I
14	think I s	aw one of the places that she lived. She
15	moves aro	und, so I'm not sure where she lives now or
16	has lived	in the past prior to that and that was I
17	think in	St. Louis.
18	Q	You've had sexual relations with Lauren
19	Lane?	
20	A	Yes.
21	Q	What about Amy?
22	А	No.
23	Q	Myers?
24	А	No.
25	Q	So none of the other defendants in this

		Page 15
1	case just	Lauren Lane?
2	A	Correct. I have not had sex with any of
3	the other	defendants in this case.
4	Q	And by sex we are not using the Clintonian
5	definition	n?
6	A	Gotcha. Right. Yeah. No sexual
7	Q	Handies count.
8	A	Right. No.
9	Q	Handies are better.
10	A	Right.
11	Q	I don't know how else to put that. I've
12	had more	weird questions in depositions, but thank
13	you for yo	our dignity in your response. You taught a
14	number of	courses, online courses?
15	A	I do teach online courses.
16	Q	Do they ever have in-person meetings?
17	A	No.
18	Q	Let's go back to your relationship with
19	Lane. You	u said she hopped into bed with you at?
20	A	Skepticon 2012.
21	Q	And does Skepticon and I'm not trying
22	to trip y	ou up. I don't remember. Does Skepticon
23	have a co	de of conduct prohibiting that kind of
24	relations	hip?
25	A	Not prohibiting that kind of a

	Page 16
1	relationship, no.
2	Q What is your understanding about their
3	policies?
4	A Policy may have changed over the years,
5	but in 2012 the policy did allow consensual sexual
6	relations.
7	Q Between any attendees?
8	A Yes, as far as I can recall.
9	Q You don't know if it has changed yet?
10	A Correct. I don't know what their policy
11	is now.
12	Q When is the last time that you spoke at a
13	Skepticon?
14	A It would have been 2013.
15	Q Have you attended them since then?
16	A I attended the one in 2015, yes.
17	Q So when you you had relations with
18	Lane, was it just the one time?
19	A No.
20	Q How many times, if you can recall? I
21	don't mean how many times you engaged in coitus.
22	How many meetings?
23	A At least two different occasions at that
24	Skepticon and one or two times at a subsequent
25	conference in Austin, Texas.

	Page 17	
1	Q Do you know when the last time was?	
2	A The Austin conference.	
3	Q What year was that?	
4	A That was it would have been early 2013.	
5	Q Why did this relationship break off?	
6	A Well, at the time I was having this	
7	relationship with her I was cheating on my wife and	
8	started to have anxiety over that and wasn't sure	
9	about what I should be doing with my life in terms	
10	of should I just admit that I can't be monogamous or	
11	should I stop this relationship. I basically told	
12	her I'm freaking out over our relationship. I want	
13	to cool it off and think about things for awhile and	
14	I didn't want to see her anymore, and then she kept	
15	trying to opportune me to reignite the relationship	
16	to the point I had to basically cut off all	
17	communication with her.	
18	Q You are openly vocal about being a	
19	swinger, yes?	
20	A Yeah, I'm poly amorous ethically	
21	nonmonogamous. That started after. It's that	
22	incident that led me to start thinking about what I	
23	should be doing with my life, so eventually I	
24	confessed to my wife that I didn't want to do	
25	monogamy anymore and I understood if she wanted to	

Page 18 get a divorce and she decided to try an open 1 2 marriage for a little while and we did. 3 we divorced amicably because that wasn't her lifestyle either, but it was the lifestyle that I 4 5 wanted, but that happened in the midst of 2013. 6 That was Skepticon 6? 0 7 I don't remember what the number is. 8 O Did you have sex with anybody else at that 9 Skepticon? 10 Α Yes. 11 Who was that? Q 12 I had sex -- do we want to have her name 13 on the record? 14 Let's go off the record. MR. RANDAZZA: 15 (Thereupon, an off-the-record discussion 16 was had.) 17 BY MR. RANDAZZA: Off the record we had a discussion about 18 19 the name of somebody that the deponent had sex with. 20 In order to not likely violate her privacy, we've 21 agreed that we will not use her name without further 2.2 discussion. Should that become necessary, we will, but for now we will refer to her as Ms. B. We all 23 24 understand who Ms. B. is? 25 Α Yes, we do.

		Page 19
1	Q	Okay. Has Ms. B. ever revisited you?
2	A	Yeah, we continued friendly flirtatious
3	relations	ship for years after.
4	Q	No further sexual relations?
5	А	No.
6	Q	Did she ever, to the best of your
7	knowledge	e, complain about any of your conduct with
8	each othe	er?
9	А	No, not at all.
10	Q	So where did you live when all of this
11	took plac	ce?
12	А	California.
13	Q	Where in California?
14	А	That would have been various places. What
15	years exa	actly are you talking about?
16	Q	What was your last residence in
17	Californi	ia?
18	А	Stockton, California.
19	Q	And when did you leave Stockton,
20	Californi	ia?
21	А	When I moved to Ohio.
22	Q	Do you have a date?
23	А	It was in May that I moved.
24	Q	May of what year?
25	А	2016.

Page 20 1 Why did you pick Columbus? Q 2 A variety of reasons. Primary of which is Α 3 that I could no longer afford to live in California. To be an independent artist like myself you need to 4 5 keep your overhead really low, but I can work from 6 I was trying to pick a place I can go anywhere. 7 where the living expenses were low enough that I 8 could survive and do well with my business and I had 9 more girlfriends in or near Ohio and Ohio was well 10 positioned for -- there's a lot more major cities I can get to from Ohio by driving with a much bigger 11 12 demand for my work. Don't you make more money in California? 13 Q 14 А Not now. I'm saying like the cost of living and --15 0 16 Yeah, no --Α 17 Q For example, a lawyer out here --The cost of living out pays income in 18 Α 19 California. Whereas I make better income on the 20 east coast or on the east side of the country with 21 much lower living expenses. The difference is It's much more survivable there. 2.2 better. 23 So maybe your line of work is different Q 24 from mine. I know when I have a case, for example, 25 in California and we can seek attorney's fees, the

Page 21 1 judges don't even look at us funny when we ask for 2 7- or \$800 an hour. If I tried to do that in a 3 place like Wyoming, they would probably look at me and say around here we charge \$150 an hour. 4 5 kind of the differential knot existent in your line 6 of work? 7 Α Not really, no. It doesn't work that way. 8 0 So you make the same no matter where you 9 work? 10 Α Pretty much, yes. 11 Now it's coming into focus for me. 0 12 income is fixed? 13 Α Fixed is the wrong word. 14 What is the right word? Q It's highly variable, but it does not 15 Α 16 respond to geography. Other than in terms of 17 demand, which is actually higher in more religious states than in lower religious states like 18 19 California. 20 Why is that? O 21 I have been speculating on this so I 2.2 really don't know for sure, but based on 23 conversations that I've had with people all over North America, organizations and groups in states 24 25 that are beleaguered by religious oppression are

Page 22

- 1 much more excited and interested in hearing the kind
- 2 of work that I do and they are more excited about
- 3 meeting me and they are more likely to hire me. In
- 4 California there's a lot more -- it's more secular
- 5 there, so people are more apathetic and less
- 6 interested, so turn out is not as good in California
- 7 events as it is in other states.
- 8 O Not much use for you in Boston?
- 9 A I haven't tried Boston yet. But Boston is
- 10 surrounded by problematic areas in that regard, so
- 11 people will come to Boston possibly.
- 12 Q What do you mean a problematic area?
- 13 A Well, in terms of there's a lot of rural
- 14 religious communities in that state and that state
- is small enough for people to get to Boston. I
- 16 haven't tried, so I don't know.
- 17 O How is Mississippi, is that like happy
- 18 hunting ground for you?
- 19 A It would be. I haven't tried it yet. I
- 20 have done other southern states.
- 21 O Florida?
- 22 A Florida, good turnouts there. Arkansas,
- 23 Alabama.
- 24 Q I know this is probably a difficult --
- 25 A Oh, I meant Tennessee not Arkansas.

Page 23 I understand what I'm about to ask is 1 0 2 probably going to be difficult for you to understand 3 and explain with perfect accuracy without your notes and your planner before you, but this is where we 4 5 get into the estimate and not guess --Before we do that, can we take a brief 6 Α 7 break so I can get some water? 8 MR. PERRY: Sure. Absolutely. 9 (Thereupon, an off-the-record discussion 10 was had.) BY MR. RANDAZZA: 11 12 So you allege in your complaint and I will read from the complaint, through and the result of 13 his accomplishments in a career spanning more than a 14 decade Dr. Carrier has become well-known to the 15 16 public throughout the United States as a professional writer, lecturer and teacher. 17 created a unique public personality and image. 18 19 you stand by that statement? 20 Α Yes. 21 So I guess I would ask, how famous are Q 22 you? 23 Well, let's see. I'm trying to think of Α 24 ways to measure it. 25 MR. PERRY: Don't quess.

Page 24 1 THE WITNESS: Can you be more specific. 2 How would I measure it? 3 BY MR. RANDAZZA: Let's put it this way, let's role play. 4 5 You are hitting on a girl at a conference and she 6 hasn't heard of you. Now, Ron Burgundy would say 7 I'm kind of a big deal and I have many leather bound 8 books. Pretend you find me attractive and you are 9 trying to swoon me with how famous you are. 10 That would be a terrible way to do it. Α I don't understand the question. Can you be more 11 12 specific to what your question is? 13 MR. RANDAZZA: I will throw the card on the table. Do we agree that he is a public figure? 14 15 MR. PERRY: I think so. We've alleged 16 that in our complaint. In other words, we will 17 stipulate. BY MR. RANDAZZA: 18 19 So then I don't need to walk you through O 20 that. 21 Α For sure. 2.2 So before you took your break you were 0 23 talking about different geographic areas where you 24 find your services are most in demand. We talked about some areas that you haven't tried speaking at 25

Page 25 yet. What I want to do is create a mental map here 1 2 of where we would stick some thumb tacks of where 3 you have spoken. What is your most popular state? I couldn't say now. The best benchmark 4 5 that I have before your clients' defamation altered 6 the nature of my business, which would be 2015 -- I 7 have good records for that. In that year I made 8 more money in Ohio than in any other state except 9 California because I was living in California, so it 10 was easier to develop business in California. made -- well, yeah, that's -- all the other states 11 12 substantially less state by state. How about Florida? 13 0 I don't remember the precise amounts. We 14 Α 15 have supplied you with documents that have those 16 numbers though. 17 O You provided us with some federal income 18 tax? 19 And spreadsheets concerning my speaking Α and direct sales business, which was the most 20 21 impacted by your clients' claims. Who made those spreadsheets? 2.2 Q 23 I did. Α 24 And what about for like the three years Q prior to this, so do you --25

Page 26

- 1 A Prior to which year?
- 2 Q The three years prior to my clients'
- 3 alleged defamation, were you often commuting from
- 4 California to Ohio?
- 5 A No, I started developing my Ohio business
- 6 in 2015. I had spoken in Ohio in previous years.
- 7 That was so many years ago. Without consulting
- 8 notes I don't know where and when. Before 2014 I
- 9 was only conducting my business part time. I was
- 10 actually a full-time homemaker. Basically I was
- 11 taking care of my wife in terms of the domestic
- 12 business and she was bringing home the income. It
- 13 was like Ozzie and Harriet, gender reverse. I would
- 14 cook dinner for her when she got home. I made sure
- 15 she had no duties at the house. I did all the
- 16 cleaning and laundry and all of that stuff. Taking
- 17 care of the pets and taking them to the vet and all
- 18 of those things. Therefore, I was only part-timing
- 19 my business at that point. I only full-timed my
- 20 business in the beginning of 2015 once I separated.
- 21 Q I want to make sure that you didn't make a
- 22 mistake when you said you moved to Ohio in June of
- 23 **2016.**
- 24 A May of 2016.
- Q We have prior statements from you saying

	Page 27
1	June. I realize those two things
2	A Well
3	Q I don't think you are committing perjury.
4	A I took residence on May 31, but I had
5	already signed a lease a month or two before that.
6	Actually, I think in our subsequent fulfilling of
7	discovery requests there is more on that, but
8	records and things like that would be delivered to
9	you eventually. It definitely was in May and that's
10	actually quite public knowledge. It's all over the
11	Internet.
12	Q Did you file Ohio State income taxes in
13	2016?
14	A Did I file in 2016? I did no, I did
15	not because my income in Ohio actually, my income
16	federally was zero owing to legal expenses fighting
17	this case.
18	Q In 2016?
19	A Correct. You are talking about the tax
20	year 2016?
21	Q Yes.
22	A Which would have been paid in 2017, right?
23	Q Yes. What was your tax domicile for the
24	year 2016?
25	A When I filed taxes in 2017 I did split

Page 28

- 1 California and Ohio. I didn't have to file in
- 2 either state because my income was zero.
- 3 Q So you are deducting your legal expenses
- 4 as a business expense?
- 5 A Correct. That is shown in the documents
- 6 that we have sent you.
- 7 Q Now, don't tell me what this person said.
- 8 I will ask you a question that could implicate
- 9 attorney/client privilege. Sometimes a person will
- 10 utter out the answer and then the attorney says oh,
- 11 wait. Objection. I like to say hey, I'm about to
- 12 ask something that might get near it and if it does
- 13 I want him ready to object. Did you consult anyone
- 14 prior to claiming your legal expenses as a business
- 15 **expense?**
- MR. PERRY: I will object to form.
- 17 BY MR. RANDAZZA:
- 18 Q Did you consult an attorney?
- 19 THE WITNESS: May I answer the question?
- 20 MR. RANDAZZA: I don't want to know what
- 21 the attorney said.
- MR. PERRY: I will object to form.
- THE WITNESS: It's a statement of fact.
- 24 Do you want me to answer?
- MR. PERRY: You can answer, yes.

Pag	ge 29
1 THE WITNESS: No.	
2 BY MR. RANDAZZA:	
3 Q Did you consult with a CPA?	
4 A No.	
5 Q So on what basis did you form the opinion	on
6 that those were deductible business expenses?	
7 A I have always been my own accountant and	d I
8 read the IRS documents carefully and defamation of	f
9 my business falls under the allowable deductions i	for
10 that year.	
11 Q Did you have any income that you did not	t
12 report in 2016, 2017?	
13 A No.	
14 Q Do you receive alimony from your ex?	
15 A No.	
16 Q Did you ever?	
17 A No.	
18 Q Did you seek it?	
19 A No.	
20 Q If we can go back, there was an answer	
21 before, you said it was widely known that you move	ed
22 to Ohio. That's of course at issue in this	
23 deposition. You remember I asked you describe how	₩
24 you are famous. That was a difficult thing to nat	il
25 down really. Would it be equally difficult to nat	il

Page 30

- 1 down why it's common knowledge that you moved to
- 2 Ohio?
- 3 A Can you ask the question more
- 4 specifically?
- 5 Q You said widely known. Can you define
- 6 widely known?
- 7 A Yes. So I blogged about it multiple times
- 8 on my blog. My blog has a readership in the
- 9 community -- in the vicinity of a hundred thousand
- 10 and I also announced it on Facebook, which has
- 11 somewhere between 5- and 10,000 readers also
- 12 associated with the community and Twitter. I'm not
- 13 sure what my Twitter audience is, but it is growing.
- 14 It's also in the thousands. Within the secular
- 15 community that hits a lot of people.
- 16 Q So your blog, do you have like an
- analytics of readership on that blog?
- 18 A Yes. Of course back at the time I would
- 19 have been using Freethought Blogs analytics. They
- 20 deleted all of those records. I don't have access
- 21 to them anymore. I do know from what I had been
- 22 reading at the time looking at the analytics that my
- 23 readership was in the vicinity of a hundred
- 24 thousand.
- 25 O Did it track IP addresses?

	Page 31		
1	A It may have. I never looked at that.		
2	Q So your independent blog now, when did you		
3	start writing on that instead?		
4	A When Freethought Blogs blocked access to		
5	my blog and made it clear that there was not going		
6	to be a fair investigation for me to get it back. I		
7	was forced essentially to relaunch my blog		
8	elsewhere. That was difficult rebuilding the blog		
9	business because all of the IP addresses, all of the		
10	Google search results and everything were pointing		
11	to Freethought Blogs. It took a whole year to		
12	rebuild the ability for people to find my new blog		
13	location. Analytics on that is all problematic		
14	because of that. Now I'm back up to about the same		
15	readership.		
16	Q You do your own analytics now?		
17	A Yes.		
18	Q Can you tell me about how they work? Is		
19	it like a Google analytics? Is it a dashboard?		
20	What platform is it on?		
21	A It's through WordPress Jetpack. It		
22	provides those kind of data.		
23	Q I'm slightly familiar with it. Probably		
24	not enough to ask you the most intelligent questions		
25	here. Do you know if it tracks IP addresses?		

	Page 32
1	A If it tracks every IP address that hits my
2	website; is that what you're asking?
3	Q Yes.
4	A I don't know. I haven't checked that.
5	Q You couldn't tell me if you knew the IP
6	address that I was logged onto right now if I read
7	your blog, you wouldn't be able to tell it had been
8	me?
9	A Not sitting here right now.
10	Q Have you ever tried to track a single
11	person reading your blog?
12	A A single person?
13	Q Or a single IP address?
14	A The only time that I recall doing that is
15	when I have had attempted to hack my site and I
16	would research where the IP address is and then
17	block it if it looks suspicious. That is the only
18	occasion that I can think of. Definitely not on
19	every occasion have I done things like that.
20	Q So you can drill down to the individual IP
21	address?
22	A Those are for attempts to hack the site.
23	That's a security function. That's a different
24	location. I haven't checked to see if I can dig in
25	to look at everyone that comes to my site. I might

Page 33 have that availability. I don't know. 2 I want to know if this would be possible, 3 you meet a hot girl from Anchorage, she goes home, you tell her what a big deal you are, you go back 4 5 and look at the analytics, can you tell if someone 6 from Anchorage looked at your site? Α I don't know. 8 0 You never used it that way? 9 Α No. 10 Do you like my idea? Q 11 Α No. 12 Q Why not? That's kind of invasive. I don't approach 13 Α 14 people by spying on them. That's not a device I would use. 15 16 You would consider it spying on them to 17 see if a certain city --18 Α Yeah, looking at the site to -- other than 19 just asking them hey, did you look at my website? 20 0 Ethically, it's something that even if you 21 could do it, you wouldn't do it because it violates your ethics? 22 23 I would need a valid reason. Α There may be 24 ethical reasons to do it, but it's not something that would occur to me to do. It seems a little 25

Page 34 1 weird. 2 Someone says I read your site every day Q 3 and you know they are from Billings, Montana, you suspect they might be lying to you, you wouldn't 4 5 look into that? I wouldn't even do that. Possibly you can 6 7 construct a scenario where I might think it would be 8 valid to do that, but that's something that I have 9 never done or would think of doing. 10 Have you looked at it to see which states Q might be where your largest readership is coming 11 12 from? No, I haven't looked into that data. 13 I'm not sure it does the math on that. It doesn't 14 15 matter since my current blog is the one that I 16 created after the defamatory statements. I don't 17 have access to the data for the blog that I was using when I was announcing my move. 18 19 As far as today, you don't know where your 0 20 strongest readership comes from? 21 Α Not sitting here, no. You haven't researched that since leaving 22 Q 23 Freethought Blogs network? 24 No. Α 25 It's safe to say even you don't know where Q

	Page 35
1 your largest readership comes fr	com?
2 A On my blog presently,	no.
3 Q Does Facebook have the	e ability to analyze
4 that data?	
5 A Not that I'm aware of.	
6 Q Does Twitter?	
7 A Not that I'm aware of.	
8 Q Neither sitting here t	coday nor at any
9 point would you be able to tell	me where at least
10 your strongest publication marke	et is?
11 A I don't know.	
12 Q In June of 2016 Amy Sk	riba posted an
13 article or blog post, whatever y	ou want to call it,
14 posted statements that you consi	dered to be
15 defamatory?	
16 A Yes.	
17 Q Accusing you of sexual	ly harassing her and
18 touching her?	
19 A Yes.	
20 Q What is your response	to that factually?
21 A I did neither of those	e things.
22 Q You've never touched h	ner?
23 A No. I was actually qu	uite paranoid about
24 touching people without their pe	ermission back then
25 and even more so now.	

		Page 36
1	Q	So it's your position that she has made
2	all of th	ais out of thin air?
3	A	Yes, she is definitely lying.
4	Q	It wasn't like maybe it was consensual,
5	maybe it	wasn't, this is it never happened, black
6	and white	?
7	A	Correct.
8	Q	Did you have any arguments with her before
9	that?	
10	A	No.
11	Q	Have you ever had a dispute with her?
12	A	No.
13	Q	Can you imagine why she would make that
14	up?	
15	A	I'm completely bewildered.
16	Q	Have you ever rejected her advances?
17	A	No.
18	Q	She's never made advances towards you?
19	A	No, not in clear terms anyway.
20	Q	I don't know if that's funny or just
21	confusing	Г-
22	A	You need to ask a different kind of
23	question.	
24	Q	I guess, she's never openly flirted with
25	you that	you could tell?

Page 37 1 Α She has not indicated that she is No. 2 interested in dating me, if that's what you mean. 3 I'm not a hundred percent clear on some of your sexual activities. I don't disapprove. 4 5 I to disapprove? But I don't understand. Is dating 6 the only verb we should be using here? 7 I don't know how to answer that question. 8 0 Dating and fucking are two different 9 things, right? 10 I would definitely put fucking under a Α subcategory of dating. 11 12 Q So when we say dating we are also talking 13 Yes, in the Venn diagram dating and then 14 Α fucking is entirely inside the dating margin. 15 16 It's great deposing you. That's 0 17 exactly -- yes, it makes it very easy when we are clear. If only you can give lessons to women I want 18 19 to date. Here is the Venn diagram. I might hire you after this to come hang out at my date for like 20 21 the first ten minutes. It wouldn't be a conflict after this is over, right? Tell me about some of 22 23 your other income sources. You have speaking 24 engagements? 25 Α Um-hmm -- yes.

	Page 38
1	Q Camp Quest, what is Camp Quest?
2	A Camp Quest, the national organization of
3	Camp Quest is a support organization that licenses
4	and supports basically summer camps for nonreligious
5	people. It's basically like Christian summer camp
6	except for seculars. They have camps in multiple
7	states. The national organization basically
8	supports all of them.
9	Q Do they have any in Florida?
10	A They might now. I'm not sure.
11	Q Which of their camps have you visited?
12	A The only camp I visited was Camp Quest
13	West in California and that was 2005, plus or minus
14	a year or two.
15	Q The only Camp Quest you've been to is this
16	one in 2005?
17	A Yeah, somewhere around that date or year.
18	Q What city in California is that in?
19	A North of Sacramento is where the camp site
20	is. I don't remember the exact location.
21	Q That's precise enough for me. Do you know
22	the locations of any other Camp Quests in
23	California?
24	A Yes. They just opened a new one on
25	Catalina Island. I don't remember when they opened

	Page 39
1	it, but there's on in California in the mountains.
2	Q There is only three in California?
3	A As far as I know.
4	Q Do you know of any others?
5	A They opened several in the south. I know
6	there is one in Ohio. Normally this is a question
7	where I would go to the website and look at the
8	list. I know there are many other states.
9	Q You only know of one in Ohio?
10	A Yes.
11	Q Do you know where it is?
12	A No.
13	Q I don't mean precisely. With precision of
14	the one you told me in California, is it outside of
15	Steubenville?
16	A I never looked at the actual location of
17	it.
18	Q You said that when Freethought Blogs
19	suspended you, you were under the impression that
20	you wouldn't get a fair investigation?
21	A Yes.
22	Q Why did they suspend you?
23	A Because of the statements made by the
24	other defendants.
25	Q And what specifically do you understand to

Page 40 1 be the statements made that got you suspended? 2 Α The ones we've included in our complaint. 3 O Can you give me the general genre of them? 4 Yes, Amy Frank's accusations that we Α 5 discussed earlier in this deposition. Stephanie 6 Zvan also wrote some things around the same time 7 they decided to suspend me at Freethought Blogs and 8 Skepticon. Those happened on the same day. 9 Skepticon's publication of accusations of sexual 10 harassment were also false. 11 How much did Freethought Blogs pay you? 0 12 I chose not to be paid by Freethought Blogs, so I could have ad free content. 13 looking to develop patron support instead. 14 15 Q You said you were also suspended from 16 Skepticon? 17 Α Yes, they issued a ban not allowing me to 18 attend or speak. You couldn't even attend? 19 Q 20 Α That was my understanding, yes. 21 Q How much did Skepticon pay you? 2.2 I worked Skepticon for free, but I earned А 23 upwards of between 500 and \$1,000 per event on book 24 sales and the promotional value of speaking at 25 Skepticon is huge.

		Page 41
1	Q	But Skepticon never paid you?
2	A	No, Skepticon takes its speakers without
3	pay.	
4	Q	So there is a statement that Ms. Zvan made
5	where she	e is talking about this after party at a pub
6	where she	e was quoting you, do you recall this?
7	А	Yes.
8	Q	She said at an after party at a pub after
9	a sponsor	red event that had an event policy against
10	making se	exual advances you misread someone's
11	fascinati	on with the subject matter as flirtation?
12	А	There are some errors in that statement.
13	Q	But those are your words?
14	А	Those are not my exact words.
15		MR. RANDAZZA: Can you pull that post?
16		THE WITNESS: Do you have my post?
17	BY MR. RA	ANDAZZA:
18	Q	Yes, I'll have her pull it up.
19	А	It would be more helpful to read my post.
20	Q	At some point you guys would want lunch.
21	What I wi	ll do is put a pin in that idea.
22	A	Okay.
23	Q	Is it true you didn't fight the Secular
24	Student A	Alliance Speakers Bureau?
25	A	Yes.

- 1 Q And why didn't you object to that?
- 2 A Because that was their fraternization
- 3 policy that only applied to speakers bureau and not
- 4 to other speakers. So speakers could speak at SSA
- 5 events who were not on the bureau and it just made
- 6 more sense not to be on the bureau.
- 7 Q And you also didn't object to being banned
- 8 from Freethought Blogs?
- 9 A No, I did object to being banned from
- 10 Freethought Blogs and I tried to get control back,
- 11 but when Myers made it clear that I wasn't going to
- 12 get a fair process, I clearly had no way forward on
- 13 that.
- 14 Q How did he make that clear?
- 15 A In the phone conversation we had he
- 16 refused to tell me -- he insisted that I defend
- 17 myself so they could do their investigation before
- 18 releasing control of my blog. On the phone he told
- 19 me he would not tell me who was accusing me, what
- 20 they were accusing me of, where or when and I told
- 21 him I can't defend myself if you are not going to
- 22 give me that information and he said he didn't care.
- 23 He said you should just admit it and apologize. I
- 24 said but the claims are false. I told him if you
- 25 are not going to let me defend myself and if you're

Page 43 going to do this, I will have to sue you to get you 2 to stop and he said go ahead. 3 Did they have, as far as you know, an established policy for this? 4 5 Α No. 6 You know they didn't have one or you O 7 don't? 8 Α I was unaware of any established policy 9 and I'm pretty sure they still don't have one. 10 So how would you describe sitting here Q today that interaction? 11 12 Α Which one? 13 The one we just talked about where it was somebody seemed to have misunderstood. You seem to 14 have misunderstood someone's --15 16 You are talking about --17 O -- interest. It would be easier if we started that with 18 Α 19 you reading my statements from the blog. 20 0 What do you recall about the incident 21 sitting here today? We can refresh your recollection later. I'm looking for what you 2.2 remember now, if you have any detail on it. 23 24 There were a number of inaccurate Α 25 statements in the statement that you read earlier,

	Page 44
1	so I don't want you to assume that I'm acknowledging
2	that those things are true.
3	Q We will not acknowledge that.
4	A Can you be more specific about what you
5	want to know about that incident?
6	Q First of all, do you remember the name of
7	the person?
8	A Only her first name.
9	Q What was her first name?
10	A Can we do that off the record too?
11	Q Is it an unusual name?
12	A Enough.
13	MR. RANDAZZA: Let's go off the record.
14	(Thereupon, an off-the-record discussion
15	was had.)
16	BY MR. RANDAZZA:
17	Q So during off the record discussion we
18	have identified a woman with whom there was some
19	interaction. Given the fact that her name is less
20	than very common, we will refer to her as Ms. F. We
21	have an agreement off the record of who this person
22	is?
23	A Yes.
24	Q So, when you spoke with Ms. F, can you
25	describe when you first spoke to her?

Page 45 1 When I first spoke to her was during the Α 2 event before I spoke and O and A after and chatting 3 afterwards, that's when I first spoke to her. 4 So tell me a bit more about your 0 5 interactions with her? What do you remember? 6 Α She was really fascinating, had a lot of 7 really interesting ideas in aesthetic theory and 8 literary analysis of the Star Wars trilogy and I was 9 really fascinated in that subject and various other 10 things she was talking about at the time and really 11 liked conversing with her. When we all sort of 12 informally retired to a pub afterwards we continued talking for an hour or two hours I think with 13 various people present. In the midst of that at one 14 15 point I said I would like to ask you out and her 16 visible reaction to that suggested to me that she 17 didn't like that, so I apologized immediately and didn't renew that during that conversation. 18 19 how that interaction went that I was writing about 20 that you are talking about. 21 So there was no physical contact? Q 2.2 А No. 23 You mentioned earlier that you publicized Q your move on Facebook, Twitter and your blog? 24 25 Α Yes.

Page 46 1 Do you have any evidence that any of the Q 2 defendants read about it on Facebook? 3 Whether they read about it on Facebook, I 4 do not know. 5 0 So you have no evidence to prove that? 6 Α Not that they themselves read it on 7 Facebook except for Amy Frank, she actually almost 8 certainly did. 9 What do you mean by almost certainly did? 0 10 Well, we know now from discovery documents Α 11 that she was regularly searching my name, Richard 12 Carrier, on Facebook. She was looking specifically 13 for speaking engagements and particularly speaking engagements involving universities. Any search she 14 did of that nature would have resulted in her seeing 15 my announcements of moving. 16 Why do you know it would have resulted in 17 0 18 that? 19 She even noticed really obscure Α 20 announcements that had nothing to do with speaking 21 events or university events. For example, the Camp Quest announcement that even I didn't see on my wall 2.2 23 she saw on my wall, so if she has seen even events 24 like that, there's no possible way that she could 25 not have seen my announcements about moving across

Page	47
------	----

- 1 the country. They were even more prominent than
- 2 that one and it included one speaking engagement at
- 3 a university.
- 4 Q Would that be an estimate or a guess?
- 5 A I don't understand the question.
- 6 Q Well, you don't know for a fact that she
- 7 saw it, you find it probable?
- 8 A Well, we can get into the theory of
- 9 knowledge on this. But given the facts available to
- 10 me, the probability of her having read that is as
- 11 near to a hundred percent as makes all odds.
- 12 Q Back to my question. You have no evidence
- 13 that she read it?
- 14 A Other than the evidence that I just told
- 15 you about.
- 16 O And that evidence is that she saw other
- things on your Facebook wall?
- 18 A She reported she was regularly searching
- 19 my wall and searching using the name Richard Carrier
- 20 specifically searching for events where I was
- 21 speaking at a university and demonstrated that she
- 22 was also noticing even the most obscure things
- announced on my wall.
- 24 Q In fact, she had read something on your
- 25 wall that you had not read?

	Page 48
1	A Correct.
2	Q So if you had not read an announcement on
3	your wall, is it not a bit of a logical fallacy to
4	say that somebody else must have read everything on
5	your wall?
6	A Not at all because I wasn't doing what she
7	was doing.
8	Q You weren't reading your own Facebook
9	wall?
10	A No, I wasn't searching someone's name on
11	their website specifically looking through every
12	single announcement to see where I might be speaking
13	and in the result of that demonstrating that they
14	are noticing every single thing on my wall including
15	that announcement.
16	Q Would the search turn up different results
17	if you searched for Richard Carrier in quotes or
18	without them?
19	A I don't know.
20	Q Have you searched Facebook that way one
21	way and then the other?
22	A No, not that I can recall.
23	Q How about on Google, have you ever done
24	that?
25	A Yeah.

Page 49 1 Self Googling? Q 2 I have used Google with quotes and without Α 3 quotes to see if there is a difference in effect on other things, yeah. 4 5 0 But not in searching your own name? Not that I recall. 6 Α 7 Do you know the existence of any other Richard Carrier's in the United States? 8 9 In fact, that may be something we 10 will include in the discovery materials. We already included some for you that we sent to you. 11 12 started making statements in your motions, I started researching that and I discovered there's a Richard 13 Carrier Trucking in Maine. I was able to do a 14 15 comparison of how often people were searching for 16 that guy versus me and generated a lot of material 17 related to that, which will be submitted to you. 18 How were you able to tell that they were 19 looking for him and not you? Because you can look for how often the 20 Α 21 search term Richard Carrier Trucking is being 2.2 searched versus just Richard Carrier and then 23 compare that with when you do search Richard Carrier 24 how many pages in the results you have to go before 25 you find Richard Carrier Trucking, because they are

	Page 50
1	ranked by how many people are looking at those
2	sites.
3	Q What do you mean they are ranked by?
4	A When you do a search on Google and Google
5	pages can explain this. This is public knowledge.
6	When you do a search on Google and you see the hits,
7	it will give you ten links per page if you keep
8	going page after page after page. We went ten pages
9	in and recorded everything on one search recently.
10	It ranks those by how many people are clicking
11	through those links. If you do a Richard Carrier
12	search the top link is the one that most people are
13	looking at. It assumes that's the one you want to
14	see and then it starts ranking them below that. The
15	further deeper into the number of pages means the
16	fewer people are clicking through the site.
17	Q Is it the same if you use a Mac or a PC?
18	A I don't think there's a difference.
19	Q Did you do it from a Mac or a PC?
20	A From a Mac.
21	Q Whose Mac was it?
22	A Mine.
23	Q Do you remember which browser you used?
24	A I'm assuming it would have been Firefox,
25	but I can't recall if I used different browsers on
1	

- 1 different occasions.
- 2 Q Do you ever worry about people doing what
- 3 I suggested before as tracking your IP address if
- 4 you go to their website?
- 5 A I don't understand the question.
- 6 Q Remember before you said it would be
- 7 invasive of your reader's privacy to look at their
- 8 IP addresses?
- 9 A Unless you had an ethical reason to do
- 10 that, yeah.
- 11 Q By ethical you mean personal ethical
- 12 reasons? What code of ethics are we talking about?
- 13 A You need a valid reason. To just go
- 14 spying on someone I consider unethical, but if you
- 15 have a particular ethical reason that's driving you
- 16 that you actually need this information to pursue
- 17 something for a valid reason --
- 18 Q Do you worry that other people might do
- 19 that to you?
- 20 A How?
- 21 Q Well, just the way I described. Do you
- 22 worry about, you know, just as you are saying it
- 23 would be unethical of you to do that to a reader,
- 24 are you concerned that other people may not share
- 25 your high ethics?

	Page 52
1	A I know for a fact they don't, but I don't
2	worry about it because of the way I've organized my
3	life. I can't think of any way that would harm me,
4	but my life doesn't work the same way as everyone
5	else's.
6	Q You don't take precautions to keep that
7	from happening?
8	A I don't even know how to keep that from
9	happening.
10	Q Do you know what a VPN is?
11	A Yes, I do know about VPNs. Good point.
12	Q Do you use them?
13	A I've only used VPN one time when I visited
14	England. There was a reason I needed to do that
15	there. I don't use VPNs in any other occasions.
16	Q What e-mail platform do you use?
17	A Apple's innate iMail.
18	Q So your e-mail address is what is after
19	the at?
20	A I have a number of e-mail address. Which
21	one are you asking about?
22	Q All of them.
23	A All of my e-mail addresses all reflect
24	back to my iCloud account. Every single one of the
25	e-mail addresses direct e-mails to the same account,
i	

	Page 53
1	which is Richard.Carrier@iCloud.com.
2	Q They are e-mail forwards, not separate
3	accounts?
4	A I'm not sure I understand the question.
5	Q Give me one of your other e-mail
6	addresses.
7	A For example, I don't remember the exact
8	address, but I have an iMail address with my
9	Columbus alumni association.
10	Q Columbus or Columbia?
11	A Columbia. Thank you. Columbia University
12	Alumni Association. That e-mail does collect
13	somewhere on the web independently like you can read
14	it as if it was an e-mail, but I never do. It's
15	connected to my iCloud account.
16	Q Do you have Gmail account?
17	A Yes, I do. Same thing.
18	Q Your Gmails get forwarded to Apple?
19	A Yes.
20	Q Do you use them for separate reasons?
21	A Sometimes I would rather just have my
22	RCarrier@infedels.org account, but that was retired
23	when I left secular web. It's now just a reflect or
24	it doesn't collect anywhere. I have to have an
25	iCloud.com account to use my Apple mail account.
i	

	Page 54
1	The others are things that were given to me and are
2	out there, so I just have to keep monitoring them,
3	so I just have them all reflect to my main account.
4	Q What calendaring system do you use?
5	A Two different calendaring systems. Google
6	calendar and the innate Apple iOS calendar.
7	Q They reflect to one another?
8	A No, they aren't linked.
9	Q Do you have two-factor authentication
10	enabled in your Google account?
11	A Yes.
12	Q Is it through your cell phone, they send
13	you a text message?
14	A I have two-factor on so many things. I
15	don't remember which methods are available from
16	which ones. I don't recall right now.
17	Q Is it that you don't log in and out of it
18	much?
19	A I almost never use Google.
20	Q Do you remember the last time that you
21	logged in?
22	A No, I don't.
23	Q Did you log out or did you just close the
24	browser?
25	A I honestly don't remember.

Page 55
1 Q You don't have your computer with you
2 today, do you?
3 A No.
4 Q So if we were to log into it, you might
5 still be logged into your Google account?
6 A It's theoretically possible, yes.
7 Q You don't recall logging out?
8 A I don't recall logging out.
9 Q How often do you delete all cookies on
10 your computer?
11 A I usually don't do that for any reason
12 unless it crashes, which has happened multiple times
13 since my computer is pretty old. Sometimes in order
14 to access my credit card accounts I have to get rid
15 of the cookies in order to be able to log back in.
16 That has happened probably four or five times in the
17 last two years.
18 Q When was the last time?
19 A The last time that happened I honestly
20 don't remember. It was more than four months ago, I
21 think.
Q Do you remember when before that?
23 A No, I don't. It's multiple times.
Q As a matter of practice you don't clear
25 your cookies?

Page 56 1 Α No. 2 I consider it to be a good practice to 3 have somebody assigned to clear my entire browser 4 cache if I die. Do you have anyone like that? 5 Α I do not. 6 So is it because you never thought of the 0 7 idea? 8 Α No. Generally -- first of all, I'm a historian, so I dislike destruction of records. 9 10 Secondly, I'm very much an open person and I believe very highly in the value of truth, so there's really 11 12 nothing that I have to hide. The only things I'm 13 concerned to hide are things that are someone else's secrets or private information that I don't want to 14 15 disclose to harm them. Everything about myself I'm 16 not too concerned about other than obviously the 17 things I want to prevent the public from getting or even hacking like my Social Security numbers and 18 stuff like that. 19 You've never cleared your browser history? 20 0 21 Yeah, I've cleared browser history for 2.2 functional reasons, but not out of a desire to get 23 rid of the history. 24 When is the last time that you cleared it? Q 25 I honestly don't remember. It's been a Α

		Page 57
1	long time	since I've done that.
2	Q	More than a year?
3	A	Maybe less than a year, but close.
4	Something	in that vicinity.
5	Q	You can't recall when you did it?
6	A	I can't recall.
7	Q	You said Ms. Zvan's article in your
8	complaint	it says the article garnered 45 comments.
9	А	Um-hmm.
10	Q	Did you make a list of people who
11	commented	?
12	А	Did I write down their names?
13	Q	Yes.
14	А	No, I did not.
15	Q	Did you record them in any other way?
16	A	I think we took a screen capture.
17	Q	Do you know where those people live?
18	A	I didn't check.
19	Q	You don't know if any of them live in
20	Ohio?	
21	А	No. There was one we confirmed one
22	person, Ma	arie Mogilevsky liked I think a Facebook
23	post, I ca	an't remember exactly, related to this. We
24	did record	d that. That's because I knew she lived in
25	Ohio.	
1		

	Page 58
1	Q How do you know she lived in Ohio?
2	A She was a friend of mine.
3	Q Other than her the other 44 could all be
4	in Guam for all you know?
5	A I didn't research that. Correct.
6	Q So when Skepticon posted that they were
7	banning you, do you remember where you were when you
8	read that post?
9	A Yes. I was in Columbus, Ohio at the time.
10	Q Were you living here?
11	A Yes, I was living in Columbus and also
12	hanging out with one of my girlfriends in Columbus.
13	Yeah, that's what I remember about that.
14	Q Did you show her the post?
15	A Yes, we talked about it.
16	Q What did she think about it?
17	A She was as outraged as I was.
18	Q How long had you known her?
19	A We are talking about Amanda Metskas. That
20	is already on the public record.
21	Q I didn't need her, but okay.
22	A I have known her many years, but we had
23	been dating probably two years at that point.
24	Q Did you show anyone else?
25	A I may have. I don't recall.

	Page 59
1	Q Did she believe it?
2	A No. When you asked if I had shown anyone
3	else, did you mean on the day?
4	Q No, at any time. I understand that your
5	answer was on the day, so we are not playing gotcha
6	with you.
7	A You mean at any time?
8	Q Yes.
9	A All of my friends and girlfriends have
10	seen it by now.
11	Q You showed it to them?
12	A Yes.
13	Q How did you pick who you would show it to?
14	A People who would ask and people I'm in
15	close relationships that I think deserve to be aware
16	of it so we can discuss it.
17	Q Did any of these people see it and believe
18	it instead of you?
19	A No, none of the people that I was dating.
20	Certain people who were my friends did and aren't my
21	friends anymore.
22	Q How do you know they believed it?
23	A They told me.
24	Q Can you tell me some of the friendships
25	you've lost over it?
i e	

	Page 60
1	A Again, we want to put these names in the
2	record?
3	Q I don't think this reveals anything
4	embarrassing about them.
5	A Neil Wehneman.
6	Q Anybody else that you had a falling out
7	with?
8	A Marie Mogilevsky.
9	Q Anyone else?
10	A Let's see, friends in Ohio. Those are the
11	two that I can recall have made clear that they have
12	believed it. There may have been others that
13	stopped talking to me that I don't know about
14	because they haven't communicated that to me. There
15	are other people in the community professionally not
16	friends per se, but are colleagues.
17	Q How are you doing on hunger at all? Do
18	you need a break?
19	MR. PERRY: It's up to you.
20	MR. RANDAZZA: I don't want you to feel
21	that I'm pushing you through it.
22	THE WITNESS: Understood. I'm fine.
23	BY MR. RANDAZZA:
24	Q Your blog is now at RichadCarrier.info?
25	A Yes.
1	

	Page 61
1	Q And do you recall writing a statement or
2	an article called How To Do Wrong Right?
3	A Yup.
4	Q And the version that is on
5	RichardCarrier.info right now, has that ever been
6	edited since its publication?
7	A It may have been. I don't recall exactly
8	if I did or not.
9	Q So would you have a record of that?
10	A Yes. It's checkable if you go to the
11	Internet archive and see the previous versions of
12	it. That's true for any web page, actually.
13	Q You are sure that your website is
14	archived?
15	A Yes, I check it multiple times.
16	Q When you checked it, did you enter the URL
17	directly on the Internet archive page or did you
18	search for it on the Internet archive page? Did you
19	use the search function?
20	A I always use the URL.
21	Q And does the archive leave a cookie on
22	your computer?
23	A I do not know the answer to that.
24	Q You don't know if there is any meta data
25	left by the Internet archive on your computer?
l	

1 A Correct, I do not know. 2 Q How many other Richard Carriers live in 3 Ohio? 4 A I don't know. 5 Q Have you ever tried to find out? 6 A I wouldn't know how to find out exactly. 7 Oh, actually, there's one way I tried when you 8 brought it up in motions. I think I checked the 9 voter registry in Ohio and it came up with I think 10 two other Richard Carriers. I can't remember the 11 exact count. 12 Q Did you ever look at Ancestry.com? 13 A No. 14 Q You have two registered voters named 15 Richard Carrier in Ohio? 16 A Yeah, that's what I recall. 17 Q You don't know how many others may have
Ohio? A I don't know. Q Have you ever tried to find out? A I wouldn't know how to find out exactly. Oh, actually, there's one way I tried when you brought it up in motions. I think I checked the voter registry in Ohio and it came up with I think two other Richard Carriers. I can't remember the exact count. Q Did you ever look at Ancestry.com? A No. You have two registered voters named Richard Carrier in Ohio? A Yeah, that's what I recall.
A I don't know. Q Have you ever tried to find out? A I wouldn't know how to find out exactly. Oh, actually, there's one way I tried when you brought it up in motions. I think I checked the voter registry in Ohio and it came up with I think two other Richard Carriers. I can't remember the exact count. Q Did you ever look at Ancestry.com? A No. You have two registered voters named Richard Carrier in Ohio? A Yeah, that's what I recall.
A I wouldn't know how to find out exactly. Oh, actually, there's one way I tried when you brought it up in motions. I think I checked the voter registry in Ohio and it came up with I think two other Richard Carriers. I can't remember the exact count. Q Did you ever look at Ancestry.com? A No. You have two registered voters named Richard Carrier in Ohio? A Yeah, that's what I recall.
A I wouldn't know how to find out exactly. Oh, actually, there's one way I tried when you brought it up in motions. I think I checked the voter registry in Ohio and it came up with I think two other Richard Carriers. I can't remember the exact count. Q Did you ever look at Ancestry.com? A No. You have two registered voters named Richard Carrier in Ohio? A Yeah, that's what I recall.
7 Oh, actually, there's one way I tried when you 8 brought it up in motions. I think I checked the 9 voter registry in Ohio and it came up with I think 10 two other Richard Carriers. I can't remember the 11 exact count. 12 Q Did you ever look at Ancestry.com? 13 A No. 14 Q You have two registered voters named 15 Richard Carrier in Ohio? 16 A Yeah, that's what I recall.
brought it up in motions. I think I checked the voter registry in Ohio and it came up with I think two other Richard Carriers. I can't remember the exact count. Q Did you ever look at Ancestry.com? A No. You have two registered voters named Richard Carrier in Ohio? A Yeah, that's what I recall.
yoter registry in Ohio and it came up with I think two other Richard Carriers. I can't remember the exact count. Q Did you ever look at Ancestry.com? A No. You have two registered voters named Richard Carrier in Ohio? A Yeah, that's what I recall.
two other Richard Carriers. I can't remember the exact count. Q Did you ever look at Ancestry.com? A No. You have two registered voters named Richard Carrier in Ohio? A Yeah, that's what I recall.
11 exact count. 12 Q Did you ever look at Ancestry.com? 13 A No. 14 Q You have two registered voters named 15 Richard Carrier in Ohio? 16 A Yeah, that's what I recall.
12 Q Did you ever look at Ancestry.com? 13 A No. 14 Q You have two registered voters named 15 Richard Carrier in Ohio? 16 A Yeah, that's what I recall.
13 A No. 14 Q You have two registered voters named 15 Richard Carrier in Ohio? 16 A Yeah, that's what I recall.
Q You have two registered voters named Richard Carrier in Ohio? A Yeah, that's what I recall.
15 Richard Carrier in Ohio? 16 A Yeah, that's what I recall.
16 A Yeah, that's what I recall.
,
17 Q You don't know how many others may have
18 lived here, may have died recently?
19 A No.
Q You don't recall if you searched for your
21 name with quotes or without quotes when you Googled
22 your own name?
23 A I don't recall.
Q Do you have any formal training in Google
25 analytics?

		Page 63
1	A	Formal training, I do not. Can you hold
2	on for ju	ust a moment?
3	Q	Yeah.
4	А	Go ahead.
5	Q	Any formal training in Google trends?
6	А	No formal training.
7	Q	How did you learn to use it?
8	А	I read the tutorials and instructions on
9	the web p	page itself.
10	Q	Any training in SCO?
11	А	No formal training.
12	Q	Have you done anything on your blogs to
13	optimize	search engine results?
14	A	I'm not sure what that means.
15	Q	How often do you log into your own blog
16	now?	
17	А	What do you mean by log in? Are you
18	talking a	about the back end or the front end?
19	Q	Yes, the back end.
20	A	Probably once every other day would be the
21	average.	
22	Q	I'm going to refer to something in the
23	file. Th	nis would be document number ten. Since
24	we've pre	eviously filed it, I don't know if you need
25	to read t	the whole thing. At this point you would've

- objected if it was a falsified copy, but for the
- 2 sake of formality it was Exhibit 1 to our ECF No.
- 3 10. Look at that and tell me if you think there is
- 4 any reason that that would not be a true and
- 5 accurate copy of what was published on the date
- 6 stated above. The publication date is June 5th,
- 7 2015. This copy was printed on 12/1/2016. Do you
- 8 have any reason to believe that you edited it
- 9 between the date it was published and the date we
- 10 printed it?
- 11 A I don't recall.
- 12 Q Is it your habit to adjust things once
- 13 you've already published them?
- 14 A I will on occasion if I think there's an
- 15 error in it.
- 16 Q Do you note that?
- 17 A I usually do in some fashion.
- 18 Q So you are transparent about edits?
- 19 A Usually. If it's a typo or something, no,
- 20 but usually I will put a comment or I will indicate
- 21 it using brackets or something that indicates a
- 22 difference from the text.
- 23 Q So can we stipulate that Exhibit 1 is a
- 24 true and accurate copy of this post and you have no
- 25 indication that it's been altered?

Page 65 1 Yeah. Α 2 I think it's just easier than entering it 3 as an exhibit to the deposition since it's already in the record. Why add more paper to the record? 4 5 MR. PERRY: That's fine. 6 THE WITNESS: Yeah. 7 BY MR. RANDAZZA: 8 Have there been any exhibits that we have 9 provided that you believe to have been altered or 10 inauthentic? Can we stipulate to all of them? 11 MR. PERRY: I think we would have talked about it. 12 13 THE WITNESS: Yeah. 14 MR. RANDAZZA: Let's go off the record. 15 (Thereupon, an off-the-record discussion 16 was had.) 17 MR. RANDAZZA: While we were off the record the parties came to an agreement that we all 18 19 stipulate that any exhibits that have been filed to 20 date are authenticated whether submitted by the 21 plaintiff or the defendant and now we will go back off the record so I can also enjoy the restroom. 22 23 (Thereupon, an off-the-record discussion 24 was had.) 25 BY MR. RANDAZZA:

	Page 66
1	Q Have you ever been to the headquarters of
2	the Secular Student Alliance?
3	A Yes.
4	Q Where is it?
5	A At that time it was no, I don't
6	remember the address. It was in Columbus.
7	Q You went there in Columbus?
8	A Yes.
9	Q That is an Ohio only organization?
10	A I don't understand the question.
11	Q The Secular Student Alliance, where do
12	they have chapters?
13	A All over the country.
14	Q So it's not an Ohio focused organization?
15	A The national office is in Ohio based in
16	Columbus and then it has affiliates, which are at
17	universities and college campuses all over the
18	United States. Those affiliates get support and
19	licensing and other things through the national
20	organization in Ohio.
21	Q So when I say Secular Student Alliance, do
22	you understand me to be saying the Ohio headquarters
23	or all affiliates together with that?
24	A I would assume both of those things.
25	Q If I ask have you ever been to a Secular

	Page 67
1	Student Alliance meeting, we are talking about
2	nationwide?
3	A Yes, if you ask me that question I would
4	ask you to be more specific as to what you mean.
5	Q More specific than if you had been to a
6	Secular Student Alliance meeting?
7	A Yes, because that can mean a lot of
8	different things.
9	Q An event that any Secular Student Alliance
10	affiliate or national has sponsored?
11	A Now I have lost track of the question.
12	Q Have you ever been to one?
13	A Yes.
14	Q Have you ever been to an SSA can I say
15	SSA?
16	A Yes, absolutely. Many, many. More than I
17	can remember.
18	Q When was the last one?
19	A It is now 2018. The last one would have
20	been late 2017, and I think there was only one in
21	2017, if I recall correctly. I'm not entirely sure,
22	but I think so, in Logan, Utah.
23	Q So you went to one in Logan, Utah. Did
24	you speak at it?
25	A Yes.

	Page 68
1	Q Did they pay you?
2	A Yes.
3	Q Am I remembering incorrectly, you were
4	banned for a period of time from SSA meetings?
5	A No.
6	Q You've never been banned from SSA?
7	A No, not officially.
8	Q What about before the Logan, Utah?
9	A What do you mean?
10	Q Were there any other events before Logan,
11	Utah or is there the only one that you've spoken at?
12	A There were many before, but that was the
13	only one in 2017.
14	Q What about 2016?
15	A None in the second half of 2016. Your
16	clients' statements have made that difficult.
17	Q Is that a fact, an opinion, a guess?
18	A It's a prediction based on data trends.
19	Q Is it because you tried to attend and they
20	told you you can't come?
21	A So before 2016 I used to get gigs at SSA
22	affiliate events and SSA national quite frequently.
23	I can't remember exact counts but many times in any
24	given year.
25	Q Would you apply to go or would they

1 approac	h you?
-----------	--------

- 2 A A lot of times they would approach me.
- 3 That was fairly reliably the case. I would count on
- 4 business coming to me by people just asking me to
- 5 come. I would also go and ask groups can I speak
- 6 and it's usually enthusiastically a yes. That had
- 7 been my experience all through 2015. Starting mid
- 8 2016 and beyond it's completely the opposite.
- 9 Q So in the second half of 2016, do you
- 10 recall any specific circumstances that you asked a
- 11 local affiliate of SSA or the national headquarters
- of SSA if you could come speak and they said no?
- 13 A No.
- 14 **Q 2017?**
- 15 A No, not exactly like that.
- 16 Q Nobody ever refused your request?
- 17 A No one asked me and I can't recall if I
- 18 asked other people. Usually what happens and has
- 19 been happening in the last few years is I send a
- 20 request and I get no reply. They don't say anything
- 21 or they say something that's vague. People don't
- 22 usually tell me why. When I compare past behavior
- 23 with current behavior the difference is quite
- 24 obvious.
- 25 Q But to answer my question, specifically no

- 1 one has told you no?
- 2 A Not SSA affiliates. Well, they have not
- 3 said no, because of the defamation. A lot of them
- 4 just ghost me. They just don't answer at all or
- 5 they say no, but they don't say why.
- 6 Q Do you use something to tell if the
- 7 e-mails have been opened?
- 8 A I don't understand the question.
- 9 Q Do you know what read notify is? Do you
- 10 use return receipts on e-mails?
- 11 A No, I don't use return receipts on
- 12 e-mails. No, I don't check that that I can recall
- anyway.
- 14 Q That's how you would ask or would you
- 15 **call?**
- 16 A That's a good question. Sometimes I do
- 17 send requests by Facebook and that I can confirm
- 18 whether someone has seen the message or not.
- 19 Oftentimes it's e-mail and oftentimes it's meet up
- 20 communications. Sometimes it's web form
- 21 communications that an affiliate operates. It's a
- 22 variety of communications depending on how they run
- 23 their contact.
- Q Who would receive the request?
- 25 A It would vary. Each affiliate club has

	Page 71
1	its own officers and its own structure, so each one
2	would have its own policy as to who is getting the
3	communications. All I can do is compare past
4	behavior with current behavior of what usually
5	happens.
6	Q Are they employees?
7	A No. You mean like paid employees?
8	Q Sure.
9	A Not in the SSA.
10	Q Independent contractors?
11	A I have no idea what their legal relation
12	is to the SSA other than the fact that they organize
13	their own clubs and enter some sort of an agreement
14	with the national organization. I don't know the
15	details of that agreement.
16	Q You've never talked to anyone at one of
17	the chapters and said who gets the requests?
18	A Before 2016 I used to communicate with
19	these people, so I would find out because they would
20	answer.
21	Q Do you know which SSA chapter is the
22	largest?
23	A No, I do not know.
24	Q Do you know any that are particularly
25	large?
i	

Page 72 1 No, I don't have those numbers. Α 2 Is there any one that is more well known Q 3 or successful? Do any of them stand out? Α I've never looked into that. Not to me, 4 5 anyway. 6 Have you sent requests to national for Q 7 speaking engagements? 8 Α Are you talking about ever or when? 9 0 How about since January of 2016. 10 Α January of 2016 I was planning to go to 11 the Columbus SSA national conference. T had 12 arranged a bunch of meetings with people who were coming in from other affiliates. I was going to 13 engage in networking and try to get working gigs 14 15 through other affiliate organizations through 16 working a conference. There is a lot of terms in there 17 Hold on. that I would like clarification. So you were hoping 18 19 to go to a meeting? 20 I was arranging private meetings myself. Α 21 0 With whom? 2.2 With many people all over the United А 23 States who come to the conference representing various SSA affiliates. My plan was to attend that 24 25 conference and hob knob essentially and network

Page 73 1 basically try to develop other working 2 opportunities, but I was defamed almost immediately 3 before that and my meetings didn't happen and it was made clear to me that I wouldn't be welcome at the 4 SSA conference. 5 6 Who told you that? O 7 That was communicated to me by -- well, 8 Amanda Metskas that she was relaying that to me from persons at the SSA. 9 10 Who? Q 11 It would have been --А 12 Q Do you know? Were you privy to the 13 conversation? 14 Was I privy to the conversation? Α 15 Yes. Q 16 No, I only know what Amanda Metskas Α 17 communicated to me. 18 Q It's your testimony that Amanda told you 19 that you weren't welcome at the meeting? 20 Α Right. 21 But you had arranged with other people to 2.2 meet you with at that meeting? 23 I had done so prior, yes. Α 24 They were all coming to Columbus for the Q 25 conference?

	Page 74
1	A Right.
2	Q What is Amanda's position at SSA?
3	A She is not affiliated with the SSA. She
4	runs Camp Quest. She's married to who at the time
5	was president of SSA.
6	Q So she has no affiliation with the SSA?
7	A No, she just knows people who work there.
8	Q A person unaffiliated with SSA
9	A Yes. At the time they shared an office,
10	so they actually worked in the same office.
11	Q But she told you that you are not welcome,
12	but the organization never said you are not welcome?
13	A She said the atmosphere was that everybody
14	thought it would cause a great deal of problems and
15	not go well if I attended the conference.
16	Q That was her opinion?
17	A Yes.
18	Q But to be very clear here, to be very
19	precise, nobody who worked for the SSA, nobody who
20	is an officer or director, et cetera in the SSA told
21	you that you weren't welcome?
22	A August Brunsman might have done so. I
23	don't recall specifically. He was the president of
24	the SSA at the time. He was recusing himself from
25	the investigation that was ongoing at the time. I

- 1 had a lot of conversations with him, but I don't
- 2 remember exactly how much information I got from him
- 3 about this.
- 4 Q So you have no recollection of him telling
- 5 you that you weren't welcome?
- 6 A No, but this is the sort of thing we can
- 7 just ask them.
- 8 Q Are they chapters or affiliates? What is
- 9 the correct term?
- 10 A I've always used the term affiliates.
- 11 Q Did anybody from any of the affiliates
- tell you you weren't welcome at their meetings?
- 13 A I can't recall. I know community groups
- 14 has said so.
- 15 Q What is community groups?
- 16 A Non SSA related organizations, secular
- 17 groups. I don't think I essentially got a fuck you
- 18 from SSA.
- 19 Q The people you said you were going to meet
- 20 with, did you meet with any of them?
- 21 A No, none of them are talking to me
- 22 anymore.
- 23 O What about back then?
- A No, they stopped all communications with
- 25 me as soon as the defamation was published.

	Page 76
1	Q They previously arranged to meet with you?
2	A Yes.
3	Q How many people were there?
4	A I don't recall. A handful.
5	Q More than ten, more than twenty?
6	A More than four, less than ten. I don't
7	recall the exact number. At the conference I was
8	planning on meeting more people without a planned
9	meeting. I was planning to hob knob. I was
10	intending to cultivate meetings at the conference.
11	Q Had you bought a ticket?
12	A I don't even know if they sell those for
13	people attending. I was going to. That was the
14	plan. As soon as I realized this wasn't going to
15	transpire I did not.
16	Q That what wasn't going to transpire?
17	A As soon as the defamation was published
18	and all the shit hit the fan.
19	Q Which specific defamation?
20	A That would have been Amy Frank's
21	publication is the first start of it. All of it
22	really hit on June 20, I think, when the other
23	publications went out, Skepticon, Lauren Lane. When
24	they all published. That really had the impact.
25	Not that the Amy Frank thing helped either.

	Page 77
1	Q You have no specific evidence of that, you
2	are just extrapolating that these people talked to
3	you before and they don't talk to you now?
4	A Right.
5	Q No one has said it was because of this
6	publication?
7	A No, but I'm sure if we ask them we can get
8	that information from them.
9	Q You don't think any of your publications
10	could have had anything to do with it?
11	A No, none of my publications contain
12	defamatory material like this.
13	Q Did you provide any of the names and
14	maybe your attorney can answer this, did you provide
15	any of the names of the people you were planning on
16	meeting with in your disclosures?
17	A No.
18	MR. RANDAZZA: You want to supplement
19	those in a short period of time? I don't think we
20	know any of those names.
21	BY MR. RANDAZZA:
22	Q Have you ever been formally accused of
23	sexual assault?
24	A No.
25	Q By formally I don't mean just by the
i	

	Page 78
1	police, but has any person ever?
2	A No, not before Amy Frank.
3	Q Harassment?
4	A No.
5	Q I know you don't like this term after
6	reading your blog, but being creepy toward anyone?
7	A What's the question?
8	Q Well, there's sexual assault. I think we
9	know what that is.
10	A Um-hmm.
11	Q There is rape, maybe sexual assault is
12	also rape. Descending we have sexual harassment and
13	then maybe we just have creepy, which is sort of the
14	male equivalent you've written it's the male
15	equivalent of slut shaming.
16	A Formulate your question. I don't know
17	what you're asking.
18	Q Has anyone ever described your behavior at
19	any of these conferences as creepy?
20	A I don't recall if or when.
21	Q Do you recall ever sexualizing a
22	conversation that was about something else at any of
23	these conferences?
24	A I'm not sure I understand the question.
25	Q Well, I'm reading from your words. This

- 1 is creepy. One you sexualized a conversation that
- 2 was about something else. This alone justifies the
- 3 label creepy. What did you mean when you wrote
- 4 that?
- 5 A I mean someone who -- a conversation about
- 6 something else and then suddenly just start
- 7 interjecting discussions of sex that the other party
- 8 hasn't raised.
- 9 Q Did you ever sexualize a conversation with
- 10 a proposition at one of these events?
- 11 A You mean like just asking if someone wants
- 12 to go out with you?
- 13 Q Again, I'm reading from your list of
- 14 what's creepy. If you don't know what you meant
- 15 when you wrote it --
- 16 A I need the context of what you're asking.
- 17 I'm not quite clear on what the question is.
- 18 O You sexualized a conversation with a
- 19 proposition, you didn't just bring up sex out of the
- 20 blue. You did it in the form of an unwelcomed
- 21 sexual advance.
- 22 A Wait. Read that again.
- 23 Q On June 5th, 2015 on page 22 of 47 of
- 24 the aforementioned Exhibit 1 to our Document 10, you
- 25 write a list. It looks like you are doing a list of

1

2

3

4

5

6

7

8

9

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

creepy.

Dr. Richard Carrier

Page 80 things that you would say are creepy. One thing you say is two, worst, this is worse than sexualizing a conversation the thing we just talked about. sexualize the conversation with a, italics, proposition. You didn't just bring up sex out of the blue, you did it in the form of an unwelcomed sexual advance. Α Are you sure you are reading my words? 0 I am. Can I see that? Α You may. Q Α Where is it? Read from there and then the next page. Q This is someone else's words. It's Hyatt Α (phonetic) girl June 5, 2015. These are not my This is someone else accusing me of being words.

- 18 Q So you disagree with her list there?
- 19 A It would be one of those things I would
- 20 have to engage in a conversation about what exactly
- 21 she means. I would not choose any of that wording.
- 22 Q How often do you talk about sex with the
- 23 students that attend the SSA meetings?
- 24 A Say again.
- 25 Q Do you ever talk about sex with the

	Page 81
1	students that attend SSA meetings?
2	A Yes, if they bring it up.
3	Q Only if they bring it up?
4	A Generally, yeah. There has to be a reason
5	for that to come into conversation.
6	Q Can you recall how many times that has
7	happened?
8	A No, I can't recall how many times that's
9	happened.
10	Q Did you say before or did I read before
11	that you asked Amy Skiba if she would date you?
12	A No.
13	Q I know there was a time we were talking
14	about what verb, right?
15	A Yeah. Right.
16	Q You propositioned sex to her?
17	A I did not.
18	Q She propositioned you?
19	A She did not.
20	Q So there was nothing that happened there?
21	A You just
22	Q I'm trying to keep these women
23	A You left out a huge category of things.
24	Q So what happened there?
25	A She spoke to me and said she wanted to

- 1 open her relationship. She was having difficulty
- 2 because her husband wasn't agreeing to it and was
- 3 also monitoring her communications. He was spying
- 4 on her e-mail and things like that.
- 5 Q She wanted to open her relationship with
- 6 him or you?
- 7 A She didn't specify. She was I quess
- 8 asking me for advice about what to do. I told her
- 9 it's a difficult situation. I don't know how she
- 10 could deal with a partner who is spying on her. In
- 11 the course of that conversation I mentioned that if
- 12 her situation ever does change, you have an open
- 13 relationship and you solve this problem and you are
- 14 interested in me, you are welcome to ask me out in
- 15 the future sometime.
- 16 Q This was on the phone?
- 17 A No, in person.
- 18 O Where?
- 19 A In the living room of the house of Forest
- 20 Schrike (phonetic) I think is where I was staying.
- 21 This was the morning after I spoke for her
- 22 organization and it was a private conversation she
- 23 initiated with me. It's discussed in my affidavit
- 24 with the complaint.
- 25 Q Did you or did you not announce at one of

83

	Page 8	
1	these SSA events that you had a vasectomy?	
2	A So the night before that we were in a	
3	group conversation and this you can confirm from	
4	Spencer Hawkins who was there. His affidavit is in	
5	the complaint. Everybody there that was talking was	
6	bringing up the subject of sexual stamina and the	
7	role of alcohol on it and I brought up the effect of	
8	my vasectomy on this. This conversation was	
9	entirely with the men who were discussing this. It	
10	was not directed at Amy Frank. It was not	
11	whispered. It was openly discussed and then we	
12	moved on to another subject after that.	
13	Q Amy Frank wasn't there?	
14	A Amy Frank was there and seemed to be	
15	enjoying the conversation and didn't issue any	
16	objections or leave.	
17	Q You said you were only speaking to the	
18	men?	
19	A They were the ones who were having this	
20	conversation with me of sexual stamina and what	
21	affects it.	
22	Q How many women were there?	
23	A Just her.	
24	Q But she didn't participate in the	
25	conversation?	

	Page 84
1	A I don't recall.
2	MR. RANDAZZA: Off the record.
3	(Thereupon, an off-the-record discussion
4	was had.)
5	(Brief recess.)
6	BY MR. RANDAZZA:
7	Q Sir, you wrote a blog post where you said
8	that you were never employed by SSA or Camp Quest;
9	is that correct?
10	A Yes, by which I meant I was never a
11	salaried employee.
12	Q Okay. And you were dating the executive
13	director of Camp Quest?
14	A Correct.
15	Q Amanda?
16	A Yes.
17	Q What is Amanda's last name?
18	A Metskas.
19	Q And Amanda is married to?
20	A August Brunsman.
21	Q And August is the executive director of
22	the Secular Student Alliance?
23	A I should say he was at the time.
24	Q There was an incident where somebody
25	complained to the Secular Student Alliance about you

	Page 85
1	and the Secular Student Alliance contacted you?
2	A Yes.
3	Q Who did you think it was that complained
4	about you?
5	A The pub case that we talked about earlier.
6	That was the only instance in which I had asked a
7	woman out at any event that had anything to do with
8	a college group.
9	Q It turned out it wasn't her?
10	A Yeah.
11	Q So it turned out it was Amy?
12	A Yes, which surprised me immensely.
13	Q It might have been a little bit
14	embarrassing to say somebody complained about you
15	and you say who did you think it was?
16	A Ms. F.
17	Q But that's not the incident we were
18	talking about?
19	A Yes, and that was like falling down a
20	rabbit hole. It was really perplexing to me.
21	Q You then went to another SSA event?
22	A Give me specifics.
23	Q Did you go to another SSA event after that
24	phone call?
25	A Yes.

	Page 86
1	Q Were you aware that Amy Skiba was there?
2	A You are talking about a specific event?
3	Q How many SSA events did you go to after
4	this?
5	A I can't recall, but it may have been more
6	than one.
7	Q Do you recall going to one Amy was at?
8	A Yes, although I didn't know she was at
9	that until they told me.
10	Q They told you. Who is they?
11	A I don't remember the exact name of the
12	exact person who told me, but a staff member of the
13	SSA contacted me and this is actually the first time
14	that I found out that it was Amy who had complained
15	about me as they said, you know, Amy Skiba is here
16	and she is uncomfortable that you are here as well.
17	Could you please just avoid her. I had to ask like
18	who is Amy Skiba? I don't know who you are talking
19	about and they said oh, yes, that's the person who
20	complained about you. I'm like okay, I'm not going
21	to get into this conversation because I have no idea
22	what on earth she was complaining about, but I have
23	no problem. If anybody wants me to stay away from
24	them, that's easily done, so I said yeah, that's no
25	problem. I complied with their wishes.

	Page 87
1	Q And this is before the allegedly
2	defamatory publications?
3	A Correct. This was 2015.
4	Q When you were taken off the speakers
5	bureau for SSA, was that before the alleged
6	defamatory publication?
7	A Yes.
8	Q Did anyone say why you were taken off the
9	speakers bureau?
10	A To me or to the public?
11	Q To either one.
12	A They told me that they wanted to have a
13	zero tolerance policy on the fraternization policy,
14	so they said we have decided they didn't decide
15	this originally, but they eventually decided you
16	probably shouldn't be on the bureau and I said yeah,
17	I probably shouldn't be on the bureau.
18	Q So you agreed that due to fraternization
19	issues it's better to be
20	A Yes, I would rather not have a restriction
21	on fraternization.
22	Q Do you still have anything in storage in
23	California?
24	A No.
25	Q What did you get in the divorce?
I	

		Page 88
1	А	Full ownership of my business and \$20,000.
2	Q	Is that a California divorce or an Ohio
3	divorce?	
4	А	California.
5	Q	When was the final decree entered?
6	А	Sometime in 2015.
7	Q	Now, this may indicate attorney/client
8	privilege	. Did you consult with any California
9	lawyers p	rior to filing this case?
10		MR. PERRY: Object to form. You can
11	answer.	
12		THE WITNESS: No.
13	BY MR. RA	NDAZZA:
14	Q	In some of your writings online, is it
15	true that	you wrote a post discussing gang bangs?
16	А	Yes.
17	Q	That God likes gang bangs?
18	А	Yes.
19	Q	Do you recall when you published that?
20	А	I don't remember. It was a few years ago.
21	Q	Discussed semen play online?
22	А	I have done, yes.
23	Q	Violence in porn?
24	А	Yup.
25	Q	You submitted attached to your complaint

	Page 89
1	Exhibit 27 an e-mail to a woman named can you
2	tell me how to pronounce her name?
3	A Heina Dadabhoy.
4	Q Tell me about that e-mail.
5	A It was a whole e-mail exchange. I don't
6	know which one you mean.
7	Q This is one where there was some
8	discussion of you wanting to have sex with her.
9	A Yeah.
10	Q Essentially calling it are you down to
11	fuck?
12	A That's not what I called it.
13	Q Who called it that?
14	A Her.
15	Q Who is Heina?
16	A Heina Dadabhoy is a blogger and activist
17	in the secular community.
18	Q Has she complained to anybody about your
19	conduct?
20	A I'm sure she has in the same respect that
21	she does in the e-mails that we included in the
22	complaint.
23	Q Back to the gang bang article. The title
24	was God Thoroughly Enjoys Getting Gang Banged?
25	A Correct.
1	

		Page 90
1	Q	Did anyone express concerns about this
2	article?	
3	А	I don't recall.
4	Q	No one ever complained?
5	А	They may have. If they did, it was pretty
6	minor and	I didn't think much of it.
7	Q	There is an article that you published
8	regarding	accusations by Amy Frank; do you recall
9	that?	
10	А	There may have been more than one.
11	Q	Was there a woman named Shelley that
12	complaine	d about you?
13	А	No.
14	Q	Do you know anyone named Shelley?
15	А	I do.
16	Q	Tell me about your relationship with her.
17	А	The person that I know whose name is
18	Shelley?	
19	Q	Yes.
20	А	Can we put the last name off the record?
21	Q	Sure.
22		(Thereupon, an off-the-record discussion
23	was had.)	
24	BY MR. RAI	NDAZZA:
25	Q	Did you ever have an incident involving

		Page 91
1	her?	
2	A	No.
3	Q	What is your relationship with her?
4	А	We are good friends.
5	Q	Is that all?
6	А	Oh, yes.
7	Q	No sexual contact with her?
8	А	No.
9	Q	In your article on June 15th regarding the
10	accusatio	ons made by Amy Frank
11	A	Which article?
12	Q	Here is the beginning of it.
13	A	Got it.
14	Q	This one was attached to document 23-1.
15	This is t	he one where you say I'm not an employee of
16	either Ca	mp Quest or SSA or any of their affiliates
17	and you s	ay nor am I on their board of directors or
18	their spe	aker bureaus?
19	A	Correct.
20	Q	I rarely even volunteer for them?
21	A	Correct.
22	Q	Do you have anything else specifically
23	except fo	r, you know, I think we talked before the
24	break abo	out the fact that you are essentially
25	extrapola	ting that one of the defendants should have

Page 92 known that you moved to Ohio because she looked at 2 other things on your Facebook wall that would 3 have -- you think she saw one thing, she would have seen everything? 4 5 Α Yes. 6 Do you have any other specific information 0 7 about any of the other defendants as to why they 8 might know? 9 Α Yes. 10 Why don't we go through them one by one? Q 11 So Zvan and the Orbit have both admitted А 12 on discovery that they knew before I filed suit. Myers, I told him personally on a phone call that I 13 had moved to Ohio and he being the CEO of 14 15 Freethought Blogs --16 When was that conversation with Myers? 17 Α The 21st of June. I have that in a Very soon to that, though. Myers being the 18 19 CEO of Freethought Blogs, I consider that informing Freethought Blogs. Normally if you tell the CEO of 20 21 a company something, that's telling the company. 2.2 Who is left? Skepticon? 23 Q 24 Skepticon and Lane through counsel sent a Α 25 letter to my lawyer in Ohio. I would expect a

	Page 93
1	competent lawyer to advise them on the potential
2	jurisdictional issues.
3	Q Your lawyer
4	A Received a letter from Lane and Skepticon
5	through counsel.
6	Q That letter came to you before well,
7	after the publications, correct?
8	A Yes, it was a response to our desist
9	letters before we sued.
10	Q Any information that Skepticon was aware
11	of your location prior to receiving the demand
12	letter from your lawyer?
13	A Rephrase that question.
14	Q Your lawyer sent a letter to Skepticon?
15	A Correct.
16	Q At that moment it is at least your belief
17	that everybody is on notice that you are an Ohioan
18	and thus if they defame you, they'll come to court
19	in Ohio?
20	A It's certainly a risk.
21	Q However that letter from your lawyer was
22	after the date of publication?
23	A Correct.
24	Q As far as prepublication, do you have
25	anything as far as Skepticon knowing that you were

Page 94 in Ohio? 1 2 For Lane and Skepticon, no. Α 3 O What about Amy Frank-Skiba? Amy Frank was searching for events and 4 5 stuff on my Facebook page before. In fact, it was 6 that searching that resulted in her posting her 7 defamation when she saw the Camp Quest notice. 8 fact that she saw the Camp Quest notice means that 9 she had to have seen other things that she was 10 looking for. Specifically the thing she said she was looking for, which means she would have seen the 11 12 notice. 13 We asked you in discovery and you mentioned that you are going to supplement for 14 things like credit card statements? 15 16 Yeah. Α 17 O Would you generally pay cash or credit? I almost always use ATM or credit. 18 Α 19 Your bank statements and credit card 0 20 statements would reflect a reasonable picture of 21 your whereabouts on any given day? Probably, yeah, to within the extent I am 2.2 Α 23 using them on particular dates and you can figure out where the charges are. 24 Do you intend to produce those to us? 25 Q

Page 95 1 Α It's super arduous. It's going to cost a 2 lot of time. Do you really need them? 3 0 We do. MR. RANDAZZA: Off the record. 4 5 (Thereupon, an off-the-record discussion 6 was had.) 7 MR. RANDAZZA: We had an off the record 8 discussion about one discovery dispute that we appear to have resolved, that is to produce the 9 10 bank records and credit card records for the past 36 months, at least 36 months preceding the 11 12 lawsuit. We have agreed that the defense will not put any of the account numbers in the record. 13 defense will also endeavor to put the least amount 14 of that information in the record. At this point 15 16 our intent is to simply verify locations through 17 I don't foresee any other use for it. there's anything that appears like it might be a 18 19 privacy issue, we would like to know. You can 20 probably let us know when you produce it. If there 21 is a charge to a sensitive purchase, please feel free to highlight it. 2.2 BY MR. RANDAZZA: 23 24 There was a statement that you discussed Q 25 online where somebody was accusing you of misconduct

	Page 96
1	and hitting on younger students. You consider that
2	ageism?
3	A Can you
4	Q I'll get back to that. Was there an SSA
5	policy against hitting on students?
6	A The SSA fraternization policy essentially
7	said that, yes, for people on the speakers bureau.
8	Q Did you violate that policy?
9	A I did.
10	Q Do you recall when the phone call was with
11	PZ Myers where you told him that you were moving to
12	Ohio?
13	A Not offhand. I think in some of the
14	materials or briefs that we filed we entered that
15	information and I base that information off of my
16	cell phone records.
17	Q So was it pre or post allegedly defamatory
18	articles?
19	A Post because it was a phone call about
20	that.
21	Q So you called Myers after the publication?
22	A He called me, actually.
23	Q He called you?
24	A He called me to discuss Freethought Blogs'
25	investigation of me for the claims made and that's

	Page 97
1	the conversation I referenced earlier. That
2	conversation started with him apologizing for
3	calling so early. He thought I was in California
4	hours ahead of him. I said no, I actually moved to
5	Ohio. I'm actually hours later than you or an hour
6	or two later than you.
7	Q He definitely believed at that point you
8	lived in California?
9	A Certainly.
10	Q But the publication had already happened?
11	A Correct. And that was the conversation
12	where I explained to him that if he didn't retract I
13	would have to sue. That was before the desist
14	letters. I hadn't even spoken to a lawyer yet.
15	Q So none of the events discussed in these
16	written statements took place in Ohio?
17	A None of the events?
18	Q Your violation of the SSA policy, for
19	example?
20	A One of them did.
21	Q Which sexual harassment took place in
22	Ohio?
23	A It wasn't sexual harassment.
24	Q What was it?
25	A Ms. F, that encounter occurred at Case

Page 98 1 Western University in northern Ohio. 2 MR. RANDAZZA: All right. I can turn 3 this over to your lawyer for cross. 4 THE WITNESS: One thing, we kind of left 5 that one hanging. There were a certain number of factual issues in there. Do we want to go over 6 7 those in this deposition or is there some other way 8 to handle that? 9 MR. PERRY: Let's do that now. 10 CROSS-EXAMINATION 11 BY MR. PERRY: 12 Because I'm going second, if I jump around 13 or if I ask a poorly worded question, let me know and I'll rephrase the question. Why don't we cover 14 15 that now and I will ask you to explain the factually accurate version of that story. 16 17 Well, the facts that have been inaccurately reported and some of these were 18 19 inaccurately reported by me originally is that when 20 I wrote the article that we are talking, How To Do 21 Wrong Right or whatever that title was, at the time that I wrote that and at the time that the SSA 2.2 23 contacted me, and I believe that was the incident 24 that I was being accused of, which turned out not to 25 be, I thought that was an SSA event. Once the legal

- 1 case started and I started researching and fact
- 2 checking the information I realized that it wasn't
- 3 an SSA event and it was not covered by the SSA
- 4 fraternization policy. I think that's the only
- 5 thing.
- 6 Q Are there any other factual inaccuracies
- 7 in that story?
- 8 A I can't remember the line that was read.
- 9 There may be other factual inaccuracies.
- 10 Q I want to ask you a couple of questions
- 11 relative to the nature of the defendants'
- 12 statements. Earlier you discussed, but I want you
- 13 to be specific here, is there any truth to the
- 14 defendants' allegations of sexual assault?
- 15 A No.
- 16 Q Is there any truth to the defendants'
- 17 allegations of sexual harassment?
- 18 A No.
- 19 Q Specific to Ms. Frank-Skiba's statements,
- 20 she claimed that her accusations were all personal
- 21 **knowledge?**
- 22 A Yes.
- 23 Q And what did she accuse you of?
- 24 A She accused me of sexual harassment and
- 25 sexual assault and also said that she had personal

	Page 100
1	knowledge of, quote unquote, other victims.
2	Q Is there any way that Ms. Frank-Skiba
3	could have personal knowledge of such things?
4	A No.
5	Q Why not?
6	A Because no such things occurred.
7	Q And then specific to Ms. Lane, she also
8	alleged personal knowledge of wrongful conduct?
9	A Yes.
10	Q Is there any way that she could have
11	personal knowledge of such conduct?
12	A No, not such that would violate the sexual
13	harassment policy at Skepticon.
14	Q What did Ms. Lane accuse you of that was
15	false and damaging to you?
16	A Violating a sexual harassment policy at
17	Skepticon.
18	Q Is there any way she could have personal
19	knowledge of such a thing?
20	A No.
21	Q Why not?
22	A Because no such thing occurred.
23	Q Did anyone acting on Ms. Lane's behalf
24	contact you for your version of the story?
25	A No.

	Page 101
1	Q How about anyone representing Skepticon,
2	did they contact you for your side of the version of
3	the events?
4	A No.
5	Q Moving on. Similar line of questions as
6	to Ms. Zvan. She claimed to have personal knowledge
7	of at least one other incident. Can you describe
8	what she claimed?
9	A She has alleged now six incidents, so it
10	would depend on which one you are talking about and
11	in every single case she reported is not true.
12	Q No way she could have personal knowledge?
13	A No.
14	Q Do you know who told her about those
15	incidents that she alleges?
16	A No.
17	Q She claims to have heard about at least
18	one alleged incident from a third party?
19	A Right. Yes.
20	Q How could she have personal knowledge of
21	such a thing?
22	A I don't know. It's not possible.
23	Q And did Ms. Zvan contact you to get your
24	side of the story.
25	A No.

Page 102 1 Did anyone representing the Orbit ever Q 2 contact you to get your side of the story? 3 Α No. Did any of the defendants ever reach out 4 O 5 to you before they published false statements about you? 6 7 The only exception would be Myers who Α 8 phone called me after their first article, but then 9 we discussed that conversation already. 10 With respect to your business, writing, Q speaking, teaching as a source of income, do you 11 12 know the approximate size of that market? 13 apologize for referring to it as the market. 14 community. The ecosystem to which you earn your 15 living, tell me about that. 16 Object to form. MR. RANDAZZA: 17 THE WITNESS: Yeah. My blog reaches over a hundred thousand readers and my financials for 18 19 the year 2015 is a good example of sales. BY MR. PERRY: 20 21 What I'm asking is not just what your 2.2 footprint is, but how big is this market? Nationwide or worldwide? 23 Α 24 Nationwide for right now. Q 25 Nationwide it's well over a hundred Α

- 1 thousand individuals who are within my market.
- 3 each year that are a part of that?
- 4 A It varies by year but it's about ten to
- 5 twenty conventions related to the secular community
- 6 in one form or another.
- 7 Q Tell me one or two of the most prominent
- 8 conventions.
- 9 A Skepticon is one of the larger ones. It
- 10 often draws audiences in the vicinity of a thousand
- 11 people. American Atheist, their conferences are
- 12 about comparable in size. I don't know if it's
- 13 still going on this year, but in previous years
- 14 there was ReAsoncon, Apostacon, many others.
- 15 Atheist Alliance America has one. These have
- 16 attendances usually 3- to 600. There's a variety of
- 17 other smaller conferences that have 2- or 300
- 18 attendees.
- 19 Q The attendees for all of these conferences
- 20 that you just mentioned, they are people that you
- 21 would consider your audience or potential audience?
- 22 A Yeah, it's market access. Only a fraction
- 23 of the market can attend these conventions. When I
- 24 go to these conventions and speak at them, I'm not
- 25 only exposing my work to the attendees but also they

- 1 go out and talk about it.
- 2 Q Let's start with Freethought Blogs
- 3 Network, how influential would you say that
- 4 organization is within the community?
- 5 A It is almost certainly the most read blog
- 6 network in the secular community that is devoted
- 7 solely to the secular community. Its readership is
- 8 approximately 1.4 million.
- 9 Orbit, do they have a sizeable reach in
- 10 this community?
- 11 A Yes. Average reach I think is 200- to
- 12 400,000 readers. They are probably the second most
- 13 secular website that's devoted specifically to that.
- MR. RANDAZZA: Objection. Foundation.
- 15 BY MR. PERRY:
- 16 Q How about Skepticon, can you describe how
- 17 influential their role is in this community?
- 18 MR. RANDAZZA: Objection to form.
- 19 THE WITNESS: They are a much admired
- 20 conference. They are a conference leader in terms
- 21 of what other conferences look to.
- 22 BY MR. PERRY:
- 23 Q Mr. Randazza asked you earlier questions
- 24 relative to your professional relationships and
- 25 business expectances within Ohio. How long did you

Page 105 say you were affiliated with Secular Student 2 Alliance? 3 Α For more years than I can remember. Before 2016? 4 0 5 Α Absolutely. At the time of the defendants' false 6 0 statements, do you know whether the defendants were 8 aware of your affiliation with SSA? 9 Α Yes. 10 All of them? Q 11 Α Yes. 12 Q How do you know that? 13 Α Because either I've spoken to all of them about events that I've done for the SSA or they've 14 been well aware of it and talked about it 15 16 themselves. 17 Did you personally know each of the defendants before June of 2016 when their statements 18 were first published? 19 20 Α I don't know how to answer that for 21 Freethought Blogs. 2.2 How about Myers? Q 23 Α Yes, Myers for sure, many years. Zvan, 24 many years I personally knew her. Amy Frank for the 25 one SSA event that I did.

	Page 106
1	Q You know she knew you?
2	A She knew me from before not personally,
3	but professionally she knew me as a figure in the
4	community. That's why she had me come out to speak
5	for her organization.
6	Q Lane?
7	A Yes, I knew Lane.
8	Q These are all prior to 2016?
9	A Yes.
10	Q Was it common knowledge that the SSA was
11	in Ohio?
12	A Yes.
13	MR. RANDAZZA: Objection. Form.
14	BY MR. PERRY:
15	Q How long have you been affiliated with
16	Camp Quest?
17	A Longer than I can remember.
18	Q Before 2016?
19	A Yes.
20	Q At the time of the statements alleged in
21	this lawsuit, do you know whether the defendants
22	were aware of your affiliation with Camp Quest?
23	A Yeah wait. At what time?
24	Q Previous to their statements, so previous
25	to mid 2016, each of the defendants, would they have

	Page 107
1	known that you had an affiliation with Camp Quest?
2	A Lane would have known because we spoke of
3	it many times before.
4	Q Frank-Skiba?
5	A I don't know about the other defendants if
6	they knew before the statements.
7	Q Zvan?
8	A I don't know.
9	Q Myers?
10	A I don't know.
11	Q Okay. Was it common knowledge that Camp
12	Quest was in Ohio?
13	A It was fairly common knowledge.
14	Q Around the time just previous to these
15	damaging statements, tell me just explain briefly
16	about your livelihood and the business that you were
17	building in Ohio?
18	A Right. So I started building my business
19	in Ohio in 2015. That shows in the financial
20	documents we have given on discovery. I started
21	developing business relationships with numerous
22	organizations that hired me to speak and sell my
23	books there and promote my work. Those are the
24	three prongs of my in-person business, which is
25	getting the promotion opportunities and being able

- 1 to sell books and get speaking fees, if that's the
- 2 case, so I did that in 2015 and I was all ready to
- 3 do that in 2016. I didn't book any gigs in Ohio in
- 4 the first half because I knew I was moving. I knew
- 5 it would be a waste of expense if I were to get
- 6 events in Ohio before I moved, so I planned to build
- 7 all of my 2016 events in the second half of 2016
- 8 after I moved, but that's unfortunately the moment I
- 9 moved right after that that the defendants'
- 10 statements came out and that prevented that from
- 11 happening.
- 12 Q Earlier today we discussed how your move
- 13 to Ohio was publicized ahead of time. I want to
- 14 clarify, before moving, did you ever discuss your
- 15 move with any of the defendants and if so which
- ones, which group of friends?
- 17 A Owners and operators I think were Greta
- 18 Christina and Marie Mogilevsky were both informed of
- 19 my move before I moved.
- 20 O Before the move did you directly speak to
- 21 the defendants about your intentions to move to
- 22 **Ohio?**
- 23 A Just those members of the Orbit.
- 24 Q Did you publicize the reason for your move
- 25 to Ohio?

	Page 109
1	A Yes oh, wait. Actually, I'm not sure
2	if I wrote about the reason. I can't remember.
3	It's been so long since I wrote my move blogs.
4	Q Before the statements were published, did
5	you ever discuss the reason for your move to Ohio
6	directly with any of the defendants?
7	A I don't remember.
8	Q How did the defendants specifically target
9	your affiliation with Secular Student Alliance
10	and/or Camp Quest?
11	A Frank's post which started the whole
12	thing, she basically essentially says I will be a
13	threat to children and if there was anyone working
14	with Camp Quest who would want to be affiliated with
15	me and therefore Camp Quest couldn't suffer the
16	ignominy of being affiliated with me and
17	specifically said the same thing that SSA should be
18	boycotted until all of this.
19	Q So she did call for a boycott?
20	A Yeah.
21	Q She called for a boycott with
22	A She wanted the entire leadership of the
23	SSA to be dismantled. I think it's quite clear the
24	reason for that is she wanted people like me to be
25	no longer able to speak at those things. That's

Page 110 kind of the reason why she wanted management gone. 2 At that time she would have known that 3 these organizations were in Ohio? 4 Α Yes. 5 O At that time do we know whether she knew 6 that you were living in Ohio? 7 Α At the time she wrote --8 MR. RANDAZZA: Objection. Foundation. 9 She had to have known based THE WITNESS: 10 on the arguments and the points that I made 11 earlier. BY MR. PERRY: 12 How do you know that she knew you were 13 0 living in Ohio? 14 Because she has admitted that she was 15 Α 16 constantly searching my Facebook wall for 17 announcements of events and things that I was 18 attending and she was watching the results so 19 closely that she saw even nonevent announcements, so 20 she can't have failed to see the move posts, 21 especially because she was looking at university 2.2 event announcements and one of move posts are about 23 a university event announcement. 24 This is before she called for a boycott? Q 25 Exactly. Α

Page 111 1 I think you already testified about Camp 0 2 Quest and Secular Student Alliance suspending 3 promotional and business projects. Were there any other business projects that you were developing 4 5 with either of those two organizations before they were canceled? 6 7 Yes, I was in negotiations with Camp Quest 8 to run a nationwide science experiment through the national office in Ohio. That would have resulted 9 10 in research paper and publicity and prestige. 11 Q And that was canceled? 12 Yes, Camp Quest could no longer associate with me once I had this stigma. 13 Before the defendants' statements, were 14 Q 15 there any other Ohio-related business opportunities 16 that were underway or in development at the time? 17 Not underway, but I had suspected to do what I usually do in my home state which was to 18 19 start developing more gigs at all the organizations but since then several members of those 20 21 organizations have published clearly that they had no interest in hiring me because of the defamation. 22 Tell us about how the defendants' 23 Q 24 statements have affected your professional 25 reputation?

- 1 A I run into problems all the time where
- 2 oftentimes even my scholarship will be questioned.
- 3 People will say who wants to listen to a sexual
- 4 harasser. I have to deal with those kind of insults
- 5 a lot. I'm mocked for this especially since I want
- 6 to try and write about feminism and social justice.
- 7 I'm mocked and insulted because I'm accused of being
- 8 a hypocrite. Other effects on my reputation in
- 9 terms of being a threat to children and women.
- 10 People don't want to hire me at events. And I often
- 11 have to deal with a double edge sword on this, if I
- 12 try to build a contract to work for an organization
- 13 usually what will happen is someone will come along
- 14 and point out the defamation to the organization and
- 15 I'd get disinvited or there's a big fight on the
- 16 board of directors and so I have to deal with the
- 17 stress of that and that makes it more difficult for
- 18 them to hire me in the future and that's just the
- 19 few that I can think of right now.
- 20 Q Could you explain how the defendants'
- 21 conduct in this case has affected you emotionally?
- 22 A Yeah. Extraordinary stress and anxiety.
- 23 I feel like being gas lighted about it. I lost
- 24 ten pounds in the first six -- less than six months
- 25 after the defamation started. It's difficult in

- 1 personal relationships because I have to deal with
- 2 the difficult conversations and it's hard to date
- 3 because how do you date someone and have to tell
- 4 them about this. If you don't tell them about it,
- 5 they find out about it later and then you're like
- 6 are they going to hate you for it. There's a lot of
- 7 anxiety and worry because of that. There's tons
- 8 more in terms of this. The anxiety and worry is
- 9 constant. Even having to fight the case. Every
- 10 time that I have to respond to defense motion I have
- 11 to revisit these lies that were said about me and
- 12 that's painful.
- 13 Q After they published their statements you
- 14 served each of the defendants with a cease and
- 15 desist letter, right?
- 16 A Yes.
- 17 O Each of the defendants received a cease
- 18 and desist letter?
- 19 A They each received it. Lane keeps saying
- 20 that she didn't, but Skepticon did, but we sent it
- 21 to her as an officer of Skepticon to the Skepticon
- 22 address, so I would count that as her having
- 23 received it.
- 24 Q Any of your letters returned as
- 25 undeliverable?

		Page 114					
1	A	I don't think so.					
2	Q	So cease and desist letters were sent from					
3	Ohio, rig	ht?					
4	A Yes.						
5	Q	And you demanded a retraction, correct?					
6	A	Yes.					
7	Q	After the defendants received these					
8	letters d	id any of them retract their statements or					
9	did they	double down?					
10	A	They double downed or didn't retract.					
11	Q	Did any of the defendants make public a					
12	copy of y	our cease and desist letter?					
13	A	Amy Frank did.					
14	Q	I think we've already discussed a little					
15	bit that	Skepticon and Lane replied to the cease and					
16	desist le	etter, right?					
17	A	Yes.					
18	Q	And that should cover whether or not Lane					
19	received	a copy of the cease and desist letter?					
20	A	Right.					
21	Q	They mailed that reply to Ohio?					
22	A	Yes.					
23	Q	Did that reply allege a breach of					
24	contract?						
25	A	Yes.					

	Page 115
1	Q Did the reply from Lane and Skepticon
2	threaten litigation?
3	A Yes.
4	Q If you had to litigate this suit in a
5	state other than Ohio, would that pose a financial
6	burden?
7	A Tremendously.
8	Q A significant financial burden?
9	A Yes.
10	Q As a practical matter, if you were
11	required to litigate this somewhere other than Ohio,
12	would you have to abandon your claim?
13	A I might have to. I'd have to review it at
14	that time.
15	MR. PERRY: I think those are all the
16	questions that I have for you.
17	REDIRECT EXAMINATION
18	BY MR. RANDAZZA:
19	Q Why would you have to abandon your claims
20	if you couldn't litigate them in Ohio?
21	A I wouldn't be able to afford it.
22	Q How do you know that?
23	A Because it's already been extraordinarily
24	expensive. It's very difficult to keep funding
25	this.
1	

	Page 116					
1	Q Which lawyers have you asked for a pricing					
2	on this in the defendants' home states?					
3	A I haven't yet, but I know what lawyers					
4	cost on average.					
5	Q But you have no frame of reference					
6	factually you are just speculating?					
7	A I'm fairly certain that California lawyers					
8	are not going to be cheaper than my lawyer.					
9	Q But the fact is you have no frame of					
10	reference except for your own guess?					
11	A The frame of reference is the data that I					
12	have available, which is what lawyers cost.					
13	Q So you haven't talked to a lawyer and					
14	asked about contingency?					
15	A I have not.					
16	Q That would not cost you anything unless					
17	you won?					
18	A Yes. I don't know of anyone that would					
19	think of doing that.					
20	Q Why not?					
21	A Why would they?					
22	Q Why do you think no lawyer would take it					
23	on contingency?					
24	A I have no idea why lawyers would take a					
25	case like this because well, I haven't asked					

Page 117
1 them. I don't think it's the kind of thing they do.
2 Q You have no frame of reference?
3 A On that I do not know.
4 Q Isn't most of this case built on that same
5 kind of speculation?
6 A No.
7 Q You are not speculating that someone may
8 have seen something on your Facebook page, for
9 example?
10 A That's not speculation. That's a
11 reasonable argument from facts.
Q You have no facts to say that?
13 A Facts to say what?
Q You have no direct evidence of anyone
15 having read any of this as far as your move to Ohio?
16 A You mean before
Q You are only extrapolating from yes,
18 before the alleged defamation.
19 A You have to ask a more specific question.
Q Do you know what the word evidence means?
21 A Yeah.
22 Q You have direct evidence of something.
For example, if you had an IP address that hit your
24 blog, you would have direct evidence that somebody
25 at that IP address read your blog?

	Page 118
1	A That's direct evidence.
2	Q If you have what you are calling
3 0	circumstantial evidence or speculation or a guess
4 1	based on what you have, that is something different,
5 1	right?
6	A Indirect evidence is far better than
7 s	speculation.
8	Q When did you take evidence class in law
9 £	school?
10	A I'm a philosopher.
11	Q Did you ever see the Mel Brooks movie
12 v	where the guy says what is your occupation?
13	A No.
14	Q He says I'm a philosopher.
15	MR. RANDAZZA: Have you seen it?
16	MR. PERRY: Yeah, recently.
17 F	BY MR. RANDAZZA:
18	Q So you're a bullshit artist. Mel Brooks
19 s	script is not an issue in this case, so we will not
20	introduce that. I'm glad you took that in humor as
21	it was the intent. You ended your affiliation with
22 (Camp Quest in 2009; is that true?
23	A In 2009?
24	Q Do you have any affiliation with Camp
25 ç	Quest now?

	Page 119
1	A I never had any formal affiliation. I
2	don't know what you are quite asking about.
3	Q You said before you never violated a
4	Skepticon policy; is that true?
5	A Yes. I never violated Skepticon policy at
6	Skepticon.
7	Q You never violated the policy or you never
8	violated it at Skepticon?
9	A Their policy only applies at Skepticon.
10	Q It was SSA where you violated policy?
11	A Their fraternization policy, yes.
12	Q You said your blog has over a hundred
13	thousand readers?
14	A Yes.
15	Q Where are you getting that information
16	from?
17	A My statistics in my WordPress Jetpack.
18	Q Is that individual unique hits?
19	A Correct.
20	Q So it's more hits than that. It's a
21	hundred thousand unique IP addresses?
22	A I don't know.
23	Q What is that a hundred thousand? It's a
24	hundred thousand what?
25	A A hundred thousand unique visitors who
1	

Page 120 have read articles on my website per month. 2 So that's not counting any repeat visitors 3 or is that factoring in from multiple IP addresses? How are they breaking that down to uniques? 4 5 Α I'm not sure. I have to check the data 6 bank. 7 So you don't know how many readers it is? Q 8 Α It has to be within that vicinity. 9 Q Why? 10 It would be weird if thousands of people Α were pinning the website multiple times. 11 If you do 12 the math, I'd still have to have 90,000 readers or 80,000 readers. 13 14 Can you tell me the equation you are Q 15 forming in your head to do that math? 16 Α No. 17 O When you say do the math you immediately put me off balance because I'm not a mathematician. 18 19 I'm trying to think in my head and it's Α 20 hard to do figures in my head. For that I'd have to 21 look at how the statistics were being generated. It's usual in the community to talk about how many 22 23 readers you have based on your unique visitors 24 count.

Which community?

25

Q

	Page 121
1	A The Internet. The blogging community in
2	general.
3	Q So the Earth?
4	A I guess. Not everybody on the planet is a
5	blogger.
6	Q But on the Internet?
7	A Correct.
8	Q We are talking about the majority of the
9	planet.
10	A I'm talking about the blogging community.
11	When bloggers, websites, corporations talk about
12	what their readership is, they are talking about
13	unique visitors. It's a standard count.
14	Q You haven't come up with that data, you're
15	interpreting something that WordPress gave you?
16	A Yes, which is standard in the industry.
17	Q You used to blog at Freethought blogs?
18	A Yes.
19	Q Part of the issue is they banned you?
20	A Yes.
21	Q Before when you posted there, how much
22	editorial control did they exercise over you?
23	A Not a lot. There were other bloggers that
24	they exhibited editorial control on. They were
25	pretty lax. You had to do something pretty

Page 122 egregious for them to exercise. 2 Tell me the process of posting an article 3 there. What do you --4 Α 5 O First you open your computer and you log 6 on to Freethoughtblogs.org? Α Yes. 8 O You put in your username and password? 9 Α Yes. 10 What happens after you enter your username Q and password? 11 12 Α I can write an article and hit publish. 13 Q And then it goes to an editor to approve 14 or not approve it? No, it goes live and if there's any issues 15 Α 16 with it Myers or someone at Freethought Blogs brings 17 up the issue on the back channel after the fact and asks for a correction if need be or they take action 18 19 and ban you, which they have done before. 20 0 You publish it on your own. It's like 21 automated, but then if somebody is mad at you, they will yell at you? 22 23 They will exercise control if an Α Yeah. 24 issue is brought up. I'm certain that if someone 25 defamed someone on Freethought Blogs, Freethought

Page 123 1 Blogs would shut them down and not support them and 2 got rid of their blog and apologized and so on. 3 MR. RANDAZZA: No further questions. 4 RECROSS-EXAMINATION 5 BY MR. PERRY: 6 You just described the editorial control, 7 the protocol when you compose and publish an article on Freethought Blogs. Are you familiar with that 8 9 same protocol on say the Orbit? I don't know directly, but I believe it's 10 Α the same process there. 11 12 Do you think the Orbit exercises any 13 editorial control over their contact providers? 14 A part of the reason the Orbit was formed А was actually so that the people who owned the 15 16 different blogs would be more involved in that 17 process than was the case at Freethought Blogs. Freethought Blogs had before me already kicked 18 bloggers off for misconduct. Someone published 19 violent threats, so they eliminated him. 20 21 eliminated someone for plagiarism. They posted plagiarized text on the blog and they got rid of his 2.2 23 blog and issued basically a denunciation, so they 24 didn't affiliate themselves with them anymore. Some 25 of the complaints of other people who joined the

Page 124 1 Orbit was that they wanted more collective control over things like that. I'm fairly certain that 2 3 Orbit would have done the same thing if someone was caught plagiarizing there, for instance. 4 5 Q What is the managerial hierarchy at Orbit, is it a coop? 6 It's a coop, yeah. 8 0 Can you explain that? 9 According to them they are a collective 10 that operates democratically. So does that mean there is some senior 11 12 editor that can sensor somebody? 13 Α From the way they described it, it's if they democratically decide to sensor someone they 14 15 are acting collectively as the editor of the site. 16 MR. PERRY: That's all the questions that 17 I have. 18 REDIRECT EXAMINATION (Continued) 19 BY MR. RANDAZZA: 20 Your statements about the Orbit, so they 0 21 can exercise control after it's published but not 2.2 before? 23 As far as I know I don't actually know. Α 24 That's how it worked at Freethought Blogs? Q 25 That's how it worked at Freethought Blogs. Α

	Page 125
1	I don't know how they are running it at Orbit, but
2	from their behavior, I'm assuming it runs the same.
3	MR. RANDAZZA: That's it.
4	MR. PERRY: He will waive.
5	COURT REPORTER: Would you like a
6	transcript?
7	MR. RANDAZZA: E-mail a dirty in advance
8	and an e-tran.
9	COURT REPORTER: Do you want an e-tran?
10	MR. PERRY: Send me a quote.
11	(Thereupon, the deposition was concluded
12	at 2:56 o'clock p.m.)
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

	Page 126
1	STATE OF OHIO)
2	COUNTY OF MONTGOMERY) SS: CERTIFICATE
3	I, Wqueana N. George, a Notary Public
4	within and for the State of Ohio, duly commissioned
5	and qualified,
6	DO HEREBY CERTIFY that the above-named DR.
7	RICHARD CARRIER, was by me first duly sworn to
8	testify the truth, the whole truth and nothing but
9	the truth.
10	Said testimony was reduced to writing by
11	me stenographically in the presence of the witness
12	and thereafter reduced to typewriting.
13	I FURTHER CERTIFY that I am not a relative
14	or Attorney of either party, in any manner
15	interested in the event of this action, nor am I, or
16	the court reporting firm with which I am affiliated,
17	under a contract as defined in Civil Rule 28(D).
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	

	Page 127
1	IN WITNESS WHEREOF, I have hereunto set my
2	hand and seal of office at Dayton, Ohio, on this 6th
3	day of February, 2018.
4	
5	NOTC A
6	Sugar Secretary Sugar Su
7	HILL O THOMAS TO THE SHOPE OF T
8	WQUEANA N. GEORGE
9	NOTARY PUBLIC, STATE OF OHIO My commission expires 03-05-2020
10	
11	
12	
13	
14	
15	
16	
17	
18	
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24 25	
_ ∠5	

	adjust 64:12	103:15 105:2	30:21 59:21 75:22	asking 5:24 32:2
<u>A</u>	admired 104:19	109:9 111:2	123:24	33:19 52:21 69:4
a.m 1:19	admit 17:10 42:23	allow 16:5	anyway 36:19 70:13	78:17 79:11,16
abandon 115:12,19	admit 17:10 42:23 admitted 92:11	allowable 29:9	72:5	82:8 102:21 119:2
ability 31:12 35:3	110:15	allowing 40:17	apart 9:25	asks 122:18
able 5:12 32:7 35:9	advance 79:21 80:7	altered 25:5 64:25	apart 9.23	assault 77:23 78:8
49:14,18 55:15	125:7	65:9	apologize 42:23	78:11 99:14,25
107:25 109:25	advances 36:16,18	alumni 53:9,12	102:13	assigned 56:3
115:21	41:10	Amanda 58:19 73:8	apologized 45:17	associate 111:12
above-named 126:6	advice 82:8	73:16,18 84:15,19	123:2	associated 30:12
absolutely 23:8	advise 93:1	Amanda's 74:2	apologizing 97:2	association 53:9,12
67:16 105:5	aesthetic 45:7	84:17	Apostacon 103:14	assume 14:8 44:1
academia 9:21	affidavit 82:23 83:4	America 21:24	appear 95:9	66:24
academic 8:5,8	affiliate 67:10 68:22	103:15	APPEARANCES	assumed 14:4,7
academically 13:14	69:11 70:21,25	American 103:11	3:1	assumes 50:13
access 30:20 31:4	72:15 123:24	amicably 18:3	appears 95:18	assuming 50:24
34:17 55:14	affiliated 74:3 105:1	amorous 17:20	Apple 53:18,25 54:6	125:2
103:22	106:15 109:14,16	amount 95:14	Apple's 52:17	Atheist 103:11,15
accomplishments	126:16	amounts 25:14	applied 42:3	ATM 94:18
23:14	affiliates 66:16,18	Amy 1:9 14:6,21	applies 119:9	atmosphere 74:13
account 52:24,25	66:23 70:2 72:13	35:12 40:4 46:7	apply 68:25	attached 88:25
53:15,16,22,25,25	72:24 75:8,10,11	76:20,25 78:2	approach 33:13	91:14
54:3,10 55:5	91:16	81:11 83:10,13,14	69:1,2	attempted 32:15
95:13 accountant 29:7	affiliation 74:6	85:11 86:1,7,14	approve 122:13,14	attempts 32:22
	105:8 106:22	86:15,18 90:8	approximate 102:12	attend 40:18,19
accounts 53:3 55:14	107:1 109:9	91:10 94:3,4	approximately	68:19 72:24 80:23
accuracy 23:3 accurate 64:5,24	118:21,24 119:1	105:24 114:13	104:8	81:1 103:23
98:16	afford 20:3 115:21	analysis 45:8	archive 61:11,17,18	attendances 103:16
accusations 40:4,9	aforementioned	analytics 30:17,19	61:21,25	attended 16:15,16
90:8 91:10 99:20	79:24	30:22 31:13,16,19	archived 61:14	74:15
accuse 99:23 100:14	age 4:2	33:5 62:25	arduous 95:1	attendees 16:7
accused 77:22 98:24	ageism 96:2	analyze 35:3	area 7:19 22:12	103:18,19,25
99:24 112:7	ago 10:14 11:16	Ancestry.com 62:12	areas 22:10 24:23	attending 76:13
accusing 35:17	26:7 55:20 88:20	Anchorage 33:3,6	24:25	110:18
42:19,20 80:16	agree 24:14	ancient 6:14,15	argument 117:11	Attitudes 7:24
95:25	agreed 18:21 87:18	and/or 109:10	arguments 36:8	attorney 3:4 28:10
acknowledge 44:3	95:12	announce 82:25	110:10	28:18,21 77:14
acknowledging 44:1	agreeing 82:2	announced 30:10	Arizona 14:7,8	126:14
acting 100:23	agreement 44:21	47:23	Arkansas 22:22,25	attorney's 20:25
124:15	65:18 71:13,15	announcement	arranged 72:12	attorney/client 28:9
action 122:18	ahead 43:2 63:4	46:22 48:2,12,15	73:21 76:1	88:7
126:15	97:4 108:13	110:23	arranging 72:20	Attorneys 3:10
activist 89:16	air 36:2	announcements	article 8:14 9:20	attractive 24:8
activities 37:4	Alabama 22:23	46:16,20,25	35:13 57:7,8 61:2	audience 30:13
actual 39:16	alcohol 83:7	110:17,19,22	89:23 90:2,7 91:9	103:21,21
ad 8:1 40:13	alimony 29:14	announcing 34:18	91:11 98:20 102:8	audiences 103:10
add 65:4	allegations 99:14,17	answer 4:22 28:10	122:2,12 123:7	August 74:22 84:20
address 32:1,6,13	allege 23:12 114:23	28:19,24,25 29:20	articles 9:4 96:18	84:21
32:16,21 51:3	alleged 24:15 26:3	37:7 59:5 61:23	120:1	Austin 16:25 17:2
52:18,20 53:8,8	87:5 100:8 101:9	69:25 70:4 71:20	artist 20:4 118:18	authenticated 65:20
66:6 113:22	101:18 106:20	77:14 88:11	arts 6:10,13	authentication 54:9
117:23,25	117:18	105:20	Aside 11:13	automated 122:21
addresses 30:25	allegedly 87:1 96:17	anxiety 17:8 112:22	asked 5:11 8:22	availability 33:1
31:9,25 51:8	alleges 101:15	113:7,8	11:4 29:23 59:2	available 47:9 54:15
52:23,25 53:6	Alliance 41:24 66:2	anybody 18:8 60:6	69:10,17,18 81:11	116:12
119:21 120:3	66:11,21 67:1,6,9	75:11 86:23 89:18	85:6 94:13 104:23	average 63:21
	84:22,25 85:1	anymore 17:14,25	116:1,14,25	104:11 116:4
l	I	I	I	1

	20 10 22 07 10	24 22 60 10 01 24	00 10 12 06 21 22	CEDTIFICATE
avoid 86:17	20:19,22 87:19	24:22 60:18 91:24	89:12,13 96:21,22	CERTIFICATE
aware 35:5,7 59:15	118:6	breakfast 6:5	96:23,24 102:8	126:2
86:1 93:10 105:8	bewildered 36:15	breaking 120:4	109:21 110:24	certified 4:3
105:15 106:22	beyond 10:18 69:8	brief 23:6 84:5	calling 89:10 97:3	CERTIFY 126:6,13
awhile 7:11 17:13	big 5:12 24:7 33:4	briefly 107:15	118:2	cetera 74:20
	102:22 112:15	briefs 96:14	camp 7:10 38:1,1,2	chance 9:6
B	bigger 20:11	bring 79:19 80:5	38:3,5,12,12,15	change 12:14 82:12
B 18:23,24 19:1	Billings 34:3	81:2,3	38:19,22 46:21	changed 16:4,9
bachelor 6:10	bit 45:4 48:3 85:13	bringing 26:12 83:6	74:4 84:8,13	channel 122:17
back 10:2 15:18	114:15	brings 122:16	91:16 94:7,8	chapter 71:21
29:20 30:18 31:6	black 36:5	Brooks 118:11,18	106:16,22 107:1	chapters 66:12
31:14 33:4 35:24	block 32:17	brought 62:8 83:7	107:11 109:10,14	71:17 75:8
42:10 47:12 52:24	blocked 31:4	122:24	109:15 111:1,7,12	charge 21:4 95:21
55:15 63:18,19	blog 30:8,8,16,17	browser 50:23	118:22,24	charges 94:24
65:21 75:23 89:23	31:2,5,7,8,12 32:7	54:24 56:3,20,21	Campbell 1:17 3:3	chatting 45:2
96:4 122:17	32:11 34:15,17	browsers 50:25	camps 38:4,6,11	cheaper 116:8
balance 120:18	35:2,13 42:18	Brunsman 74:22	campuses 66:17	cheating 17:7
ban 40:17 122:19	43:19 45:24 60:24	84:20	canceled 111:6,11	check 12:16 57:18
bang 89:23	63:15 78:6 84:7	build 108:6 112:12	Cape 7:10,11	61:15 70:12 120:5
Banged 89:24	102:17 104:5	building 107:17,18	Capitan 3:11	checkable 61:10
bangs 88:15,17	117:24,25 119:12	built 117:4	capture 57:16	checked 32:4,24
bank 94:19 95:10	121:17 123:2,22	bullshit 118:18	card 24:13 55:14	61:16 62:8
120:6	123:23	bunch 72:12	94:15,19 95:10	checking 99:2
banned 42:7,9 68:4	blogged 30:7	burden 115:6,8	care 26:11,17 42:22	children 109:13
68:6 121:19	blogger 11:20,23	bureau 41:24 42:3,5	career 13:2 23:14	112:9
banning 58:7	89:16 121:5	42:6 87:5,9,16,17	carefully 29:8	choose 80:21
base 96:15	bloggers 121:11,23	96:7	Carrier 1:5,12 4:1,7	chose 40:12
based 21:22 66:15	123:19	bureaus 91:18	23:15 46:12 47:19	Christian 38:5
68:18 110:9 118:4	blogging 121:1,10	Burgundy 24:6	48:17 49:14,21,22	Christina 108:18
120:23	blogs 11:21 30:19	business 20:8 25:6	49:23,25 50:11	circumstances
basically 8:23 17:11	31:4,11 34:23	25:10,20 26:5,9	62:15 126:7	69:10
17:16 26:10 38:4	39:18 40:7,11,13	26:12,19,20 28:4	Carrier's 49:8	circumstantial
38:5,7 73:1	42:8,10 63:12	28:14 29:6,9 31:9	Carriers 62:2,10	118:3
109:12 123:23	92:15,19,20 104:2	69:4 88:1 102:10	case 1:6 11:25 14:1	cities 20:10
basis 29:5	105:21 109:3	104:25 107:16,18	15:1,3 20:24	city 33:17 38:18
Bay 7:19	121:17 122:16,25	107:21,24 111:3,4	27:17 69:3 85:5	Civil 1:14 126:17
BC 8:1	123:1,8,16,17,18	111:15	88:9 97:25 99:1	civilizations 6:11
becoming 8:20	124:24,25	111.13	101:11 108:2	claim 115:12
bed 11:6 15:19	Blogs' 96:24	C	112:21 113:9	claimed 99:20 101:6
beginning 26:20	blue 79:20 80:6	C 3:10	116:25 117:4	101:8
91:12	board 91:17 112:16	cache 56:4	118:19 123:17	claiming 28:14
behalf 3:2,7 100:23	bologna 4:12	Cahill 3:10	cash 94:17	claims 25:21 42:24
behavior 69:22,23	book 40:23 108:3	calendar 54:6,6	Catalina 38:25	96:25 101:17
71:4,4 78:18	books 8:5,9 9:4 24:8	calendaring 54:4,5	category 81:23	115:19
125:2	107:23 108:1	California 7:19	caught 124:4	clarification 72:18
beleaguered 21:25	Boot 7:10	19:12,13,17,18,20	cause 74:14	clarify 108:14
belief 93:16			cautioned 4:3	•
believe 9:15 11:10	Boston 22:8,9,9,11 22:15	20:3,13,19,25 21:19 22:4,6 25:9		class 7:6 118:8 classical 6:11
56:10 59:1,17		25:9,10 26:4 28:1	cease 113:14,17	
,	bought 76:11	T	114:2,12,15,19	cleaning 26:16 clear 5:14 31:5
64:8 65:9 98:23	bound 24:7	38:13,18,23 39:1	cell 54:12 96:16	
123:10	boycott 109:19,21	39:2,14 87:23	CEO 92:14,19,20	36:19 37:3,18
believed 59:22	110:24	88:2,4,8 97:3,8	certain 33:17 59:20	42:11,14 55:24
60:12 97:7	boycotted 109:18	116:7	98:5 116:7 122:24	56:3 60:11 73:4
benchmark 25:4	brackets 64:21	call 7:3 13:19 35:13	124:2	74:18 79:17
Berkeley 6:10	branch 6:22	70:15 85:24 92:13	certainly 10:10 46:8	109:23
best 19:6 25:4	breach 114:23	96:10,19 109:19	46:9 93:20 97:9	clearances 7:12
better 6:7 15:9	break 17:5 23:7	called 1:13 7:4 61:2	104:5	cleared 56:20,21,24
	1	1	1	1

Dr. Richard Carrier

	1	1	1	1
clearly 42:12 111:21	75:15 89:17	consider 33:16	119:19 121:7	59:19 84:12
clicking 50:10,16	102:14 103:5	51:14 56:2 92:19	correction 122:18	day 34:2 40:8 59:3,5
clients' 25:5,21 26:2	104:4,6,7,10,17	96:1 103:21	correctly 67:21	63:20 94:21 127:3
68:16	106:4 120:22,25	considered 35:14	cost 20:15,18 95:1	Dayton 127:2
Clintonian 15:4	121:1,10	constant 113:9	116:4,12,16	deal 11:1,4 24:7
close 4:18 11:4	commuting 26:3	constantly 110:16	counsel 92:24 93:5	33:4 74:14 82:10
54:23 57:3 59:15				
	company 92:21,21	construct 34:7	count 15:7 62:11	112:4,11,16 113:1
closed 11:1	comparable 103:12	consult 28:13,18	69:3 113:22	decade 23:15
closely 110:19	compare 49:23	29:3 88:8	120:24 121:13	decide 87:14 124:14
club 70:25	69:22 71:3	consulting 26:7	counting 120:2	decided 8:23 18:1
clubs 71:13	comparison 49:15	contact 45:21 70:23	country 20:20 47:1	40:7 87:14,15
coast 6:23 7:19	competent 93:1	91:7 100:24 101:2	66:13	decree 88:5
20:20	complain 19:7	101:23 102:2	counts 68:23	deductible 29:6
code 15:23 51:12		123:13	COUNTY 126:2	
	complained 84:25			deducting 28:3
coitus 16:21	85:3,14 86:14,20	contacted 85:1	couple 99:10	deductions 29:9
collapsed 8:17	89:18 90:4,12	86:13 98:23	course 29:22 30:18	deeper 50:15
colleagues 60:16	complaining 86:22	contain 77:11	82:11	defamation 25:5
collect 53:12,24	complaint 23:12,13	content 40:13	courses 15:14,14,15	26:3 29:8 70:3
collective 124:1,9	24:16 40:2 57:8	context 79:16	court 1:1 93:18	75:25 76:17,19
collectively 124:15	82:24 83:5 88:25	contingency 116:14	125:5,9 126:16	94:7 111:22
college 6:20 7:7,8,14	89:22	116:23		112:14,25 117:18
			cover 98:14 114:18	
66:17 85:8	complaints 123:25	continued 19:2	covered 99:3	defamatory 34:16
Columbia 6:13	completely 36:15	45:12 124:18	CPA 29:3	35:15 77:12 87:2
53:10,11,11	69:8	contract 112:12	crashes 55:12	87:6 96:17
Columbus 12:6 20:1	complied 86:25	114:24 126:17	create 25:1	defame 93:18
53:9,10 58:9,11	compose 123:7	contractors 71:10	created 23:18 34:16	defamed 73:2
58:12 66:6,7,16	computer 55:1,10	control 42:10,18	credit 55:14 94:15	122:25
72:11 73:24	55:13 61:22,25	121:22,24 122:23	94:17,18,19 95:10	defend 42:16,21,25
come 5:13 22:11	122:5	The state of the s	credits 6:20	defendant 65:21
		123:6,13 124:1,21		
37:20 68:20 69:5	concerned 51:24	conventions 103:2,5	creepy 78:6,13,19	defendants 1:10,13
69:12 72:23 81:5	56:13,16	103:8,23,24	79:1,3,14 80:1,17	3:7 13:16 14:25
93:18 106:4	concerning 25:19	conversation 42:15	crime 5:1	15:3 39:24 46:2
112:13 121:14	concerns 90:1	45:18 73:13,14	cross 98:3	91:25 92:7 102:4
comes 32:25 34:20	concluded 125:11	78:22 79:1,5,9,18	CROSS-EXAMI	105:7,18 106:21
35:1	conclusion 9:5	80:3,4,20 81:5	98:10	106:25 107:5
coming 21:11 34:11	conditions 4:21	82:11,22 83:3,8	cultivate 76:10	108:15,21 109:6,8
69:4 72:13 73:24	conduct 15:23 19:7	83:15,20,25 86:21	current 34:15 69:23	113:14,17 114:7
comment 64:20	89:19 100:8,11	92:16 97:1,2,11	71:4	114:11
commented 57:11	112:21	102:9	cut 17:16	defendants' 99:11
comments 57:8	CONDUCTED 2:1	conversations 21:23	cutter 7:18	99:14,16 105:6
commission 127:9	conducting 26:9	75:1 113:2		108:9 111:14,23
commissioned 126:4	conference 16:25	conversing 45:11	D	112:20 116:2
committing 27:3	17:2 24:5 72:11	cook 26:14	Dadabhoy 89:3,16	defense 95:12,14
common 30:1 44:20	72:16,23,25 73:5	cookie 61:21	damaging 100:15	113:10
106:10 107:11,13	73:25 74:15 76:7	cookies 55:9,15,25	107:15	define 30:5
communicate 71:18	76:10 104:20,20	cool 17:13	dashboard 31:19	defined 126:17
communicated	conferences 78:19	coop 124:6,7	data 31:22 34:13,17	definitely 27:9
11:24 60:14 73:7	78:23 103:11,17	copy 64:1,5,7,24	35:4 61:24 68:18	32:18 36:3 37:10
73:17	103:19 104:21	114:12,19	116:11 120:5	97:7
communication	confessed 17:24	corporations 121:11	121:14	definition 15:5
17:17	confirm 70:17 83:3	correct 5:5 15:2	date 19:22 37:19,20	degrees 6:12
				_
communications	confirmed 57:21	16:10 27:19 28:5	38:17 64:5,6,9,9	delete 55:9
70:20,21,22 71:3	conflict 37:21	36:7 48:1 58:5	65:20 81:11 93:22	deleted 30:20
75:24 82:3	confusing 36:21	62:1 75:9 84:9,14	113:2,3	delivered 27:8
communities 22:14	connected 53:15	87:3 89:25 91:19	dates 94:23	demand 20:12
community 30:9,12	consensual 16:5	91:21 93:7,15,23	dating 37:2,5,8,11	21:17 24:24 93:11
30:15 60:15 75:13	36:4	97:11 114:5	37:12,14,15 58:23	demanded 114:5
20.12 00.13 13.13		J / /	1 37.12,11,13 30.23	Seminardou 117.5

Dr. Richard Carrier

democratically	difficulty 82:1	46:10 107:20	123:6,13	essentially 11:5 31:7
124:10,14	dig 32:24	doing 5:15 6:7 7:12	edits 64:18	72:25 75:17 89:10
demonstrated 47:21	dignity 15:13	17:9,23 32:14	education 6:9	91:24 96:6 109:12
	dinner 26:14	34:9 48:6,7 51:2	effect 49:3 83:7	
demonstrating 48:13	direct 1:14 4:5		effects 112:8	established 43:4,8
		60:17 79:25		estimate 5:11,13
denunciation	25:20 52:25	116:19	egregious 122:1	23:5 47:4
123:23	117:14,22,24	domestic 26:11	either 18:4 28:2	et 74:20
departmental 9:23	118:1	domicile 27:23	76:25 87:11 91:16	ethical 33:24 51:9
departments 8:19	directed 83:10	donors 13:12	105:13 111:5	51:11,11,15
depend 101:10	directly 61:17	double 112:11 114:9	126:14	ethically 17:20
depending 70:22	108:20 109:6	114:10	El 3:11	33:20
deponent 18:19	123:10	downed 114:10	electronics 7:15	ethics 33:22 51:12
deposing 37:16	director 74:20 84:13	Dr 1:5,12 4:1,7	eliminated 123:20	51:25
deposition 1:12 4:14	84:21	23:15 126:6	123:21	event 40:23 41:9,9
5:18 29:23 40:5	directors 91:17	draws 103:10	else's 52:5 56:13	45:2 67:9 85:7,21
65:3 98:7 125:11	112:16	drill 32:20	80:14	85:23 86:2 98:25
depositions 15:12	dirty 125:7	Drive 1:18 3:5	embarrassing 60:4	99:3 105:25
Descending 78:12	disagree 80:18	driving 20:11 51:15	85:14	110:22,23 126:15
describe 29:23	disapprove 37:4,5	drugs 5:21	emotionally 112:21	events 22:7 42:5
43:10 44:25 101:7	discharge 7:1	Dublin 1:18 3:6	Empire 8:1	46:21,21,23 47:20
104:16	disclose 56:15	due 87:18	employed 84:8	68:10,22 79:10
described 51:21	disclosures 77:16	duly 4:3 126:4,7	employee 84:11	83:1 86:3 94:4
78:18 123:6	discovered 49:13	duties 26:15	91:15	97:15,17 101:3
124:13	discovery 27:7		employees 71:6,7	105:14 108:6,7
deserve 59:15	46:10 49:10 92:12	<u>E</u>	enabled 54:10	110:17 112:10
desire 56:22	94:13 95:8 107:20	E-4 7:6	encounter 97:25	eventually 10:24
desist 93:8 97:13	discuss 59:16 96:24	e-mail 52:16,18,20	endeavor 95:14	11:5 17:23 18:2
113:15,18 114:2	108:14 109:5	52:23,25 53:2,5	ended 118:21	27:9 87:15
114:12,16,19	discussed 40:5	53:12,14 70:19	engage 72:14 80:20	everybody 74:13
destruction 56:9	82:23 83:11 88:21	82:4 89:1,4,5	engaged 16:21	83:5 93:17 121:4
detail 43:23	95:24 97:15 99:12	125:7	engagement 47:2	evidence 46:1,5
details 71:15	102:9 108:12	e-mails 52:25 70:7	engagements 37:24	47:12,14,16 77:1
develop 25:10 40:14	114:14	70:10,12 89:21	46:13,14 72:7	117:14,20,22,24
73:1	discussing 83:9	e-tran 125:8,9	engine 63:13	118:1,3,6,8
developing 26:5	88:15	earlier 40:5 43:25	engineering 7:15	ex 29:14
107:21 111:4,19	discussion 18:15,18	45:23 85:5 97:1	England 52:14	exact 12:13 38:20 41:14 53:7 62:11
development 111:16 device 33:14	18:22 23:9 44:14	99:12 104:23 108:12 110:11	enjoy 65:22	68:23 76:7 86:11
devoted 104:6,13	44:17 65:15,23 84:3 89:8 90:22	early 8:1,7 17:4	enjoying 83:15	86:12
diagram 37:14,19	95:5,8	97:3	Enjoys 89:24 enter 61:16 71:13	
die 56:4	discussions 79:7	earn 102:14	122:10	exactly 11:25 19:15 37:17 57:23 61:7
died 62:18	disinvited 112:15	earned 40:22	entered 88:5 96:14	62:6 69:15 75:2
Diego 7:13	dislike 56:9	earth 86:22 121:3	entering 65:2	80:20 110:25
difference 20:21	dismantled 109:23	easier 25:10 43:18	enthusiastically	examination 1:14
49:3 50:18 64:22	dispute 36:11 95:8	65:2	11:8 69:6	4:5 115:17 124:18
69:23	dissertation 8:2	easily 86:24	entire 56:3 109:22	EXAMINATIONS
different 16:23	DISTRICT 1:1,2	east 20:20,20	entirely 37:15 67:21	2:1
20:23 24:23 32:23	DIVISION 1:3	EASTERN 1:3	83:9	examined 4:4
36:22 37:8 48:16	divorce 18:1 87:25	easy 37:17	entry 9:23	example 5:18 14:12
50:25 51:1 54:5	88:2,3	ECF 64:2	equally 29:25	20:17,24 46:21
67:8 118:4 123:16	divorced 18:3	economy 8:17	equation 120:14	53:7 97:19 102:19
differential 21:5	document 63:23	ecosystem 102:14	equivalent 7:5	117:9,23
difficult 22:24 23:2	79:24 91:14	edge 112:11	78:14,15	exception 102:7
29:24,25 31:8	documentation	edited 61:6 64:8	error 64:15	exception 102.7 exchange 89:5
68:16 82:9 112:17	12:24	edited 01.0 04.8 editor 122:13	errors 41:12	excited 22:1,2
112:25 113:2	documents 13:2	124:12,15	especially 110:21	executive 84:12,21
112.23 113.2	25:15 28:5 29:8	editorial 121:22,24	112:5	exercise 121:22
113.44	23.13 20.3 27.0	Cuitorial 121.22,24	114.3	CACICISE 121.22
	•	-	•	-

Dr. Richard Carrier

122:1,23 124:21	42:12	first 4:2 9:11,18	frankly 13:6	120:21
exercises 123:12	fairly 69:3 107:13	11:17 37:21 44:6	fraternization 42:2	genre 40:3
exhibit 64:2,23 65:3	116:7 124:2	44:8,9,25 45:1,3	87:13,18,21 96:6	geographic 24:23
79:24 89:1	fallacy 48:3	56:8 76:21 86:13	99:4 119:11	geography 21:16
exhibited 121:24	falling 60:6 85:19	102:8 105:19	freaking 17:12	George 1:15 126:3
exhibits 65:8,19	falls 29:9	108:4 112:24	free 40:13,22 95:22	127:8
existed 9:2,7	false 40:10 42:24	122:5 126:7	Freethought 11:21	getting 56:17 71:2
existence 49:7	100:15 102:5	five 55:16	30:19 31:4,11	89:24 107:25
existence 45.7 existent 21:5	105:6	fixed 21:12,13	34:23 39:18 40:7	119:15
expect 5:3 92:25	falsehood 5:1	flirtation 10:18	40:11,12 42:8,10	ghost 70:4
expect 3.3 92.23 expectances 104:25	falsified 64:1	41:11	92:15,19,20 96:24	gigs 68:21 72:14
	familiar 31:23 123:8	flirtatious 10:16		
expense 28:4,15 108:5	famous 23:21 24:9	19:2	104:2 105:21	108:3 111:19
			121:17 122:16,25	girl 24:5 33:3 80:15
expenses 20:7,21	29:24	flirted 36:24	122:25 123:8,17	girlfriends 20:9
27:16 28:3,14	fan 76:18	Florida 22:21,22	123:18 124:24,25	58:12 59:9
29:6	fans 8:21,22	25:13 38:9	FREETHOUGH	give 5:10,17 9:24
expensive 115:24	far 16:8 34:19 39:3	focus 21:11	1:7	37:18 40:3 42:22
experience 69:7	43:3 93:24,25	focused 66:14	Freethoughtblogs	50:7 53:5 85:22
experiment 111:8	117:15 118:6	follows 4:4	122:6	given 44:19 47:9
expires 127:9	124:23	footnotes 8:8	freeze 8:18	54:1 68:24 94:21
explain 23:3 50:5	fascinated 45:9	footprint 102:22	frequently 68:22	107:20
98:15 107:15	fascinating 45:6	forced 31:7	friend 58:2	glad 118:20
112:20 124:8	fascination 41:11	foresee 95:17	friendly 10:16 19:2	Gmail 53:16
explained 97:12	fashion 64:17	Forest 82:19	friends 59:9,20,21	Gmails 53:18
exposing 103:25	February 127:3	form 8:4 28:16,22	60:10,16 91:4	go 13:3 15:18 18:14
express 90:1	federal 25:17	29:5 70:20 79:20	108:16	20:6 29:20 33:4
extent 94:22	federally 27:16	80:6 88:10 102:16	friendships 59:24	39:7 43:2 44:13
extraordinarily	feel 60:20 95:21	103:6 104:18	front 63:18	49:24 51:4,13
115:23	112:23	106:13	fuck 75:17 89:11	61:10 63:4 65:14
Extraordinary	fees 20:25 108:1	formal 62:24 63:1,5	fucking 37:8,10,15	65:21 68:25 69:5
112:22	fellow 11:20	63:6,11 119:1	fulfilling 27:6	72:10,19 74:15
extrapolating 77:2	feminism 112:6	formality 64:2	full 4:11 88:1	79:12 85:23 86:3
91:25 117:17	fewer 50:16	formally 77:22,25	full-time 26:10	92:10 98:6 103:24
extreme 4:21	fields 6:19	formed 123:14	full-timed 26:19	104:1
	fight 41:23 112:15	forming 120:15	function 32:23	God 88:17 89:24
F	113:9	Formulate 78:16	61:19	goes 10:2 33:3
F 44:20,24 85:16	fighting 27:16	forward 42:12	functional 56:22	122:13,15
97:25	figure 24:14 94:23	forwarded 53:18	fund 8:24	going 4:7 5:3 10:4
Facebook 30:10	106:3	forwards 53:2	funding 115:24	14:10 23:2 31:5
35:3 45:24 46:2,3	figures 120:20	found 86:14	fundraisers 13:13	42:11,21,25 43:1
46:7,12 47:17	file 27:12,14 28:1	Foundation 104:14	funny 21:1 36:20	50:8 63:22 72:13
48:8,20 57:22	63:23	110:8	further 18:21 19:4	75:19 76:13,14,16
70:17 92:2 94:5	filed 27:25 63:24	four 55:16,20 76:6	50:15 123:3	86:7,20 94:14
110:16 117:8	65:19 92:12 96:14	fraction 103:22	126:13	95:1 98:12 103:13
fact 28:23 44:19	filing 88:9	frame 116:5,9,11	future 82:15 112:18	113:6 116:8
47:6,24 49:9 52:1	final 88:5	117:2		good 5:17 6:3 22:6
68:17 71:12 91:24	financial 107:19	Frank 1:9 46:7	G	22:22 25:7 52:11
94:5,8 99:1 116:9	115:5,8	76:25 78:2 83:10	gang 88:15,17 89:23	56:2 70:16 91:4
122:17	financials 102:18	83:13,14 90:8	89:24	102:19
factoring 120:3	find 13:3,7 24:8,24	91:10 94:4 105:24	garnered 57:8	Google 13:6 31:10
facts 47:9 98:17	31:12 47:7 49:25	114:13	gas 112:23	31:19 48:23 49:2
117:11,12,13	62:5,6 71:19	Frank's 40:4 76:20	gender 26:13	50:4,4,6 54:5,10
factual 98:6 99:6,9	113:5	109:11	general 8:5 40:3	54:19 55:5 62:24
factually 35:20	fine 60:22 65:5	Frank-Skiba 14:6	121:2	63:5
98:15 116:6	finished 8:15 10:5	94:3 100:2 107:4	generally 56:8 81:4	Googled 62:21
failed 110:20	Firefox 50:24	Frank-Skiba's	94:17	Googling 49:1
fair 31:6 39:20	firm 126:16	99:19	generated 49:16	Gosh 11:16
IGH 31.0 37.20	11111120.10	//.1/	Scholator T7.10	JUDII 11.10

Dr. Richard Carrier

	I	l	I	l
gotcha 15:6 59:5	head 12:16 120:15	119:23,24,25	Indirect 118:6	IRS 29:8
graduate 6:12	120:19,20	hunger 60:17	individual 32:20	Island 7:19 38:25
grant 8:23	headquarters 66:1	hunting 22:18	119:18	issue 29:22 83:15
great 37:16 74:14	66:22 69:11	husband 82:2	individuals 103:1	95:19 118:19
Greco-Roman 6:17	healthy 6:5	Hyatt 80:14	industry 121:16	121:19 122:17,24
Greta 108:17	heard 24:6 101:17	hypocrite 112:8	influence 5:21	issued 40:17 123:23
ground 22:18	hearing 22:1		influential 104:3,17	issues 87:19 93:2
group 3:8 83:3 85:8	Heina 89:3,15,16	I	informally 45:12	98:6 122:15
108:16	held 11:4 103:2	iCloud 52:24 53:15	information 42:22	italics 80:4
groups 21:24 69:5	helped 76:25	iCloud.com 53:25	51:16 56:14 75:2	
75:13,15,17	helpful 41:19	idea 8:20 11:12	77:8 92:6 93:10	J
growing 30:13	hereinafter 4:3	33:10 41:21 56:7	95:15 96:15,15	J 3:9
Guam 58:4	hereunto 127:1	71:11 86:21	99:2 119:15	January 1:18 72:9
Guard 6:23 7:19	hey 28:11 33:19	116:24	informed 108:18	72:10
guess 5:11 23:5,21	hide 56:12,13	ideas 45:7	informing 92:19	Jeffrey 3:4
23:25 36:24 47:4	hierarchy 124:5	identified 44:18	initiated 82:23	Jersey 7:11
68:17 82:7 116:10	high 51:25	ignominy 109:16	innate 52:17 54:6	Jesus 8:25
118:3 121:4	higher 21:17	image 23:18	inside 37:15	Jetpack 31:21
guy 49:16 118:12	highlight 95:22	imagine 36:13	insisted 42:16	119:17
guys 41:20	highly 21:15 56:11	iMail 52:17 53:8	instance 85:6 124:4	job 10:5
	hire 22:3 37:19	immediately 45:17	instructions 63:8	joined 123:25
H	112:10,18	73:2 120:17	insulted 112:7	journal 9:4 13:5
H 7:24	hired 107:22	immensely 85:12	insults 112:4	judges 21:1
habit 64:12	hires 8:18	impact 76:24	intellectual 6:15	jump 98:12
hack 32:15,22	hiring 111:22	impacted 25:21	intelligence 7:12	jumped 11:6
hacking 56:18	historian 56:9	implicate 28:8	intelligent 31:24	June 26:22 27:1
half 68:15 69:9	historicity 8:25 9:1	impression 39:19	intend 94:25	35:12 64:6 76:22
108:4,7	history 6:11,14,15	in-person 15:16	intending 76:10	79:23 80:15 91:9
Hall 12:6	6:17 56:20,21,23	107:24	intent 95:16 118:21	92:17 105:18
hand 4:11 127:2	hit 76:18,22 117:23	inaccuracies 99:6,9	intentions 108:21	jurisdictional 93:2
handful 76:4	122:12	inaccurate 43:24	interaction 43:11	justice 112:6
Handies 15:7,9	hits 30:15 32:1 50:6	inaccurately 98:18	44:19 45:19	justifies 79:2
handle 98:8	119:18,20	98:19	interactions 45:5	
hang 37:20	hitting 24:5 96:1,5	inauthentic 65:10	interest 43:17	K
hanging 58:12 98:5	hob 72:25 76:9	incident 17:22	111:22	K 7:25
happen 5:4 73:3	hold 63:1 72:17	43:20 44:5 84:24	interested 22:1,6	keep 13:5 20:5 50:7
112:13	hole 85:20	85:17 90:25 98:23	37:2 82:14 126:15	52:6,8 54:2 81:22
happened 18:5 36:5	home 26:12,14 33:3	101:7,18	interesting 45:7	115:24
40:8 55:12,16,19	111:18 116:2	incidents 101:9,15	interjecting 79:7	keeps 113:19
81:7,9,20,24	homemaker 26:10	include 49:10	Internet 27:11	kept 17:14
97:10	honestly 54:25	included 40:2 47:2	61:11,17,18,25	kicked 123:18
happening 52:7,9	55:19 56:25	49:11 89:21	121:1,6	kind 8:9 15:23,25
69:19 108:11	Honorable 7:2	including 48:14	interpreting 121:15	21:5 22:1 24:7
happens 69:18 71:5	hoping 72:18	income 20:18,19	interrogation 4:20	31:22 33:13 36:22
122:10	hopped 15:19	21:12 25:17 26:12	introduce 118:20	98:4 110:1 112:4
happy 22:17	hot 33:3	27:12,15,15 28:2	invasive 33:13 51:7	117:1,5
harasser 112:4	hotel 12:15	29:11 37:23	investigation 31:6	knew 11:20,23 32:5
harassing 35:17	hour 21:2,4 45:13	102:11	39:20 42:17 74:25	57:24 92:12
harassment 40:10	97:5	incorrectly 68:3	96:25	105:24 106:1,2,3
78:3,12 97:21,23	hours 45:13 97:4,5	independent 20:4	involved 123:16	106:7 107:6 108:4
99:17,24 100:13	house 26:15 82:19	31:2 71:10	involved 123.16	108:4 110:5,13
100:16	huge 40:25 81:23	independently	90:25	Knights 12:6
hard 113:2 120:20	humanities 8:18	53:13	iOS 54:6	knob 72:25 76:9
harm 52:3 56:15	humor 118:20	indicate 64:20 88:7	IP 30:25 31:9,25	knot 21:5
Harriet 26:13	hundred 30:9,23	indicated 37:1	32:1,5,13,16,20	know 4:23 5:9,9,11
hate 113:6	37:3 47:11 102:18	indicates 64:21	51:3,8 117:23,25	6:2,2 8:12 11:18
Hawkins 83:4	102:25 119:12,21	indication 64:25	119:21 120:3	13:12,16,21,23,25
Hawkins 65:4	102.23 119:12,21	muication 04:25	119.21 120:3	13.12,10,21,23,23

Dr. Richard Carrier

	_	_	_	_
15:11 16:9,10	longoot 24:11 25:1	link 50:12	112:23	124:11
	largest 34:11 35:1			
17:1 20:24 21:22	71:22	linked 54:8	lot 20:10 22:4,13	means 4:23 6:17
22:16,24 26:8	Las 3:11	links 50:7,11	30:15 45:6 49:16	7:25 9:22 50:15
28:20 30:21 31:25	late 67:20	list 12:25 39:8 57:10	67:7 69:2 70:3	63:14 80:21 94:8
32:4 33:1,2,7 34:3	Lateigra 3:10	79:13,25,25 80:18	72:17 75:1 95:2	94:11 117:20
34:19,25 35:11	laundry 26:16	listen 112:3	112:5 113:6	meant 22:25 79:14
36:20 37:7 38:21	Lauren 1:9 10:9	literary 45:8	121:23	84:10
39:3,4,5,8,9,11	14:3,11,18 15:1	litigate 115:4,11,20	Louis 14:17	measure 23:24 24:2
43:3,6 44:5 46:4	76:23	litigation 115:2	low 20:5,7	medication 5:22
46:10,17 47:6	law 3:4,8,10 8:10,14	little 4:9 18:2 33:25	lower 20:21 21:18	meet 33:3 70:19
48:19 49:7 51:22	118:8	85:13 114:14	LSD 5:18	73:22 75:19,20
52:1,8,10,11	lawful 4:2	live 19:10 20:3	lunch 41:20	76:1
57:17,19 58:1,4	lawsuit 95:12	57:17,19 62:2	lying 8:15 34:4 36:3	meeting 10:12 22:3
59:22 60:13 61:23	106:21	122:15		67:1,6 72:19
61:24 62:1,4,6,17	lawyer 20:17 92:25	lived 14:14,16 57:24	M	73:19,22 76:8,9
63:24 70:9 71:14	93:1,3,12,14,21	58:1 62:18 97:8	Mac 50:17,19,20,21	77:16
71:21,23,24 73:12	97:14 98:3 116:8	livelihood 107:16	mad 122:21	meetings 15:16
73:16 75:13 76:12	116:13,22	lives 13:21 14:15	mail 53:25	16:22 68:4 72:12
77:20 78:5,9,16	lawyers 88:9 116:1	living 20:7,15,18,21	mailed 114:21	72:20 73:3 75:12
79:14 81:13 82:9	116:3,7,12,24	25:9 58:10,11	main 54:3	76:10 80:23 81:1
86:8,15,18 89:6	lax 121:25	82:19 102:15	Maine 49:14	Mel 118:11,18
90:14,17 91:23	leader 104:20	110:6,14	major 20:10	member 86:12
•			majority 121:8	members 108:23
92:8 95:19,20	leadership 109:22	LLC 1:17 3:3		
98:13 101:14,22	learn 63:7	local 69:11	making 41:10 49:12	111:20
102:12 103:2,12	lease 27:5	location 31:13 32:24	male 78:14,14	men 83:9,18
105:7,12,17,20	leather 24:7	38:20 39:16 93:11	management 110:1	mental 25:1
106:1,21 107:5,8	leave 19:19 61:21	locations 12:11	managerial 124:5	mentioned 45:23
107:10 110:5,13	83:16	38:22 95:16	manner 126:14	82:11 94:14
115:22 116:3,18	leaving 34:22	log 54:17,23 55:4,15	map 25:1	103:20
117:3,20 119:2,22	lecturer 23:17	63:15,17 122:5	Marc 3:9	message 54:13
120:7 123:10	led 17:22	Logan 67:22,23	margin 37:15	70:18
124:23,23 125:1	left 7:6 53:23 61:25	68:8,10	Marie 57:22 60:8	met 10:8 11:1,13,17
knowing 93:25	81:23 92:22 98:4	logged 32:6 54:21	108:18	11:22 14:9
knowledge 13:15	legal 27:16 28:3,14	55:5	market 8:5 35:10	meta 61:24
19:7 27:10 30:1	71:11 98:25	logging 55:7,8	102:12,13,22	methods 54:15
47:9 50:5 99:21	lessons 37:18	logical 48:3	103:1,22,23	Metskas 58:19 73:8
100:1,3,8,11,19	let's 5:14 6:9 9:9,10	lonely 8:10,13	marriage 18:2	73:16 84:18
101:6,12,20	10:21 15:18 18:14	long 6:24 57:1 58:18	married 74:4 84:19	mid 69:7 106:25
106:10 107:11,13	23:23 24:4,4	104:25 106:15	master 6:13,13	midst 18:5 45:14
known 29:21 30:5,6	44:13 60:10 65:14	109:3	material 49:16	military 6:21,22
58:18,22 72:2	98:9 104:2	longer 20:3 106:17	77:12	7:15
92:1 107:1,2	letter 92:25 93:4,6	109:25 111:12	materials 49:10	million 104:8
110:2,9	93:12,14,21	look 21:1,3 32:25	96:14	mine 20:24 50:22
knows 74:7	113:15,18 114:12	33:5,19 34:5 39:7	math 34:14 120:12	58:2
	114:16,19	49:20 51:7 62:12	120:15,17	Minnesota 13:22
L	letters 93:9 97:14	64:3 104:21	mathematician	14:2
label 79:3	113:24 114:2,8	120:21	120:18	minor 6:11 90:6
Lane 1:9 10:9 14:3	licenses 38:3	looked 31:1 33:6	matter 21:8 34:15	minus 38:13
14:11,19 15:1,19	licensing 66:19	34:10,13 39:16	41:11 55:24	minutes 37:21
16:18 76:23 92:24	lies 113:11	72:4 92:1	115:10	misconduct 95:25
93:4 94:2 100:7	life 17:9,23 52:3,4	looking 30:22 33:18	mean 4:25 6:16	123:19
100:14 106:6,7	lifestyle 18:4,4	40:14 43:22 46:12	13:10 16:21 22:12	misread 41:10
107:2 113:19			37:2 39:13 46:9	
	lighted 112:23	48:11 49:19 50:1		Mississippi 22:17
114:15,18 115:1	liked 45:11 57:22	50:13 94:10,11	50:3 51:11 59:3,7	Missouri 12:8 14:5
Lane's 100:23	likes 88:17	110:21	63:17 67:4,7 68:9	14:11
large 71:25	line 5:6 20:23 21:5	looks 32:17 79:25	71:7 77:25 79:3,5	mistake 26:22
larger 103:9	99:8 101:5	lost 59:25 67:11	79:11 89:6 117:16	misunderstood
	I	I	I	I

Dr. Richard Carrier

months 55:20 95:11 necessary 18:22 need 20:4 24:19 102:16 objected 64:1 objected 64:1 Ohioan 93:17 okay 4:10 5:3 10:12 19:11 19:14:122 5:25 Owners 108:17 okay 4:10 5:3 10:12 19:14 19:25:2 Owners 108:17 okay 4:10 5:3 10:12 19:14 19:13 19:14 19:25:2 Owners 108:17 okay 4:10 5:3 10:12 19:14 19:14 19:13 19:14 19:14 19:13 19:14 19:13 19:14 19:13 19:14 19:13 19:14 19:13 19:14 19:13 19:14 19:13 19:14 19:13 19:14 19:13 19:14 19:13 19:14 10:14 19:14 10:15 10:14 19:14 10:15 10:14 19:14 10:15 10:14 19:14					_
mocked 112:5.7 90:11.14 noticing 47:22 57:20.25 88:1.9 1044 106:5 Mogilevsky 57:22 60:8 108:18 77:13.15:20 notify 70:9 1044 106:5 1044 106:5 mome of 03:2 93:16 108:8 66:15;19 67:10 48:14 66:01 06:23,91;1425 57:20,25 88:1.9 66:9,14,15,20,22 72:215 75:16 112:12,14 organizations 21:22 72:215 75:16 12:12,15 12:12,14 organizations 21:22 72:215 75:16 12:21 10:3 103:21,14 organizations 21:22 72:215 75:16 107:22 110:3 111:5,19,21 112:14 organizations 21:24 organizations 21:24 117:21,14 organizations 21:24 organizations 21:24 107:22 110:3 104:41,18 104:42,31 103:24 104:42,31 111:5,19,20 107:12,17,19 outside 30:14 organizations 21:24 117:15 10:14 117:15 10:14 117:15 10:14 117:15 10:14 117:15 10:14 117:15 10:14 117:15 10:14 117:15 10:14 117:15 10:14 117:15 10:14 117:15 10:14	42.14.15	nomed 62:14 90:1	noticed 46:10	20.22 20.2 20.6 0	71.14 74.12 92.22
mames 57:12 60:1					
608.108.18 moment 632.93.16 nomement 632.93.17 nomement 18.11 nomement 19.15 noved 11.21.92.11 nomement 18.11 nomement 18.15 noved 11.21.92.11 nomement 61.62.5 noted 11.51 noved 11.21.92.11 noved 11.21.92.11 nomement 61.62.5 noted 11.51 noved 11.21.92.13 nomement 19.31.92.14.92.13 nomement 19.31.92.14 noved 11.21.92.13 noved 11.21.92.1	*	*	_		
moment 63:2 93:16 108:8 108:8 108:8 108:8 108:8 108:8 108:2 108:2 108:2 108:2 108:2 108:2 108:2 108:2 108:3					
108:8 66:15,19 67:10 68:22 69:117:11.4 68:22 49:15 52:20 93:19 94:1 96:12 107:22 110:3					
money 20:13 25:8 monitoring 54:2 82:3 monogamous 17:10 monogampy 17:25 monogamp 18:3 month 27:5 120:1 month 27:5 120:1 month 55:20 95:11 month 39:11 more 20:4 24:12 month 113:10 more 113:10 month 39:11 move 34:18 45:24 month 39:11 move 34:18 45:24 month 113:10 month 21:21 move 34:18 45:24 monogamp 17:25 move 34:18 45:24 monogamp 17:25 move 34:18 45:24 monogamp 18:21 move 34:18 45:24 monogamp 19:10 move 11:21 19:21 move 34:18 45:24 monogamp 19:10 move 11:21 19:21 move 34:18 45:24 move 41:12 19:21 move 14:15 19:3 move 41:12 19:21 move 14:15					
monitoring 54:2 monogamous 17:10 monogamy 17:25 monogamy 17:25 monotagemy 17:26 monotagemy 17:26 monotagemy 17:26 monotagemy 17:26 monotagemy 17:26 montagemy 17:26 montagemy 17:26 montagemy 17:26 montagemy 18:22 monotagemy 17:26 montagemy 17:26 montagemy 18:22 monotagemy 18:22		T			
82:3					
monogamous 17:10 monogamy 17:25 monograph 8:8 Montrana 34:3 Montrana 34:3 month 27:5 120:1 mear 20:9 28:12 47:11 secsary 18:22 need 20:4 24:19 morning 6:1 82:21 mording 6:1 82:21 13:11 13:10 motion 11:3:10 motion 11:3:10 motion 13:10 motion 13:10 motion 13:10 motion 13:10 motion 13:10 motion 14:11 p.22 12:18 newed 45:21 40:82.4 79:16 95:2 118 should be shown 49:12 62:8 monthains 39:1 19:23 62:22 92:11 30:12,15 19:20 19:23 62:22 92:11 30:12,15 19:20 19:23 62:22 92:11 30:18 119:23 62:22 92:11 30:18 119:23 62:22 92:11 30:18 111:33:8 119:23 62:22 92:11 30:18 111:33:8 119:33:8 10:18:11 movie 118:11 movie 12:22 33:12 84:24 83:19 nonmonogamous 17:20 more 34:18 63:19 10:24 56:620 68:6 11:31 15:31:45 419 56:620 68:6 11:31 15:31:45 419 56:620 68:6 11:32 12:31 38:24 100:71 02:22 22:3					
Montana 34:3 MONTGOMERY 126:2 month 27:5 120:1 meces arry 18:22 47:11 meces arry 18:22 102:16 moths 55:20 95:11 33:23 36:22 51:13 33:23 36:22 51:13 33:23 36:22 51:13 35:11 12:24 morning 6:1 82:21 morning 6:1 82:21 33:23 36:22 51:13 35:11 12:24 morning 6:1 82:21 morning 6:1 82:21 33:23 36:22 51:13 35:11 56:82! fooling 11:3:10 motions 49:12 6:28 motion 11:3:10 motions 49:12 6:28 motion 11:3:10 motions 49:12 6:28 108:21,24 109:3.5 110:20,22 117:15 move 34:18 45:24 megotiations 11:7 Now 24:18 45:24 megotiations 11:7 Now 24:18 45:24 metwork ir 73:4:23 network ir 73:4:24					
monograph 8.8 matural 7:25 nature 25:6 46:15 month 275 120:1 month 275 120:1 months 55:20 95:11 ps:11 12:24 morth 275 120:1 morth 255:20 95:11 ps:11 12:24 morth 275 120:1 morth 255:20 95:11 morth 255:20 95:11 ps:11 12:24 morth 275 120:1 morth 255:20 95:11 morth 255:20 95:11 ps:11 12:24 morth 255:20 95:11 morth 255:20 95:11 ps:11 12:24 morth 255:20 95:11 mor			numerous 107:21		
mature 25:6 46:15 99:11 colock 1:19 125:12 colock 1:19 125:12 month 27:5 120:1 morths 55:20 95:11 operations 49:12 24 morthing 6:1 82:21 morthing 6:1 82:21 33:23 36:22 51:13 51:16 58:21 60:18 doi:10.8 motion 113:10 motion 113:10 motion 39:1 20:28 motion 39:1 move 34:18 45:24 motions 49:12 62:8 motions 49:12 62:8 motion 113:10 motions 49:12 62:8 motion 39:1 move 34:18 45:24 megotiations 111:7 Nell 60:5 moved 11:21 19:21 move 34:18 45:24 megotiations 111:7 Nell 60:5 moved 11:21 19:21 move 34:18 45:24 megotiations 111:7 Nell 60:5 moved 11:21 19:21 move 34:18 13:18 moved 11:21 19:21 move 34:18 13:18 moved 11:21 19:21 move 34:18 45:24 megotiations 111:7 Nell 60:5 moved 11:21 19:21 move 34:18 45:24 megotiations 111:7 Nell 60:5 moved 11:21 19:21 mover 11:21 mover 11:21 mover 11:21 mover 11:31:1 mover 14:4 31:1 33:8 56:16 mose work 14:15 mover 11:4 11:1 33:14 54:19 mover 11:5 108:4 mo					
MONTGOMERY 126:2 126:2 127:3 127:3					outraged 58:17
126:2 month 27:5 120:1 more are 20:9 28:12 47:11 more signed 20:4 24:19 more signed 52:24 24:19 33:23 36:22 51:13 51:16 58:21 60:18 motions 49:12 62:8 motions 49:12 62:8 motions 49:12 62:8 mountains 39:1 move 34:18 45:24 med 64:1		nature 25:6 46:15			outside 39:14
month D7:5 120:1 d7:11 cecessary 18:22 d2:14,79 88:10 Ohio-related 11:1:15 owned 12:3:15 Owners 108:17 Owners 108:18 Own	MONTGOMERY	99:11		117:15 126:1,4	overhead 20:5
months 55:20 95:11 95:11 112:24 need 20:4 24:19 norning 6:1 82:21 morning 6:1 82:21 morning 6:1 82:21 MOS 7:3.5 motion 113:10	126:2	near 20:9 28:12	object 28:13,16,22	127:2,8	owing 27:16
95:11 112:24 need 20:4 24:19 33:23 36:22 51:13 objected 64:1 Objection 28:11 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:22 68:21 19:1 41:22 68:21 19:1 41:28 61:20 107:11 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:28 61:20 107:11 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:28 61:20 107:11 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:28 61:20 107:11 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:28 61:20 107:11 19:1 41:22 58:21 19:1 41:28 61:20 107:11 19:1 41:29 58:21 108:14 108:14 109:23 56:16 108:16 11:13	month 27:5 120:1	47:11	42:1,7,9 88:10	Ohio-related 111:15	owned 123:15
morning 6:1 82:21 33:23 36:22 51:13 51:16 58:21 60:18 51:16 58:21 60:18 51:16 58:21 60:18 110:8 motion 113:10 motions 49:12 62:8 mountains 39:1 meve 43:14 45:24 109:35 neither 35:8,21 10:20;21 117:15 move 34:18 45:24 109:35 neither 35:8,21 network 17:3 4:23 71:22:10 108:21,24 109:35 neither 35:8,21 network 17:3 4:23 71:225 104:3,6 rocesion 11:24 19:23 26:22 29:21 network 17:3 4:23 rocesions 16:23 rocesions 16:23 rocesions 11:24 soline 15:14,15 rocesions 16:23 rocesions 16:23 rolline 15:14,15 rocesions 16:23 rolline 15:14,15 rolline 15:14,15 rolline 15:14,15 rolline 19:13 rocesions 16:23 rolline 15:14,15 rolline 19:13 rolline 15:14,15 roll	months 55:20 95:11	necessary 18:22	102:16	Ohioan 93:17	Owners 108:17
morning 6:1 82:21 33:23 36:22 51:13 51:16 58:21 60:18 51:16 58:21 60:18 51:16 58:21 60:18 110:8 motion 113:10 motions 49:12 62:8 mountains 39:1 meve 43:14 45:24 109:35 neither 35:8,21 10:20;21 117:15 move 34:18 45:24 109:35 neither 35:8,21 network 17:3 4:23 71:22:10 108:21,24 109:35 neither 35:8,21 network 17:3 4:23 71:225 104:3,6 rocesion 11:24 19:23 26:22 29:21 network 17:3 4:23 rocesions 16:23 rocesions 16:23 rocesions 11:24 soline 15:14,15 rocesions 16:23 rocesions 16:23 rolline 15:14,15 rocesions 16:23 rolline 15:14,15 rolline 15:14,15 rolline 15:14,15 rolline 19:13 rocesions 16:23 rolline 15:14,15 rolline 19:13 rolline 15:14,15 roll	95:11 112:24		objected 64:1	okay 4:10 5:3 10:12	ownership 88:1
MOS 7:3.5	morning 6:1 82:21				
motion 113:10 63:24 79:16 95:2 121:18 objections 83:16 objections 83:16 objections 83:13 once 26:20 49:11 odd 55:13 once 46:12 odd 56:13 once 40:2 54:16 once 46:12 odd 45:15 once 46:12 odd 45:13 once 46:12 odd 45:14 once 46:16 once 11:13 odd 55:13 once 46:12 odd 45:14 once 46:14 once 41:14:15 odd 55:13 once 46:12 odd 45:14 once 46:14 once 41:14:15 odd 55:13 once 46:12 odd 45:14 once 46:14 once 41:14:15 odd 55:13 once 46:12 odd 45:14 once 46:14 once 41:14:15 odd 55:13 once 46:12 odd 45:14 once 46:14 once 41:14:15 odd 55:13 once 46:12 odd 45:14 once 46:14 once 41:14:15:15 odd 45:14:15 once 46:14 once 41:14:15:15 odd 47:11 odd 55:13 once 46:12 odd 47:11 odd 55	MOS 7:3,5				
motions 49:12 62:8 122:18 objections 83:16 objections 63:24 objections 83:16			· ·		P
mountains 39:1 needed 52:14 obscure 8:7 46:19 once 26:20 49:11 p.m 125:12 108:12,15,19,20 108:21,24 109:3,5 neither 35:8,21 obvious 69:24 obvious 69:24 obvious 69:24 obvious 95:25 network 1:7 34:23 page 2:1 507.8,88 noved 11:21 19:21 72:25 104:3,6 networking 72:14 occasion 11:24 108:19,19 32:18,19 64:14 108:19,19 32:18,19 64:14 108:19,19 32:18,19 64:14 117:8 page 2:1 507.8,88 36:12,17,18 63:9 79:23 80:13 94:5 50:15 networking 72:14 32:18,19 64:14 108:16 117:8 neget 15:07,8,88 36:18,24 39:16 networking 72:14 32:18,19 64:14 108:16 17:8 neget 2:1 507.8,88 36:13 94:5 50:15 networking 72:14 32:18,19 64:14 32:18,19 64:14 108:16 17:8 neget 34:24 50:5,8 50:15 networking 72:14 32:18,19 64:14 32:18,19 64:14 90:00 90:0			objections 83:16		P 7:24
move 34:18 45:24 108:12,15,19,20 108:21,24 109:35 110:20,22 117:15 moved 11:21 19:21 19:23 26:22 29:21 30:1 83:12 92:1 92:14 97:4 108:6 108:8,9,19 moves 14:15 movie 118:11 moving 46:16,25 96:11 101:5 108:4 108:14 41:1 53:14 54:19 56:6,20 68:6 97:11 672:4 74:12 108:14 Muirfield 1:17 3:5 multiple 9:3 30:7 38:6 55:12,23 61:15 120:3,11 Myers 1:8 9:15 11:3,17 13:19 14:23 42:11 92:13 92:16,18 96:11,21 102:7 105:22,23 107:9 122:16 Normally 39:6 92:20, North 21:24 38:19 nore 64:16 note size 17:18 47:22 obvious 69:24 obvious 9:24 56:616 0ccasion 11:24 32:18,19 64:14 occasions 16:23 51:1 52:15 occupation 10:4 118:12 occur 33:25 occur 497:25 100:6,22 0dis 47:11 off-the-record 18:15 23:9 44:14 65:15 65:23 84:3 90:22 95:5 offland 96:13 0ffice 66:15 74:9,10 113:21 0fficer 70:20 moss 40:2 54:16 33:19 103:9 79:23 80:13 94:5 108:16 0roline 15:14,15 82:1,5,12 122:5 0pened 38:24,25 39:5 70:7 0penly 17:18 36:24 83:11 0perates 70:21 part-timing 26:18 participated 11:8 participated 11:9 participated 11:8 participated 11:9 participated 11:8					
108:12,15,19,20 108:21,24 109:3.5 101:02,02 117:15 network 1:7 34:23 network 1:7 34:23 56:16 moved 11:21 19:21 19:23 26:22 29:21 30:1 83:12 92:1 92:14 97:4 108:6 networking 72:14 Nevada 3:11 never 14:4 31:1 33:8 32:18,19 64:14 occasions 16:23 occupation 10:4 32:18,19 64:14 occasions 16:23 online 15:14,15 occupation 10:4 occupation 10:4 occupation 10:4 occupation 10:4 occurred 97:25 online 15:14,15 occupation 10:4 occurred 97:25 opened 38:24,25 opened 38:34:3 opened 38:4 opened 38:24,25 opened 38					
108:21,24 109:3,5 110:20,22 117:15 network 1:7 34:23 72:25 104:3,6 network 1:24 32:18,19 64:14 network 1:24 32:18,19 64:14 network 1:24 32:18,19 64:14 network 1:24 32:18,19 64:14 network 1:24 network 1:23 36:18,24 39:16 network 1:24 network 1:25 network 1:23 36:18,24 39:16 network 1:24 network 1:23 36:18,24 39:16 network 1:24 network 1:24 network 1:24 network 1:23 network 1:25			==		
110:20,22 117:15 metwork 1:7 34:23 72:25 104:3,6 occasion 11:24 19:23 26:22 29:21 30:1 83:12 92:1 Poccasion 13:8,19 64:14 Occasion 16:23 Sil. 1 Poccasion 16:23 Sil. 1 Occasion 16:23 Online 15:14,15 Sil. 15:15 Sil. 15:14 Sil. 15:15 Sil. 15:15 Sil. 15:15 Sil. 15:14 Sil. 15:15 Sil. 15:15 Sil. 15:14 Sil. 15:15 Sil. 15:15 Sil. 15:15 Sil. 15:14 Sil. 15:15 Sil. 15:15 Sil. 15:14 Sil. 15:15 Sil. 15:14 Sil. 15:15					
moved 1:21 19:21 72:25 104:3,6 occasion 11:24 108:16 117:8 pages 49:24 50:5,8 30:1 83:12 92:1 90:14 97:4 108:6 newer 14:4 31:1 33:8 51:1 52:15 occasions 16:23 online 15:14,15 50:15 pages 49:24 50:5,8 50:15 pages 49:			-		
19:23 26:22 29:21 30:1 83:12 92:1 92:14 97:4 108:6					
30:1 83:12 92:1 Nevada 3:11 occasions 16:23 online 15:14,15 50:15 paid 27:22 40:12 92:14 97:4 108:6 34:9 35:22 36:5 34:9 35:22 36:5 occupation 10:4 88:14,21 95:25 9eid 27:22 40:12 41:1 71:7 movie 118:11 41:1 53:14 54:19 occup 33:25 opend 38:24,25 painful 113:12 paper 65:4 111:10					
92:14 97:4 108:6 108:8,9,19 moves 14:15 movie 118:11 moving 46:16,25 96:11 101:5 108:4 108:14 Muirfield 1:17 3:5 multiple 9:3 30:7 38:6 55:12,23 61:15 120:3,11 Myers 1:8 9:15 11:13,17 13:19 14:23 42:11 92:13 92:16,18 96:11,21 102:7 105:22,23 107:9 122:16 N N			· ·		
108:8,9,19 34:9 35:22 36:5 36:18,24 39:16 118:12 occur 33:25 occured 97:25 opened 38:24,25 opened 38:24					
moves 14:15 36:18,24 39:16 118:12 82:1,5,12 122:5 painful 113:12 paper 65:4 111:10 paper 65:4 111:10 paranoid 35:23 part 26:9 103:3 121:19 123:14 paper 65:4 111:10 paranoid 35:23 part 26:9 103:3 121:19 123:14 paranoid 35:23 part 26:9 103:3 121:19 123:14 paranoid 35:23 part 26:9 103:3 121:19 123:14 part 26:18 part 26:9 103:3 121:19 123:14 part 26:9 103:3 121:19 123:14 part 26:9 103:3 121:19 123:14 part 26:18					
movie 118:11 41:1 53:14 54:19 occur 33:25 opened 38:24,25 39:5 70:7 paper 65:4 111:10 paranoid 35:23 paranoid 35			_		
moving 46:16,25 56:6,20 68:6 occurred 97:25 39:5 70:7 paranoid 35:23 96:11 101:5 108:4 71:16 72:4 74:12 84:8,10 119:1,3,5 100:6,22 openly 17:18 36:24 part 26:9 103:3 Muirfield 1:17 3:5 119:7,7 new 7:11 31:12 23:9 44:14 65:15 0perates 70:21 part-timing 26:18 38:6 55:12,23 38:24 night 5:19 6:3 83:2 95:5 operators 108:17 participate 83:24 Myers 1:8 9:15 Non 75:16 nonevent 110:19 office 66:15 74:9,10 opportunities 73:2 particular 5:115 11:13,17 13:19 nonevent 110:19 nonmeligious 38:4 113:21 opportunities 73:2 particularly 6:18 92:16,18 96:11,21 17:21 officer 7:6 74:20 107:25 111:15 opposite 69:8 opposite 6					
96:11 101:5 108:4 108:14 Muirfield 1:17 3:5 multiple 9:3 30:7 38:6 55:12,23 61:15 120:3,11 Myers 1:8 9:15 11:13,17 13:19 14:23 42:11 92:13 92:16,18 96:11,21 102:7 105:22,23 107:9 122:16 Nornally 39:6 92:20 North 21:24 38:19 northern 98:1 North 21:24 38:19 northern 98:1 Notary 1:16 126:3 name 12:3 18:12,19 18:21 44:68,9,11 44:19 46:11 47:19 48:10 49:5 62:21 62:22 84:17 86:11 100:6,22 odds 47:11 off-the-record 18:15 23:9 44:14 65:15 65:23 84:3 90:22 95:5 offical 96:13 06:62:1 07 09enly 17:18 36:24 83:11 0perates 70:21 124:10 0perators 108:17 0pinion 29:5 68:17 74:16 0pportunities 73:2 107:25 111:15 0pposite 69:8 0ppression 21:25 0ptimize 63:13 0rbit 1:8 11:21 0patro 40:14 part 26:9 103:3 121:19 123:14 participate 83:24 participate 83:24 participate 83:24 participate 83:24 participate 61:8 participate 83:24 participate 65:18 participate 61:8 participate 83:24 participate 61:8 participate 83:24 participate 11:8 participate 11:8 participate 83:24 participate 11:8 participate 11:8 participate 83:24 participate 11:8 participate 83:24 participate 11:8 participate 83:24 participate 13:15 partic					
108:14 84:8,10 119:1,3,5 odds 47:11 83:11 121:19 123:14 Muirfield 1:17 3:5 multiple 9:3 30:7 new 7:11 31:12 38:6 55:12,23 61:15 120:3,11 Myers 1:8 9:15 Non 75:16 office 66:15 74:9,10 office 66:15 74:9,10 poportune 17:15 particular 51:15 particular 51:15 particularly 6:18 Myers 1:8 9:15 Non 75:16 nonevent 110:19 office 66:15 74:9,10 opportune 17:15 particular 51:15 particularly 6:18 102:7 105:22,23 norreligious 38:4 Normally 39:6 officer 7:6 74:20 Dificers 71:1 opposite 69:8 optimize 63:13 10:18 12:		•			
Muirfield 1:17 3:5 Il19:7,7 new 7:11 31:12 off-the-record 18:15 23:9 44:14 65:15 65:23 84:3 90:22 95:5 operates 70:21 124:10 participate 83:24 participate					
multiple 9:3 30:7 new 7:11 31:12 23:9 44:14 65:15 124:10 participate 83:24 38:6 55:12,23 38:24 65:23 84:3 90:22 operators 108:17 participate 83:24 Myers 1:8 9:15 night 5:19 6:3 83:2 95:5 opinion 29:5 68:17 participate 83:24 Myers 1:8 9:15 nonevent 110:19 office 66:15 74:9,10 opportune 17:15 participate 83:24 11:13,17 13:19 nonevent 110:19 office 66:15 74:9,10 opportune 17:15 particular 51:15 12:1 nonmonogamous 111:9 127:2 opportunities 73:2 d6:13 71:24 102:7 105:22,23 nonreligious 38:4 113:21 opposite 69:8 particular 51:15 102:7 105:22,23 nonreligious 38:4 113:21 opposite 69:8 oppression 21:25 107:9 122:16 92:20 North 21:24 38:19 officers 71:1 opposite 69:8 oppression 21:25 108:23 18:12,19 northern 98:1 Notary 1:16 126:3 112:2 obsc:11 102:1 104:9 108:23 123:9,12 pay 40:11,21 41:3 108:24 28:14 109:25 68:17 100:25 11:8 100:11:8 13:1 particular 51:15					
38:6 55:12,23 38:24 65:23 84:3 90:22 operators 108:17 participated 11:8 Myers 1:8 9:15 Non 75:16 offhand 96:13 74:16 94:23 11:13,17 13:19 nonevent 110:19 office 66:15 74:9,10 opportune 17:15 particular 51:15 92:16,18 96:11,21 17:21 officer 7:6 74:20 107:25 111:15 particularly 6:18 102:7 105:22,23 nonreligious 38:4 113:21 opposite 69:8 partures 65:18 107:9 122:16 Normally 39:6 offices 1:17 opposite 69:8 party 41:5,8 79:7 11:15 126:3 127:8 northern 98:1 officially 68:7 optimize 63:13 101:18 126:14 Notary 1:16 126:3 127:8 oh 22:25 28:10 62:7 123:14 124:1,3,5 pay 40:11,21 41:3 44:19 46:11 47:19 note 64:16 86:19 91:6 109:1 124:20 125:1 68:1 94:17 48:10 49:5 62:21 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 55:13,15 pays 13:10 20:18 62:22 84:17 86:11 notice 93:17 94:7,8 25:8 26:4,5,6,22 organization 38:2,3					
61:15 120:3,11 night 5:19 6:3 83:2 95:5 opinion 29:5 68:17 particular 51:15 Myers 1:8 9:15 11:13,17 13:19 14:23 42:11 92:13 nonevent 110:19 office 66:15 74:9,10 opportune 17:15 particular 51:15 92:16,18 96:11,21 17:21 officer 7:6 74:20 11:9 127:2 opportunities 73:2 46:13 71:24 particularly 6:18 102:7 105:22,23 107:9 122:16 Normally 39:6 officer 7:6 74:20 107:25 111:15 particular 51:15 Normally 39:6 officer 7:6 74:20 107:25 111:15 particular 51:15 Normally 39:6 officer 7:6 74:20 107:25 111:15 particular 51:15 0pportunities 73:2 107:25 111:15 particular 51:15 0pposite 69:8 0					
Myers 1:8 9:15 Non 75:16 office 66:15 74:9,10 74:16 94:23 11:13,17 13:19 nonevent 110:19 11:9 127:2 opportune 17:15 particularly 6:18 92:16,18 96:11,21 17:21 nonreligious 38:4 17:21 officer 7:6 74:20 107:25 111:15 particularly 6:18 102:7 105:22,23 nonreligious 38:4 Normally 39:6 opposite 69:8 partner 82:10 Normally 39:6 92:20 officers 71:1 opposite 69:8 opposite 69:8 92:20 North 21:24 38:19 offices 1:17 opposite 69:8 opposite 69:8 North 21:24 38:19 offices 1:17 opposite 69:8 opposite 69:8 opposite 69:8 North 21:24 38:19 offices 7:11 opposite 69:8 opposite 69:8 opposite 69:8 North 21:24 38:19 offices 1:17 opposite 69:8 opposite 69:8 opposite 69:8 North 21:24 38:19 officially 68:7 opposite 69:8 opposite 69:8 opposite 69:8 Nail 29:24,25 nome 12:3 18:12,19 12:2 12:2 12:2 12:2 12:2 12:2 12:2 <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></t<>					
11:13,17 13:19		0		_	_
14:23 42:11 92:13 92:16,18 96:11,21 102:7 105:22,23 107:9 122:16 nonmonogamous 17:21 officer 7:6 74:20 107:25 111:15 opposite 69:8 oppression 21:25 optimize 63:13 Orbit 1:8 11:21 parties 65:18 partner 82:10 party 41:5,8 79:7 offices 1:17 officially 68:7 of	-				,
92:16,18 96:11,21 17:21 officer 7:6 74:20 107:25 111:15 parties 65:18 102:7 105:22,23 nonreligious 38:4 113:21 opposite 69:8 partner 82:10 107:9 122:16 92:20 officers 71:1 oppression 21:25 party 41:5,8 79:7 North 21:24 38:19 northern 98:1 officially 68:7 Orbit 1:8 11:21 password 122:8,11 name 12:3 18:12,19 127:8 oh 22:25 28:10 62:7 123:14 124:1,3,5 pay 40:11,21 41:3 18:21 44:6,8,9,11 note 64:16 86:19 91:6 109:1 124:20 125:1 68:1 94:17 48:10 49:5 62:21 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 55:13,15 pays 13:10 20:18 48:10 49:5 62:21 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 55:13,15 poganization 38:2,3	*				
102:7 105:22,23 nonreligious 38:4 113:21 opposite 69:8 partner 82:10 107:9 122:16 Normally 39:6 92:20 offices 1:17 optimize 63:13 partner 82:10 N 1:15 126:3 127:8 North 21:24 38:19 officially 68:7 Orbit 1:8 11:21 password 122:8,11 Noary 1:16 126:3 127:8 oftentimes 70:19,19 108:23 123:9,12 partner 82:10 18:21 44:6,8,9,11 Notary 1:16 126:3 127:8 oh 22:25 28:10 62:7 123:14 124:1,3,5 pay 40:11,21 41:3 48:10 49:5 62:21 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 order 9:19 18:20 pays 13:10 20:18 48:10 49:5 62:21 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 55:13,15 pc 50:17,19 62:22 84:17 86:11 notice 93:17 94:7,8 25:8 26:4,5,6,22 organization 38:2,3 penalty 4:22		_			
Normally 39:6 officers 71:1 oppression 21:25 party 41:5,8 79:7 N 1:15 126:3 127:8 North 21:24 38:19 officially 68:7 Orbit 1:8 11:21 password 122:8,11 nail 29:24,25 Notary 1:16 126:3 127:8 oftentimes 70:19,19 108:23 123:9,12 patron 40:14 18:21 44:6,8,9,11 14:19 46:11 47:19 note 64:16 86:19 91:6 109:1 124:20 125:1 pay 40:11,21 41:3 48:10 49:5 62:21 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 55:13,15 pC 50:17,19 62:22 84:17 86:11 notice 93:17 94:7,8 25:8 26:4,5,6,22 organization 38:2,3 penalty 4:5,8 79:7					_
N 92:20 offices 1:17 optimize 63:13 101:18 126:14 N 1:15 126:3 127:8 northern 98:1 officially 68:7 oftentimes 70:19,19 92:11 102:1 104:9 patron 40:14 name 12:3 18:12,19 127:8 oh 22:25 28:10 62:7 123:14 124:1,3,5 pay 40:11,21 41:3 18:21 44:6,8,9,11 44:19 46:11 47:19 notes 12:17,18,20 Ohio 1:2,16,18 3:6 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 order 9:19 18:20 pays 13:10 20:18 48:10 49:5 62:21 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 55:13,15 PC 50:17,19 62:22 84:17 86:11 notice 93:17 94:7,8 25:8 26:4,5,6,22 organization 38:2,3 penalty 4:22					
N North 21:24 38:19 officially 68:7 Orbit 1:8 11:21 password 122:8,11 N 1:15 126:3 127:8 northern 98:1 oftentimes 70:19,19 92:11 102:1 104:9 patron 40:14 name 12:3 18:12,19 127:8 oh 22:25 28:10 62:7 123:14 124:1,3,5 pay 40:11,21 41:3 18:21 44:6,8,9,11 44:19 46:11 47:19 notes 12:17,18,20 Ohio 1:2,16,18 3:6 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 order 9:19 18:20 pays 13:10 20:18 48:10 49:5 62:21 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 55:13,15 PC 50:17,19 62:22 84:17 86:11 notice 93:17 94:7,8 25:8 26:4,5,6,22 organization 38:2,3 penalty 4:22	107:9 122:16				
N 1:15 126:3 127:8 nail 29:24,25 name 12:3 18:12,19 18:21 44:6,8,9,11 44:19 46:11 47:19 48:10 49:5 62:21 62:22 84:17 86:11 northern 98:1 Notary 1:16 126:3 127:8 northern 98:1 112:2 oftentimes 70:19,19 112:2 oftentimes 70:19,19 112:2 oftentimes 70:19,19 112:2 oftentimes 70:19,19 112:2 0ho 22:25 28:10 62:7 86:19 91:6 109:1 12:20 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 25:8 26:4,5,6,22 Oftentimes 70:19,19 108:23 123:9,12 123:14 124:1,3,5 124:20 125:1 068:1 94:17 068:1 94:17 070:1 10 1:2 070:1 10 1:2 08:23 123:9,12 08:23 123:9,12 08:23 123:9,12 08:23 123:9,12 09:21 1 00:1 10 1:2 09:21 1 00:2 1 104:9 09:21 1 102:1				-	
nail 29:24,25 Notary 1:16 126:3 112:2 108:23 123:9,12 Paul 1:8 13:19 name 12:3 18:12,19 127:8 oh 22:25 28:10 62:7 123:14 124:1,3,5 pay 40:11,21 41:3 18:21 44:6,8,9,11 note 64:16 86:19 91:6 109:1 124:20 125:1 68:1 94:17 44:19 46:11 47:19 notes 12:17,18,20 Ohio 1:2,16,18 3:6 19:21 20:9,9,11 order 9:19 18:20 pays 13:10 20:18 48:10 49:5 62:21 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 55:13,15 PC 50:17,19 62:22 84:17 86:11 notice 93:17 94:7,8 25:8 26:4,5,6,22 organization 38:2,3 penalty 4:22					
name 12:3 18:12,19 127:8 oh 22:25 28:10 62:7 123:14 124:1,3,5 pay 40:11,21 41:3 18:21 44:6,8,9,11 note 64:16 86:19 91:6 109:1 124:20 125:1 68:1 94:17 44:19 46:11 47:19 notes 12:17,18,20 Ohio 1:2,16,18 3:6 order 9:19 18:20 pays 13:10 20:18 48:10 49:5 62:21 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 55:13,15 PC 50:17,19 62:22 84:17 86:11 notice 93:17 94:7,8 25:8 26:4,5,6,22 organization 38:2,3 penalty 4:22	N 1:15 126:3 127:8				_
18:21 44:6,8,9,11 note 64:16 86:19 91:6 109:1 124:20 125:1 68:1 94:17 44:19 46:11 47:19 notes 12:17,18,20 Ohio 1:2,16,18 3:6 order 9:19 18:20 pays 13:10 20:18 48:10 49:5 62:21 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 55:13,15 PC 50:17,19 62:22 84:17 86:11 notice 93:17 94:7,8 25:8 26:4,5,6,22 organization 38:2,3 penalty 4:22	nail 29:24,25	_			
44:19 46:11 47:19 notes 12:17,18,20 Ohio 1:2,16,18 3:6 order 9:19 18:20 pays 13:10 20:18 48:10 49:5 62:21 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 55:13,15 PC 50:17,19 62:22 84:17 86:11 notice 93:17 94:7,8 25:8 26:4,5,6,22 organization 38:2,3 penalty 4:22	name 12:3 18:12,19	127:8		123:14 124:1,3,5	
48:10 49:5 62:21 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 55:13,15 PC 50:17,19 62:22 84:17 86:11 notice 93:17 94:7,8 25:8 26:4,5,6,22 organization 38:2,3 penalty 4:22	18:21 44:6,8,9,11	note 64:16	86:19 91:6 109:1	124:20 125:1	68:1 94:17
48:10 49:5 62:21 12:22 23:3 26:8 19:21 20:9,9,11 55:13,15 PC 50:17,19 62:22 84:17 86:11 notice 93:17 94:7,8 25:8 26:4,5,6,22 organization 38:2,3 penalty 4:22	44:19 46:11 47:19	notes 12:17,18,20	Ohio 1:2,16,18 3:6	order 9:19 18:20	pays 13:10 20:18
62:22 84:17 86:11 notice 93:17 94:7,8 25:8 26:4,5,6,22 organization 38:2,3 penalty 4:22					
	62:22 84:17 86:11	notice 93:17 94:7,8			-
		· ·			
		l		•	_

Dr. Richard Carrier

22.5.11.15.20.15	1, . 145.01	1 25 12 41 15 16	1 11 47 7	02.22.06.21.07.10
22:5,11,15 30:15	physical 45:21	post 35:13 41:15,16	probable 47:7	93:22 96:21 97:10
31:12 33:14 35:24	pick 20:1,6 59:13	41:19 57:23 58:8	probably 5:12 13:3	publications 8:11
38:5 45:14 49:15	picture 94:20	58:14 64:24 84:7	13:6 21:3 22:24	76:23 77:9,11
50:1,10,12,16	pin 41:21	88:15 96:17,19	23:2 31:23 55:16	87:2 93:7
51:2,18,24 57:10	pinning 120:11	109:11	58:23 63:20 87:16	publicity 111:10
57:17 59:14,14,17	place 12:4 19:11	post-op 8:23	87:17 94:22 95:20	publicize 108:24
59:19,20 60:15	20:6 21:3 97:16	posted 35:12,14	104:12	publicized 45:23
69:4,18,21 71:19	97:21	58:6 121:21	problem 82:13	108:13
72:12,22 73:21	places 7:10 14:5,14	123:21	86:23,25	publish 122:12,20
74:7 75:19 76:3,8	19:14	posting 94:6 122:2	problematic 22:10	123:7
			22:12 31:13	published 8:3,4 64:5
76:13 77:2,15	plagiarism 123:21	posts 110:20,22		
96:7 103:11,20	plagiarized 123:22	potential 93:1	problems 74:14	64:9,13 75:25
109:24 112:3,10	plagiarizing 124:4	103:21	112:1	76:17,24 88:19
120:10 123:15,25	plaintiff 1:6,13 3:2	pounds 112:24	Procedure 1:15	90:7 102:5 105:19
percent 37:3 47:11	4:2 65:21	practical 115:10	proceeding 5:2	109:4 111:21
perception 11:10	plaintiffs 9:10	practice 55:24 56:2	process 42:12 122:2	113:13 123:19
perfect 23:3	plan 72:24 76:14	pre 96:17	123:11,17	124:21
period 68:4 77:19	planet 121:4,9	precautions 52:6	produce 94:25 95:9	pull 41:15,18
perjury 4:23 5:25	planned 76:8 108:6	preceding 95:11	95:20	purchase 95:21
27:3	planner 23:4	precise 25:14 38:21	professional 23:17	pursuant 1:14
permission 35:24	planning 72:10 76:8	74:19	104:24 111:24	pursue 51:16
perplexing 85:20	76:9 77:15	precisely 39:13	professionally 60:15	pursuing 11:9
			106:3	pursuing 11:9 pushing 60:21
Perry 1:17 2:3,5 3:3	platform 31:20	precision 39:13		
3:4 23:8,25 24:15	52:16	prediction 68:18	professor 8:21	put 12:22 15:11
28:16,22,25 60:19	play 24:4 88:21	preliminary 4:8	program 7:21 8:16	24:4 37:10 41:21
65:5,11 88:10	playing 59:5	prepublication	prohibiting 15:23	60:1 64:20 90:20
98:9,11 102:20	pleasant 10:3	93:24	15:25	95:13,14 120:18
104:15,22 106:14	please 86:17 95:21	presence 126:11	project 9:3	122:8
110:12 115:15	plus 38:13	present 45:14	projects 111:3,4	PZ 9:15 13:19,20
118:16 123:5	point 11:12 17:16	presently 35:2	prominent 47:1	96:11
124:16 125:4,10	26:19 35:9 41:20	president 74:5,23	103:7	
person 28:7,9 32:11	45:15 52:11 58:23	prestige 111:10	promote 107:23	Q
32:12 44:7,21	63:25 95:15 97:7	Pretend 24:8	promotion 107:25	qualified 126:5
56:10 57:22 74:8	112:14	pretty 21:10 43:9	promotional 40:24	Quest 38:1,1,2,3,12
78:1 82:17 86:12	pointing 31:10	55:13 90:5 121:25	111:3	38:15 46:22 74:4
86:19 90:17	points 110:10	121:25		84:8,13 91:16
			prongs 107:24	,
personal 51:11	police 78:1	prevent 56:17	pronounce 89:2	94:7,8 106:16,22
99:20,25 100:3,8	policies 16:3	prevented 108:10	proposition 79:10	107:1,12 109:10
100:11,18 101:6	policy 16:4,5,10	previous 26:6 61:11	79:19 80:5	109:14,15 111:2,7
101:12,20 113:1	41:9 42:3 43:4,8	103:13 106:24,24	propositioned 81:16	111:12 118:22,25
personality 23:18	71:2 87:13,13	107:14	81:18	question 24:11,12
personally 92:13	96:5,6,8 97:18	previously 63:24	protocol 123:7,9	28:8,19 30:3
105:17,24 106:2	99:4 100:13,16	76:1	prove 46:5	36:23 37:7 39:6
persons 73:9	119:4,5,7,9,10,11	pricing 116:1	provide 77:13,14	47:5,12 51:5 53:4
pets 26:17	politics 9:24	Primary 20:2	provided 25:17 65:9	66:10 67:3,11
Ph.D 1:8 6:14 7:21	poly 17:20	printed 64:7,10	providers 123:13	69:25 70:8,16
8:15 10:5	poorly 98:13	prior 14:16 25:25	provides 31:22	78:7,16,24 79:17
philosopher 7:25	popular 25:3	26:1,2,25 28:14	pub 41:5,8 45:12	93:13 98:13,14
118:10,14	porn 88:23	73:23 88:9 93:11	85:5	117:19
philosophy 6:14,18	ported 7:18	106:8		questioned 112:2
	_		public 1:16 23:16,18	
phone 42:15,18	pose 115:5	privacy 18:20 51:7	24:14 27:10 50:5	questions 4:8 10:22
54:12 82:16 85:24	position 8:19 36:1	95:19	56:17 58:20 87:10	15:12 31:24 99:10
92:13 96:10,16,19	74:2	private 12:14 56:14	114:11 126:3	101:5 104:23
102:8	positioned 20:10	72:20 82:22	127:8	115:16 123:3
phonetic 80:15	possible 33:2 46:24	privilege 28:9 88:8	publication 35:10	124:16
82:20	55:6 101:22	privy 73:12,14	40:9 61:6 64:6	Quests 38:22
Phyikos 7:24	possibly 22:11 34:6	probability 47:10	76:21 77:6 87:6	quite 8:10,13 27:10
	I T	l ·	I	I '
·				

35:23 68:22 69:23	121:12	30:20 56:9 95:10	50:23 51:6 53:7	retract 97:12 114:8
79:17 109:23	reading 30:22 32:11	95:10 96:16	54:15,20,25 55:20	114:10
119:2	43:19 48:8 78:6	RECROSS-EXA	55:22 56:25 57:23	retraction 114:5
		123:4		
quote 100:1 125:10	78:25 79:13 80:8		58:7,13 62:10	return 70:10,11
quotes 48:17 49:2,3	ready 28:13 108:2	recusing 74:24	66:6 67:17 68:23	returned 113:24
62:21,21	realize 27:1	REDIRECT 115:17	75:2 86:11 88:20	reveals 60:3
quoting 41:6	realized 76:14 99:2	124:18	99:8 105:3 106:17	reverse 26:13
R	really 10:5 20:5	reduced 126:10,12	109:2,7	review 8:10,14
	21:7,22 29:25	refer 18:23 44:20	remembering 68:3	115:13
rabbit 85:20	45:6,7,9,10 46:19	63:22	renew 45:18	revisit 113:11
raised 79:8	56:11 76:22,24	reference 116:5,10	repeat 120:2	revisited 19:1
Randazza 2:2,4,6	85:20 95:2	116:11 117:2	rephrase 93:13	RichadCarrier.info
3:8,9 4:6 18:14,17	reason 4:9 5:17,24	referenced 97:1	98:14	60:24
23:11 24:3,13,18	6:3 33:23 51:9,13	referring 12:23	replied 114:15	Richard 1:5,12 4:1
28:17,20 29:2	51:15,17 52:14	102:13	reply 69:20 114:21	46:11 47:19 48:17
41:15,17 44:13,16	55:11 64:4,8 81:4	reflect 52:23 53:23	114:23 115:1	49:8,13,21,22,23
60:20,23 65:7,14	108:24 109:2,5,24	54:3,7 94:20	report 29:12	49:25 50:11 62:2
65:17,25 77:18,21	110:1 123:14	refresh 43:21	reported 47:18	62:10,15 126:7
84:2,6 88:13	reasonable 94:20	refused 42:16 69:16	98:18,19 101:11	Richard.Carrier
90:24 95:4,7,23	117:11	regard 22:10	REPORTER 125:5	53:1
98:2 102:16	ReAsoncon 103:14	regarding 90:8 91:9	125:9	RichardCarrier.i
104:14,18,23	reasons 20:2 33:24	registered 62:14	reporting 126:16	61:5
106:13 110:8	51:12 53:20 56:22	registry 62:9	representing 72:23	rid 55:14 56:23
115:18 118:15,17	rebuild 31:12	regular 12:23	101:1 102:1	123:2,22
123:3 124:19	rebuilding 31:8	regularly 46:11	reputation 111:25	right 4:7,13 5:16 6:8
125:3,7	recall 10:12 11:25	47:18	112:8	9:8 15:6,8,10
ranked 50:1,3	12:7 16:8,20	reignite 17:15	request 69:16,20	21:14 27:22 32:6
ranking 50:14	32:14 41:6 43:20	rejected 36:16	70:24	32:9 37:9,22
ranks 50:10	48:22 49:6 50:25	related 6:19 7:16	requests 27:7 70:17	54:16 61:2,5
rape 78:11,12	54:16 55:7,8 57:5	49:17 57:23 75:16	71:17 72:6	73:20 74:1 77:4
rarely 91:20	57:6 58:25 60:11	103:5	required 115:11	81:14,15 98:2,21
rates 7:4	61:1,7 62:16,20	relation 71:11	research 8:23,24	101:19 102:24
RCarrier@infedel	62:23 64:11 67:21	relations 14:18 16:6	9:25 10:1 32:16	107:18 108:9
53:22	69:10,17 70:12	16:17 19:4	58:5 111:10	112:19 113:15
reach 102:4 104:9	74:23 75:13 76:4	relationship 9:9	researched 34:22	114:3,16,20 118:5
104:11	76:7 78:20,21	10:15 15:18,24	researching 49:13	risk 93:20
reaches 102:17	81:6,8 84:1 86:5,7	16:1 17:5,7,11,12	99:1	role 24:4 83:7
reaction 45:16	88:19 90:3,8	17:15 19:3 82:1,5	reside 13:17	104:17
read 8:14 23:13	96:10	82:13 90:16 91:3	residence 19:16	Roman 6:18 8:1
29:8 32:6 34:2	receipts 70:10,11	relationships 59:15	27:4	romantic 10:3
41:19 43:25 46:2	receive 29:14 70:24	104:24 107:21	resolved 95:9	Ron 24:6
46:3,6 47:10,13	received 6:20 7:14	113:1	respect 89:20	room 82:19
	93:4 113:17,19,23	relative 99:11	102:10	Rule 126:17
47:24,25 48:2,4		104:24 126:13		
53:13 58:8 63:8	114:7,19		respond 21:16 113:10	Rules 1:14
63:25 70:9 79:22	receiving 93:11	relaunch 31:7		run 13:13 70:22
80:13 81:10 99:8	recess 84:5	relaying 73:8	response 15:13	111:8 112:1
104:5 117:15,25	recollection 43:22	releasing 42:18	35:20 93:8	running 125:1
120:1	75:4	reliably 69:3	restriction 87:20	runs 74:4 125:2
reader 51:23	record 18:13,14,18	religion 6:18	restroom 65:22	rural 22:13
reader's 51:7	44:10,13,17,21	religious 21:17,18	result 23:13 48:13	<u> </u>
readers 8:22 30:11	57:15,24 58:20	21:25 22:14	resulted 46:15,17	
102:18 104:12	60:2 61:9 65:4,4	remember 9:17,19	94:6 111:9	S 3:11 7:25
119:13 120:7,12	65:14,18,22 84:2	11:17 12:1,3,5,11	resulting 9:3	Sacramento 38:19
120:13,23	90:20 92:18 95:4	12:13,15 14:13	results 31:10 48:16	safe 34:25
readership 30:8,17	95:7,13,15	15:22 18:7 25:14	49:24 63:13	sake 64:2
30:23 31:15 34:11	recorded 50:9	29:23 38:20,25	110:18	salaried 84:11
34:20 35:1 104:7	records 25:7 27:8	43:23 44:6 45:5	retired 45:12 53:22	sales 25:20 40:24
	I	I	I	Į.

Dr. Richard Carrier

	I	I .	I	I
102:19	seen 4:17 46:23,25	signal 4:11	43:15 48:10	spreadsheets 25:19
San 7:13	59:10 70:18 92:4	signed 27:5	sonar 7:5,16	25:22
saw 4:19 10:5 14:14	94:9,11 117:8	significant 115:8	soon 75:25 76:14,17	Springfield 12:8
46:23 47:7,16	118:15	Similar 101:5	92:18	spying 33:14,16
92:3 94:7,8	Self 49:1	simply 95:16	sort 45:11 71:13	51:14 82:3,10
110:19	self-employed 10:6	single 32:10,12,13	75:6 78:13	SS 126:2
saying 6:2 20:15	sell 76:12 107:22	48:12,14 52:24	source 102:11	SSA 42:4 67:14,15
26:25 51:22 66:22	108:1	101:11	sources 37:23	68:4,6,21,22
113:19	semen 88:21	Sir 84:7	soured 8:20 9:21	69:11,12 70:2
says 28:10 34:2 57:8	send 54:12 69:19	site 32:15,22,25	south 39:5	71:9,12,21 72:11
109:12 118:12,14	70:17 125:10	33:6,18 34:2	southern 1:2 22:20	72:24 73:5,9 74:2
scenario 34:7	senior 124:11	38:19 50:16	spanning 23:14	74:3,5,6,8,19,20
scenes 10:3	sense 42:6	124:15	speak 40:18 42:4	74:24 75:16,18
scholarship 112:2	sensitive 95:21	sites 50:2	67:24 69:5,12	80:23 81:1 83:1
school 14:10 118:9	sensor 124:12,14			
		sitting 32:9 34:21	103:24 106:4	84:8 85:21,23
Schrike 82:20	sent 28:6 49:11 72:6	35:8 43:10,21	107:22 108:20	86:3,13 87:5
science 6:18 111:8	92:24 93:14	situation 5:14,25	109:25	91:16 96:4,6
SCO 63:10	113:20 114:2	82:9,12	speaker 91:18	97:18 98:22,25
screen 57:16	separate 53:2,20	situations 5:10	speakers 9:14 41:2	99:3,3 105:8,14
script 118:19	separated 26:20	six 12:10,10 101:9	41:24 42:3,4,4	105:25 106:10
se 60:16	served 7:17 113:14	112:24,24	87:4,9 96:7	109:17,23 119:10
sea 7:17	service 7:6	six-year 9:3	speaking 24:25	St 14:17
seal 127:2	services 24:24	size 102:12 103:12	25:19 37:23 40:24	stabbing 10:2
search 31:10 46:14	set 127:1	sizeable 104:9	46:13,13,20 47:2	staff 86:12
48:16 49:21,23	seven 11:16	Skepticon 1:8 9:11	47:21 48:12 72:7	stamina 83:6,20
50:4,6,9,12 61:18	sex 10:23 15:2,4	9:11,15,19 10:8	83:17 102:11	stand 23:19 72:3
61:19 63:13	18:8,12,19 79:7	10:25 11:13,22	108:1	standard 121:13,16
searched 48:17,20	79:19 80:5,22,25	12:2 15:20,21,22	specializing 6:15	Star 45:8
49:22 62:20	81:16 89:8	16:13,24 18:6,9	specific 7:22 10:20	start 6:9 17:22 31:3
searching 46:11	sexual 14:18 15:6	40:8,16,21,22,25	10:21 12:25 24:1	76:21 79:6 104:2
47:18,19,20 48:10	16:5 19:4 37:4	41:1,2 58:6 76:23	24:12 44:4 67:4,5	111:19
49:5,15 94:4,6	40:9 41:10 77:23	92:23,24 93:4,10	69:10 76:19 77:1	started 17:8,21 26:5
110:16	78:8,11,12 79:21	93:14,25 94:2	86:2 92:6 99:13	43:18 49:12,12
second 68:15 69:9	80:7 83:6,20 91:7	100:13,17 101:1	99:19 100:7	97:2 99:1,1
98:12 104:12	97:21,23 99:14,17	103:9 104:16	117:19	107:18,20 109:11
108:7	99:24,25 100:12	113:20,21,21	specifically 30:4	112:25
Secondly 56:10	100:16 112:3	114:15 115:1	39:25 46:12 47:20	Starting 69:7
secrets 56:14	sexualize 79:9 80:4	119:4,5,6,8,9	48:11 69:25 74:23	starts 50:14
secular 22:4 30:14	sexualized 79:1,18	Skepticon's 40:9	91:22 94:10	state 1:16 22:14,14
41:23 53:23 66:2	sexualizing 78:21	Skepticons 12:9	104:13 109:8,17	25:3,8,12,12
66:11,21,25 67:6	80:2	13:1	specifics 85:22	27:12 28:2 111:18
67:9 75:16 84:22	sexually 35:17	Skiba 1:9 35:12	specify 82:7	115:5 126:1,4
84:25 85:1 89:17	shaming 78:15	81:11 86:1,15,18	speculating 21:21	127:8
103:5 104:6,7,13	share 51:24	sleep 6:3	116:6 117:7	stated 64:6
105:1 109:9 111:2	shared 74:9	slightly 31:23	speculation 117:5	statement 23:19
seculars 38:6	Shelley 90:11,14,18	slut 78:15	117:10 118:3,7	28:23 41:4,12
security 7:12 32:23	Sherman 7:18	small 22:15	Spencer 83:4	43:25 61:1 95:24
56:18	shit 76:18	smaller 103:17	split 27:25	statements 26:25
see 10:21 17:14	short 77:19	social 56:18 112:6	spoke 9:11 16:12	34:16 35:14 39:23
23:23 32:24 33:17	show 58:14,24 59:13	solely 104:7	44:24,25 45:1,2,3	40:1 43:19,25
	· ·	•		· ·
34:10 46:22 48:12	showed 59:11	solve 82:13	81:25 82:21 107:2	49:12 68:16 94:15
49:3 50:6,14	shown 28:5 59:2	somebody 18:19	spoken 12:9 25:3	94:19,20 97:16
59:17 60:10 61:11	shows 107:19	43:14 48:4 56:3	26:6 68:11 97:14	99:12,19 102:5
80:10 110:20	shut 123:1	84:24 85:14 95:25	105:13	105:7,18 106:20
118:11	sic 9:10	117:24 122:21	sponsored 13:14	106:24 107:6,15
seeing 46:15	side 20:20 101:2,24	124:12	41:9 67:10	108:10 109:4
seek 20:25 29:18	102:2	someone's 41:10	sponsors 13:9	111:14,24 113:13
			*	,
<u></u>				

Dr. Richard Carrier

114010400	51.0	77.200.205.5	la	1,50
114:8 124:20	51:3	77:2 80:3 85:5	theoretically 55:6	threaten 115:2
states 1:1 6:23	suit 92:12 115:4	91:23 105:15	theory 45:7 47:8	threats 123:20
21:18,18,24 22:7	Suite 1:18 3:5	116:13	thesis 7:23	three 9:6 25:24 26:2
22:20 23:16 25:11	summer 38:4,5	talking 11:15 19:15	thin 36:2	39:2 107:24
34:10 38:7 39:8	super 95:1	24:23 27:19 37:12	thing 4:18 29:24	throw 24:13
49:8 66:18 72:23	supplement 77:18	41:5 43:16 45:10	48:14 53:17 63:25	thumb 25:2
116:2	94:14	45:13,20 51:12	75:6 76:25 80:1,3	ticket 76:11
stationed 7:9	supplied 25:15	58:19 60:13 63:18	92:3 94:10 98:4	time 8:21 10:4 11:9
statistics 119:17	support 38:3 40:14	67:1 72:8 75:21	99:5 100:19,22	14:10 16:12,18
120:21	66:18 123:1	81:13 83:5 85:18	101:21 109:12,17	17:1,6 26:9 30:18
status 7:1	supports 38:4,8	86:2,18 98:20	117:1 124:3	30:22 32:14 40:6
stay 5:7 86:23	sure 5:7,14 7:23	101:10 121:8,10	things 8:9 12:25	45:10 52:13 54:20
stayed 7:11 12:24	10:10 11:22 12:10	121:12	13:2 17:13 26:18	55:18,19 56:24
staying 82:20	14:4,15 17:8	talks 9:18	27:1,8 32:19	57:1 58:9 59:4,7
stenographically	21:22 23:8 24:21	target 109:8	35:21 37:9 40:6	66:5 68:4 74:4,9
126:11	26:14,21 30:13	taught 15:13	44:2 45:10 47:17	74:24,25 77:19
Stephanie 1:8 11:18	34:14 38:10 43:9	tax 25:18 27:19,23	47:22 49:4 54:1	81:13 84:23 86:13
13:25 40:5		taxes 27:12,25		95:2 98:21,22
	53:4 61:13 63:14	· · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · · ·	54:14 56:12,13,17	
Steubenville 39:15	67:21 71:8 77:7	teach 15:15	64:12 66:19,24	105:6 106:20,23
stick 25:2	78:24 80:8 89:20	teacher 23:17	67:8 80:1,19	107:14 108:13
stigma 111:13	90:21 105:23	teaching 9:25 10:1	81:23 82:4 92:2	110:2,5,7 111:16
stipulate 24:17	109:1 120:5	102:11	94:9,15 100:3,6	112:1 113:10
64:23 65:10,19	surprised 85:12	technician 7:5	109:25 110:17	115:14
Stockton 19:18,19	surprisingly 8:9	technologies 7:17	124:2	times 16:20,21,24
stop 17:11 43:2	surrounded 22:10	technology 6:19	think 8:14 10:10	30:7 55:12,16,23
stopped 60:13 75:24	survivable 20:22	tell 5:9 6:8 7:21 8:7	11:15,22 12:10	61:15 68:23 69:2
storage 87:22	survive 20:8	9:22 28:7 31:18	13:18,24 14:14,17	81:6,8 107:3
story 98:16 99:7	suspect 34:4	32:5,7 33:4,5 35:9	17:13 23:23 24:15	120:11
•	_			
100:24 101:24	suspected 111:17	36:25 37:22 42:16	27:3,6 32:18 34:7	title 8:2 89:23 98:21
102:2	suspend 39:22 40:7	42:19 45:4 49:18	34:9 45:13 50:18	today 5:18 34:19
stress 112:17,22	suspended 39:19	59:24 64:3 69:22	52:3 55:21 57:16	35:8 43:11,21
stripped 11:5	40:1,15	70:6 75:12 89:2,4	57:22 58:16 59:15	55:2 108:12
strongest 34:20	suspending 111:2	90:16 92:20	60:3 62:8,9 64:3	told 17:11 39:14
35:10	suspicious 32:17	102:15 103:7	64:14 65:2,11	42:18,20,24 47:14
structure 71:1	swinger 17:19	107:15 111:23	67:20,22 75:17	59:23 68:20 70:1
Student 41:24 66:2	swoon 24:9	113:3,4 120:14	76:22 77:9,19	73:6,18 74:11,20
66:11,21 67:1,6,9	sword 112:11	122:2	78:8 82:20 85:3	82:8 86:9,10,12
84:22,25 85:1	sworn 4:3 126:7	telling 75:4 92:21	85:15 90:6 91:23	87:12 92:13 96:11
105:1 109:9 111:2	system 54:4	ten 6:1 11:16 37:21		101:14
			92:3 96:13 99:4	
students 80:23 81:1	systems 54:5	50:7,8 63:23 76:5	104:11 108:17	tolerance 87:13
96:1,5		76:6 103:4 112:24	109:23 111:1	tons 113:7
stuff 26:16 56:19	T	Tennessee 22:25	112:19 114:1,14	top 12:15 50:12
94:5	T 3:4	term 49:21 75:9,10	115:15 116:19,22	torpedoes 7:16
subcategory 37:11	table 5:12 24:14	78:5	117:1 120:19	torture 4:21
subject 8:24 41:11	tacks 25:2	terms 17:9 21:16	123:12	touched 35:22
45:9 83:6,12	take 5:18 23:6 52:6	22:13 26:11 36:19	thinking 17:22	touching 35:18,24
submitted 49:17	116:22,24 118:8	72:17 104:20	third 7:6 101:18	tours 7:20
65:20 88:25	122:18	112:9 113:8	Thoroughly 89:24	track 30:25 32:10
subsequent 16:24	taken 1:15 4:14 6:1	terrible 24:10	thought 10:4 56:6	67:11
27:6	87:4,8	testified 111:1	74:14 97:3 98:25	tracking 51:3
substantially 25:12	takes 41:2			
		testify 126:8	thousand 30:9,24	tracks 31:25 32:1
successful 72:3	talk 9:9,11,17,18	testimony 73:18	102:18 103:1,10	training 4:19 6:20
suddenly 79:6	77:3 80:22,25	126:10	119:13,21,23,24	7:13,16 62:24
sue 43:1 97:13	104:1 120:22	Texas 16:25	119:25	63:1,5,6,10,11
sued 93:9	121:11	text 54:13 64:22	thousands 30:14	transcript 125:6
suffer 109:15	talked 24:24 43:13	123:22	120:10	transparent 64:18
suggested 45:16	58:15 65:11 71:16	thank 15:12 53:11	threat 109:13 112:9	transpire 76:15,16
	l	l	l	1

Dr. Richard Carrier

				1496 15
	10040010		262120122021	WHEDEOE 107.1
Tremendously	18:24 23:1,2	variety 13:12 20:2	26:21 28:13,20,24	WHEREOF 127:1
115:7	24:11 37:5 39:25	70:22 103:16	33:2 35:13 37:18	whispered 83:11
trends 63:5 68:18	47:5 51:5 53:4	various 7:10 13:2	41:20 44:1,5	white 36:6
tried 21:2 22:9,16	59:4 66:10,22	14:5 19:14 45:9	50:13 56:14,17	widely 29:21 30:5,6
22:19 24:25 32:10	70:8 78:24	45:14 72:24	60:1,20 77:18	wife 17:7,24 26:11
42:10 62:5,7	understanding 16:2	vary 70:25	98:6 99:10,12	Wikipedia 9:20
68:19	40:20	vasectomy 83:1,8	108:13 109:14	wind 5:6
trilogy 45:8	understood 17:25	Vegas 3:11	112:5,10 125:9	wishes 86:25
trip 15:22	60:22	Venn 37:14,19	wanted 8:24 17:25	witness 24:1 28:19
Trucking 49:14,21	underway 111:16	venue 12:1	18:5 81:25 82:5	28:23 29:1 41:16
49:25	111:17	venues 12:13,14,15	87:12 109:22,24	60:22 65:6,13
true 41:23 44:2	unethical 51:14,23	13:4	110:1 124:1	88:12 98:4 102:17
61:12 64:4,24	unfortunately 108:8	verb 37:6 81:14	wanting 89:8	104:19 110:9
·				
88:15 101:11	unique 23:18	verify 95:16	wants 79:11 86:23	126:11 127:1
118:22 119:4	119:18,21,25	version 61:4 98:16	112:3	woman 44:18 85:7
truth 56:11 99:13	120:23 121:13	100:24 101:2	Wars 45:8	89:1 90:11
99:16 126:8,8,9	uniques 120:4	versions 61:11	wasn't 11:9 17:8	women 37:18 81:22
try 18:1 72:14 73:1	United 1:1 6:23	versus 49:16,22	18:3 36:4,5 42:11	83:22 112:9
112:6,12	23:16 49:8 66:18	vet 26:17	48:6,10 76:14,16	won 116:17
trying 15:21 17:15	72:22	vicinity 30:9,23 57:4	82:2 83:13 85:9	word 21:13,14
20:6 23:23 24:9	units 7:14	103:10 120:8	97:23 99:2	117:20
81:22 120:19	universities 46:14	Vicodin 6:1	waste 108:5	worded 98:13
Tuesday 1:18	66:17	victims 100:1	watching 110:18	wording 80:21
turn 22:6 48:16	university 6:13 12:5	video 4:19	water 23:7	WordPress 31:21
98:2	46:21 47:3,21	violate 18:20 96:8	water 23.7 way 3:11 11:3 21:7	119:17 121:15
	53:11 98:1 110:21	100:12	24:4,10 33:8	words 24:16 41:13
turned 85:9,11				
98:24	110:23	violated 119:3,5,7,8	42:12 46:24 48:20	41:14 78:25 80:8
turnouts 22:22	unquote 100:1	119:10	48:21 51:21 52:2	80:14,16
turns 14:2	unusual 44:11	violates 33:21	52:3,4 57:15 62:7	work 9:24 20:5,12
tutorials 63:8	unwelcomed 79:20	Violating 100:16	98:7 100:2,10,18	20:23 21:6,7,9
TV 4:17,18	80:6	violation 97:18	101:12 124:13	22:2 31:18 52:4
twelve 7:14	upwards 40:23	Violence 88:23	ways 23:24	74:7 103:25
twenty 76:5 103:5	URL 61:16,20	violent 123:20	we've 18:20 24:15	107:23 112:12
Twitter 30:12,13	use 18:21 22:8	visible 45:16	40:2 63:24 114:14	worked 40:22 74:10
35:6 45:24	33:15 50:17 52:12	visited 14:13 38:11	web 53:13,23 61:12	74:19 124:24,25
two 6:25 8:4 16:23	52:15,16 53:20,25	38:12 52:13	63:9 70:20	working 7:12 72:14
16:24 27:1,5 37:8	54:4,19 61:19,20	visitors 119:25	website 32:2 33:19	72:16 73:1 109:13
38:14 45:13 54:5	63:7 70:6,10,11	120:2,23 121:13	39:7 48:11 51:4	worldwide 102:23
55:17 58:23 60:11	94:18 95:17	vocal 17:18	61:13 104:13	worry 51:2,18,22
62:10,14 80:2	username 122:8,10	volunteer 91:20	120:1,11	52:2 113:7,8
97:6 103:7 111:5	usual 120:22	voter 62:9	websites 121:11	worse 80:2
two-factor 54:9,14	usually 8:15 55:11	voter 62:14	Wehneman 60:5	worst 80:2
		VOLETS 62:14 VPN 52:10,13	weird 4:9 15:12 34:1	
typewriting 126:12	64:17,19,20 69:6			would've 63:25
typo 64:19	69:18,22 71:4	VPNs 52:11,15	120:10	wouldn't 5:12 8:12
	103:16 111:18	vs 1:6	welcome 73:4,19	32:7 33:21 34:4,6
U U	112:13		74:11,12,21 75:5	37:21 39:20 62:6
UC 6:10	Utah 67:22,23 68:8	W	75:12 82:14	73:4 115:21
Um-hmm 13:11	68:11	wait 28:11 79:22	well-known 23:15	Wow 11:17
37:25 57:9 78:10	utter 28:10	106:23 109:1	went 6:12 7:13 8:21	Wqueana 1:15
unaffiliated 74:8		waive 125:4	45:19 50:8 66:7	126:3 127:8
unasked 11:6	V	walk 24:19	67:23 76:23 85:21	write 12:16 57:12
unaware 43:8	vague 69:21	wall 46:22,23 47:17	weren't 48:8 73:19	79:25 112:6
uncomfortable	valid 33:23 34:8	47:19,23,25 48:3	74:21 75:5,12	122:12
86:16	51:13,17	48:5,9,14 92:2	West 38:13	writer 10:6 23:17
undeliverable	value 40:24 56:11	110:16	Western 98:1	writing 8:13 31:3
113:25	variable 21:15	want 5:7 17:12,14	whatnot 8:8 10:2	45:19 61:1 102:10
understand 5:8	varies 103:4	17:24 18:12 25:1	whereabouts 94:21	126:10
anucistanu J.o	varies 103.T	17.2-7 10.12 23.1	whereabouts 94.21	120.10
I	•	•	•	•

				Page 14
	<u> </u>		1	
writings 88:14	Zvan's 57:7	22:16-CV-00906		
written 78:14 97:16	-	1:6		
wrong 21:13 61:2	0	23 1:19		
98:21	03-05-2020 127:9	23-1 91:14		
wrongful 100:8		27 89:1		
wrote 40:6 79:3,15	1	28(D) 126:17		
84:7 88:15 98:20	1 9:12,15 10:8 11:13			
98:22 109:2,3	12:2 64:2,23	3		
110:7	79:24	3- 103:16		
Wyoming 21:3	1,000 40:23	300 103:17		
vv yoming 21.3	1.4 104:8	31 27:4		
X	10 64:3 79:24	315 8:1		
	10,000 30:11	36 95:11,11		
Y	10:50 1:19	30 73.11,11		
Y 7:25	100 8:1	4		
yeah 7:4 8:4 11:16	115 2:4	4 2:2		
12:21 13:18 15:6	12/1/2016 64:7	400,000 104:12		
17:20 19:2 20:16	12/1/2010 04.7 120 1:18 3:5	4035 3:11		
25:11 33:18 38:17	120 1.16 3.3 124 2:5	43017 3:6		
48:25 49:4 51:10	124 2.3 125 2:6	44 58:3		
56:21 58:13 62:16	125 2:0 150 21:4	44 58.5 45 57:8		
63:3 65:1,6,13	150 21:4 15th 91:9	45 37.8 47 79:23		
	15111 91.9	47 19.23		
81:4,15 85:10	2	5		
86:24 87:16 89:9				
94:16,22 102:17	2- 103:17	5 80:15		
103:22 106:23	2:56 125:12	5- 30:11		
109:20 112:22	20 76:22	500 40:23		
117:21 118:16	20,000 88:1	5th 64:6 79:23		
122:23 124:7	200- 104:11	6		
year 7:17 10:25	2005 38:13,16			
11:23 12:14,14	2008 8:17 11:1	6 18:6		
14:12,13 17:3	2009 118:22,23	600 103:16		
19:24 25:7 26:1	2011 11:3	6th 127:2		
27:20,24 29:10	2012 10:25 11:2,6	7		
31:11 38:14,17	15:20 16:5			
57:2,3 68:24	2013 16:14 17:4	7- 21:2		
102:19 103:3,4,13	18:5	7240 1:17 3:5		
years 6:25 10:14,19	2014 26:8	8		
11:16,25 16:4	2015 16:16 25:6			
19:3,15 25:24	26:6,20 64:7 69:7	80,000 120:13		
26:2,6,7 55:17	79:23 80:15 87:3	800 21:2		
58:22,23 69:19	88:6 102:19	89147 3:11		
88:20 103:13	107:19 108:2	9		
105:3,23,24	2016 19:25 26:23,24			
yell 122:22	27:13,14,18,20,24	90,000 120:12		
younger 96:1	29:12 35:12 68:14	98 2:3		
YouTube 9:20	68:15,21 69:8,9			
Yup 61:3 88:24	71:18 72:9,10			
	105:4,18 106:8,18			
Z	106:25 108:3,7,7			
Z 1:8	2017 27:22,25 29:12			
zero 27:16 28:2	67:20,21 68:13			
87:13	69:14			
Zvan 1:8 11:18	2018 1:19 67:19			
13:25 40:6 41:4	127:3			
92:11 101:6,23	21st 92:17			
105:23 107:7	22 79:23			
	l	l l	ļ	